

October 3, 2016



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on October 3, 2016 with a briefing at 10:15 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:05 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Michael Amonett
Clint Bowers
*Sam Childers
Mattia Flabiano
Dustin Gadberry

John Johnson
Cris Jordan
Adam McGill
*Evelyn Montgomery
Daron Tapscott

Emily Williams
Katherine Seale, Chair
Sean Tate
*Diane Sherman

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **Paul Ridley**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **Paul Ridley**

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **Mike Birrer**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: **Mike Birrer**

The following Position is vacant: District 3, 4 and District 12

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty
Jennifer Anderson

Marsha Prior
Eric Hill
Liz Casso

Laura Morrison
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to move Consent Item C8 & C9 to the Discussion agenda.

Maker: *Montgomery
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C1 through C7, C12 through C16 following staff recommendation with an amendment to the condition for C13.

Maker: *Montgomery
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

Motion was made to approve C10 following staff recommendation.

***Commissioner Johnson recused himself and did not hear or vote on this matter.**

Maker: *Montgomery
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Johnson
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

Motion was made to approve C11 following staff recommendation.

***Commissioner *Sherman recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.**

Maker: *Montgomery
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, *Sherman
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take C9, D2, D3, D6, D7, D9 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda ending with C8.

Maker: *Montgomery
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

CONSENT ITEMS:

1. 5803 Swiss Avenue

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CE156-020(PT)

Pam Thompson

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on the added value of the land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of approximately \$146,679.66 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval.

2. 4105 JUNIUS ST

Grace United Methodist Church, Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA156-787(EH)

Eric Hill

Install new playground equipment in existing playground area. Approve - The proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii). The work is set back off of the street and is screened from the public right-of-way.

3. 4929 REIGER AVE

Munger Place Historic District

CA156-784(EH)

Eric Hill

Remove and replace existing lettering on front facade of main structure. Approve - The proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

4. 5101 REIGER AVE

Munger Place Historic District

CA156-783(EH)

Eric Hill

Stain previously approved rear perimeter wood fence. Brand: ReadySeal. Color: "Dark Walnut". Approve stain specification dated 9-1-16 as the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for wood fences in the preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(B)(vii) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5. 4921 VICTOR ST

Munger Place Historic District

CA156-794(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Convert front three-door entrance to a single pedestrian door. Approve with conditions - The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(S) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i). The proposal will restore the historic solid-to-void ratio of the front facade of the structure. Approve with condition that the enclosed non-historic openings utilize either existing window dimensions or siding to match existing materials, dimensions, and color.
2. Replace 32 windows on the house to vinyl clad windows. Approve with conditions - The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(S) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i). Approve with condition that the applicant

salvages and reuses wood windows as much as feasible and all windows on front facade retain diamond design on the upper panes.

3. Install two pedestrian doors on rear main structure. Approve - The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(S) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Construct vertical addition on rear of main structure. Approve - The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(B) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i). The addition is located in the rear 50% of the structure and will not be visible from the street. Materials and dimensions to match existing siding.
5. Change two-story stair configuration on rear elevation of main structure. Approve - The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(R) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Extend driveway into rear yard with concrete to match. Approve - The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(I) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. 5108 VICTOR ST

Munger Place Historic District

CA156-788(EH)

Eric Hill

Install in-ground pool in rear yard. Approve drawings and site plan dated 9-1-16 as the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) as the work will not have an adverse effect on the structure or district.

7. 4522 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CD156-017(EH)

Eric Hill

Demolish existing accessory structure using standard that the structure is an imminent threat to public health and safety. Approve with conditions - Approve the proposed demolition because it complies with the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(2)(E), because the applicant has met the burden of proof to show that the structure poses and imminent threat to public health and safety. Approve with the condition that the historic addition on the garage remains.

8. 4632 SYCAMORE ST (Moved to Discussion)

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA156-791(EH)

Eric Hill

Remove large tree from front yard.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion:

Remove large tree from front yard. Deny without prejudice with the finding of fact that the applicant has not provided sufficient information on the condition of the tree.

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Gadberry

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 1 Birrer

Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

9. 4601 WORTH ST (Moved to Discussion)

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic
District
CA156-790(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Construct single family home on empty lot.
2. Construct detached accessory structure in rear yard.

Speakers: For: Charaka Dharmagunaratne
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Construct single family home on empty lot. Approve - The proposed work is compatible with the preservation criteria for new construction in the preservation criteria sections 2 and 4 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Construct detached accessory structure in rear yard. Approve - The proposed work is compatible with the preservation criteria for accessory structures in the preservation criteria section 6 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Tapscott

Second: Flabiano

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 1 Birrer

Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

10. 1801 N LAMAR ST (Voted on Separately – Johnson recused)

West End Historic District
CA156-776(LC)
Liz Casso

Install attached sign in building entryway. Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 that states proposed signs must be consistent with the regulations in Division 51A7.1000. The proposed work is consistent with Section 51A-7.1005(a) for attached signs,

Section 51A-7.1005(c) for flat attached signs on Type A facades, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 603 MUNGER AVE (Voted on Separately - *Sherman recused)

West End Historic District
CA156-775(LC)
Liz Casso

Construct plaza improvements. Approve drawings dated 9/7/2016 and 9/19/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

12. 2826 MCDERMOTT AVE

Wheatley Place Historic District
CA156-780(MP)
Marsha Prior

Replace brown asphalt shingle roof with gray asphalt shingle roof. Approve specifications dated 09/14/2016 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district.

