

ICMA Benchmarking Project FY 2007 Data Report

Fleet Management
Equipment and Building Services
October 14, 2008



Fleet Management

- FY08 action item review
- Comparison of fleet maintenance (total vs. equipment class)
 - Number of vehicles
 - Age of fleet
 - Maintenance cost per mile
 - Average cost of maintenance per vehicle
- Billable hours
- Percent of expenditures contracted
- Alternative fuel use
- Customer satisfaction
- FY09 proposed action items



FY08 Action Item Review

Citywide internal customer survey to be completed	Complete – Equipment Services participated in the second Citywide Internal Customer Survey in March 2008. Survey to be repeated annually.
Continue to use Customer Service Reps at each fleet maintenance facility to improve relationships and customer satisfaction	Complete – Customer Service Reps are in place at all locations. Progress made, and continuous improvement will occur.
Cancel Serco contract and bring maintenance of Sanitation Heavy class back in-house	Complete - Contract canceled; EBS resumed maintenance of Sanitation Heavy Equipment class on April 1, 2008.
Hold second regional meeting of fleet managers to include Oklahoma City, Austin and San Antonio	Complete - Joined Texas Chapter of Rocky Mountain Fleet Management Association (RMFMA). Scheduled to attend meeting in November.
Complete ZIP process improvement at Make Ready and Paint and Body	Complete – Make Ready process improvement completed. Deferred – Paint and Body process deferred to FY09. Parts Availability process review began in FY08 instead of Paint and Body.
Obtain registration in Quality Management System, ISO 9001	On-track – Registration audit conducted in September. EBS recommended for registration pending action plan to correct 3 minor non-conformances.



Total Vehicles & Heavy Equipment

	Number of Vehicles	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY04	4,615	\$4,069
Dallas FY05	4,620	\$3,499
Dallas FY06	4,720	\$3,866
Dallas FY07	4,828	\$4,999

Note: Numbers do not include Landfill and Fire/EMS, but do include light equipment.

- FY07 compared to FY04
 - 5% increase in size of fleet
 - 23% increase cost per vehicle
- Balancing cost, customer satisfaction & equipment availability is on-going challenge



Total Vehicles & Heavy Equipment

	Number of Vehicles	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY07 (Numbers reported in ICMA)	4,761	\$5,586
Dallas FY07 (without Landfill, Fire/EMS, light equipment)	4,488	\$5,305
ICMA FY07	1,555	\$3,612

- Dallas cost 55% higher than ICMA average when Landfill and Fire/EMS included
 - 47% higher than ICMA average when Landfill and Fire/EMS excluded
- One city of comparable population and fleet size has higher costs (Phoenix \$5,533)
- Dallas has almost 200% more units than the ICMA average
 - More units typically means greater diversity and complexity



Police Vehicles

(Marked Sedans, SUVs, Motorcycles)

	Number of Vehicles	Age (Months)	Cost per Mile	Avg. Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	797	34	25¢	\$4,700
Dallas FY06	833	39	31¢ (18¢ without accidents)	\$5,809 (\$3,312 without accidents)
Dallas FY07	933	33	51¢ (39¢ without accidents)	\$7,244 (\$5,585 without accidents)
ICMA FY07	287	43	24¢	\$3,632

- Mileage comparison has less validity than prior years since data only available from work order system, not from fuel system
- Number of vehicles increased by 136 or 17% from 2005 to 2007
 - Dallas age of fleet 23% newer than ICMA
- Dallas average cost 54% above ICMA average when accident work orders excluded and 99% above when accident work orders included
 - 23% of Dallas cost is accident work orders; most other jurisdictions do not report same
- Comparison to peer cities
 - Oklahoma City cost is 18¢ per mile – Large percentage of vehicles are take-home thus work only one shift per day
 - San Antonio cost is 22¢ per mile – they replace marked squads at 60,000 miles (20 month average age), PM at 3,000 miles instead of 5,000, & did not report Paint and Body
 - Phoenix 28¢ and Austin 21¢



Light Vehicles I & II

(Automobiles, Vans, Pickups, SUVs)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	2129	69	17¢	\$1,422
Dallas FY06	2179	72	18¢	\$1,403
Dallas FY07	2180	73	34¢	\$2,030
ICMA FY07	783	N/A	21¢	\$1,527