13. 405 S CLINTON AVE (Voted On Separately – condition added)

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-797(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body: SW7067 "Cityscape;" Trim: SW6992 "Inkwell;" Accent: SW6911 "Confident Yellow." Approve proposed paint specifications dated 9-12-16 **with the condition that the columns should match the body color** with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

14. 1325 W DAVIS ST

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-799(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Install 30" attached projecting sign on main structure. Approve the proposed work with the finding that it is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.117.2(l)(1)(4) and 51P-87.117.3(a)(H) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

15. 211 N WILLOMET AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-801(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Paint main structure using Behr paint. Body: PPU25-20 "Le Luxe;" Trim: PR-W14 "Bit of Sugar;" Pillars: N220-1 "Spun Wool." Approve proposed paint specifications dated 9-12-16 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

16. 411 S WILLOMET AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-798(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Install 6' wood fence and stain using Sherwin Williams SW3501 "Redwood." Approve with conditions - Approve site plan and specifications dated 9-12-16 with the condition that the fence is set back at least 2 feet from the public sidewalk. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(iii)(aa) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 700 DUMONT ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-782(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Replace chain link fence with six foot wood horizontal fence within the front 50% of side and corner side yards and four foot fence in front corner side yard, and stain, using Brand: Behr, ST-122, "Redwood Natural Tone."
2. Remove hedge along fence.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace chain link fence with six foot wood horizontal fence within the front 50% of side and corner side yards and four foot fence in front corner side yard, and stain, using Brand: Behr, ST-122, "Redwood Natural Tone." **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because locating side yard fences within the front 50% is not compatible with the historic overlay district.
2. Remove hedge along fence. **Approve** - Approve proposed site plan dated 9/14/2016 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because removal of the hedge is compatible with the historic overlay district.

Maker: *Sherman
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

2. 5707 TREMONT ST

Junius Heights Historic District

CA156-792(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Extend roof ridge to rear elevation.
2. Replace existing front porch columns with more appropriate columns.
3. Eliminate existing door and window on West (rear) elevation and replace with patio doors and sidelights.
4. Replace door on West (rear) 2nd story and replace with plate glass window.
5. Replace window on South (side) elevation.
6. Install straight edge wood shake siding on West (rear) gable.

Speakers: For: Nancy Hairston

Against: No one

Motion:

1. Extend roof ridge to rear elevation. **Approve** plans dated 9/14/2016 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 6.1 for roofs and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace existing front porch columns with more appropriate columns. **Approve with conditions to match submitted photos of neighbor's homes with 8 inch tapered box columns with appropriate detailed top and base.**
3. Eliminate existing door and window on West (rear) elevation and replace with patio doors and sidelights. **Approve** plans and specifications dated 9/14/2016 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Replace door on West (rear) 2nd story and replace with plate glass window. **Approve as submitted, awning windows dated 10/3/16 and approved by staff as a replacement for existing door at second floor.**
5. Replace window on South (side) elevation. **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans and specifications dated 9/14/2016 with condition that any gaps in siding due to installation of replacement window is repaired using exact match in materials, profile, and dimensions of current siding with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Install straight edge wood shake siding on West (rear) gable. **Approve wood shake shingles to match existing dormers on front and side of house.**

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Tapscott

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 1 Birrer

Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

3. 5421 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-793(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Replace exterior siding with original #105 6-inch pine siding.
2. Remove rear door and replace with pine siding.
3. Replace front door with Craftsman style door (Option 1) or multi light French door (Option 2).

Speakers: For: Chris LaMont
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace exterior siding with original #105 6-inch pine siding. **Approve with conditions – replacement not to exceed 40% without additional staff review.**
2. Remove rear door and replace with pine siding. **Approve** proposed work with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Replace front door with Craftsman style door (Option 1) or multi light French door (Option 2). **Approve with conditions** - Approve proposed work with the condition that the multi-light French door (Option 2) is installed with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.2 for non-original doors and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Gadberry
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

4. 5502 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-781(MP)
Marsha Prior

Replace six wood double hung windows with wood double hung windows of same size.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: David Preziosi

Motion:

Replace six wood double hung windows with wood double hung windows of same size. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because staff believes the windows can be repaired and replacing them is inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 4.5 which states historic materials must be repaired if possible and 5.1 which states that historic windows on protected elevations must be preserved. Windows #1, #4, #5, and #6 are on

protected elevations and with the finding of fact that the applicant has not submitted a window survey detailing the condition of the existing windows.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Johnson
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

5. 4613 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-786(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Install apartment lettering on main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Install balcony rail on front of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install apartment lettering on main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve** - The proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i). The preservation criteria does not mention apartment numbering and as these are temporary in nature and will not harm the underlying materials with their removal, the work would not have an adverse effect on the structure or district.
2. Install balcony rail on front of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 3.20 that states "all original columns, railings, and other trim and detailing that are part of the porch or balcony configuration must be preserved". The applicant did not meet the burden of proof to show that an iron picket rail was located on the second story porch historically.

Maker: Johnson
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0

Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

6. 4422 SWISS AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-789(EH)
Eric Hill
Construct four semi-detached residences.

Speakers: For: Cathy delaVergne, Saeed Mahdoubi
Against: No one

Motion:

Construct four semi-detached residences. **Approve** - The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria for new construction in Section 4 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii). The proposed construction appears to compliment and not duplicate historic architecture and would not have an adverse effect on the blockface or historic overlay district. **The applicant to submit more detailed and final landscape plans to Landmark Commission with the finding of fact that the applicant showed that 9 out of 10 adjacent properties on the block meet or exceed the proposed height.**

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Gadberry
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

7. 4719 SWISS AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-785(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Remove seven windows in rear of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Install two 8-lite windows in rear of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Install arched electric wrought-iron gate. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Amie Parsons
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Remove seven windows in rear of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve with condition that a water table appropriate to that period be installed at a height of original opening and painted to match trim.**
2. Install two 8-lite windows in rear of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve as submitted with the finding of fact that it is on the rear façade and is not detrimental to the district.**
3. Install arched electric wrought-iron gate. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny** - Gate inappropriate as top is not horizontal or parallel to grade as read by 2.14 in ordinance.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Flabiano
Results: 11/3

Ayes: - 11 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 3 Bowers, Gadberry, Amonett
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

8. 1151 BETTERTON CIR

Tenth Street Historic District
CA156-802(MP)
Marsha Prior
Construct two-story, wood frame house.

Speakers: For: Larry Johnson, Sr., Larry Johnson, Jr.
Against: No one

Motion:

Construct two-story, wood frame house. **Approve with conditions that the rolled step be maintained and new side walk connect rolled step to house** - Approve plans and specifications dated 9/14/2016 with the condition that a wood trim board is added on front elevation below the gable and that the existing rolled steps in front yard are maintained with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.2, 3.3, and 3.5, for new construction and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii). The addition of wood trim below the front gable makes the proposed design more consistent with Section 3.2.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Williams
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

9. 2814 DATHE ST

Wheatley Place Historic District
CA156-779(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Replace wood novelty siding on main structure with Hardie board lap siding. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Replace wood novelty siding on detached garage with Hardie board lap siding.
3. Replace 13 wood and aluminum windows with double hung multi-light vinyl windows. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. Infill two windows (Window #s 4 and 15) and cover with Hardie board siding.
5. Construct six foot wood fence that extends into front 50% of side yard.

Speakers: For: Olga Zappada, Francisco Cruz
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace wood novelty siding on main structure with Hardie board lap siding. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice** -The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.3 which states that wood siding must be restored whenever practical. If wood siding is economically impossible, the Landmark Commission may consider other appropriate materials.
2. Replace wood novelty siding on detached garage with Hardie board lap siding. **Approve.**
3. Replace 13 wood and aluminum windows with double hung multi-light vinyl windows. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice and allow the applicant 120 days to submit a new certificate of appropriateness.** The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.1 and 5.3 which state that historic windows must remain intact unless necessary due to damage or deterioration and that replacement windows should be of wood unless economically impossible whereby Landmark Commission may consider other appropriate materials.
4. Infill two windows (Window #s 4 and 15) and cover with Hardie board siding. **Deny without prejudice window #4 - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.1, 5.2, and 4.3 which state that historic windows must remain intact except when replacement is necessary due to damage or deterioration. Approve replacement of window #15.**
5. Construct six foot wood fence that extends into front 50% of side yard. **Approve with conditions - Approve site plan and specifications dated 9/12/2016 with condition that interior side fences are located at least five feet behind the open front porch of the houses next door and that portions facing the main street are 70 percent open with finished side facing out with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.11(b), 3.12, 3.13, 3.14, and 3.15 for fences and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).**

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Amonett

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

10. 106 N EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-800(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Remove concrete porch floor and install 1'x6' IPE wood porch floor.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

***Commissioner *Sherman recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.**

Motion:

Remove concrete porch floor and install 1'x6' IPE wood porch floor. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the requirements in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since not enough detail was submitted regarding the materials proposed and design of the porch skirting.

Maker: Tapscott

Second: Jordan

Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, *Sherman
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

11. 110 N EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-796(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Replace front door on main structure.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

***Commissioner *Sherman recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.**

Motion:

Replace front door on main structure. Approve with the finding of fact that it is not detrimental to the district and that it is compatible and the hardware to be submitted to staff for approval.

Maker: Amonett
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, *Sherman
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

Approval of Minutes from September 6, 2016.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Flabiano
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,
*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Birrer
Vacancies: - 3 3, 4 and 12

Approval of the 2017 Landmark Commission Meeting Calendar as amended.

Maker: Johnson
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, McGill, *Montgomery, Seale,

*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against:	-	0	
Absent:	-	1	Birrer
Vacancies:	-	3	3, 4 and 12

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at 4:36 P.M.

Katherine Seale, Chair

Date