- Dallas cost 33% higher than ICMA average
- Comparison to peer cities
 - Austin (24¢), Oklahoma City (19¢) and San Antonio (16¢) better
 - San Antonio did not report paint and body cost
 - Phoenix (35¢) worse



Solid Waste

(Automatic side-, front- and rear-loaders, Transfer Trailers, Roll-offs, Brush Trucks, and Rotobooms; Excludes Landfill)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	431	71	\$2.29	\$15,932
Dallas FY06	416	69	\$1.67	\$17,373
Dallas FY07	425	58	\$2.20	\$22,175
ICMA FY07	100	69	\$2.29	\$23,881

- Dallas cost per vehicle 7% better than ICMA average
 - San Antonio cost (\$1.71) better; they have 304 units but had only 37 automated trucks; Dallas has 114 automated
- Dallas cost increased as result of assistance to SERCO following Spring storms
 - In FY07 (May 2007), EBS resumed maintenance of rotobooms and assisted SERCO in repairs of rearloaders



Medium Duty Vehicles

(One-ton Service Trucks, Personnel Lifts)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	204	40	19¢	\$1,176
Dallas FY06	240	44	19¢	\$1,493
Dallas FY07	316	60	36¢	\$2,280
ICMA FY07	106	87	46¢	\$3,009

- Dallas cost per vehicle 24% better than ICMA
- Dallas ranks 9th out of 30 cities with population over 100,000
- Dallas age of fleet is 31% newer than ICMA



Heavy Duty Vehicles

(12-yd. Dump Trucks, Large Personnel Lifts, 3-ton Trucks)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Cost per Mile	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY05	536	66	44¢	\$2,423
Dallas FY06	529	72	34¢	\$1,982
Dallas FY07	539	81	65¢	\$3,352
ICMA FY07	140	101	\$5.20	\$6,959

- Dallas cost per vehicle 52% better than ICMA
- Dallas best (lowest cost) out of cities with population over 100,000
- Dallas age of fleet is 20% newer than ICMA



Heavy Equipment

(Construction Equipment, Gradalls, includes Landfill)

	Number of Vehicles	Age in Months	Avg. Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle
Dallas FY06	217	79	\$16,305
Dallas FY06 without Landfill	184	79	\$5,698
Dallas FY07	217	86	\$15,921
Dallas FY07 without Landfill	184	86	\$5,430
ICMA FY07	104	102	\$5,048

- Dallas cost decreased from prior year
- McCommas Landfill Heavy Shop operated by Sanitation Services has 33 pieces of equipment with very high maintenance cost; skews average cost per vehicle
 - Dallas next to the most costly City reporting when Landfill costs are included
 - Ranked 39th out of 56 cities when landfill excluded



Fire Apparatus and EMS

Fire Apparatus	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle	Cost per Mile
Dallas FY06 – Fire	\$13,574	54¢
Dallas FY07 – Fire	\$16,736	\$1.88
ICMA FY07 – Fire	\$13,735	\$2.28
EMS Equipment	Average Total Maintenance Cost per Vehicle	Cost per Mile
Dallas FY06 – EMS	\$13,574	54¢
Dallas FY07 – EMS	\$12,814	46¢
ICMA FY07 – EMS	\$9,621	53¢

- Fire Apparatus
 - Dallas spends 22% more than ICMA average on maintenance, however, Dallas spends less per mile driven than ICMA
- EMS Equipment
 - Dallas spends 33% more than ICMA average on maintenance, however, Dallas spends less per mile driven than ICMA



Hours Billed as % of Hours Available

	Hours Billed as a Percentage of Hours Available
Dallas FY04	77.2%
Dallas FY05	78.7%
Dallas FY06	72.7%
Dallas FY07	75.1%
ICMA FY07	66.6%

- Percent of 2,080 hours per mechanic that are charged to work orders
- Dallas 13% better than ICMA
 - Dallas percent of billable hours in FY07 higher (better) than FY06
- Dallas ranked 9th out of 40 cities with population over 100,000
- 24.9% indirect includes: vacation, sick, holiday & other leave; training & supervision; and breaks



Percent Contracted

	Percent of Fleet Expenditures Contracted
Dallas FY04	18.5%
Dallas FY05	20.8%
Dallas FY06	29.8%
Dallas FY07	32.3%
ICMA FY07	17.3%

- Services contracted include paint and body work, glass, transmissions, exhaust, component rebuild, upholstery, & differentials;
- In FY07, percentage increased due workload increase, low staffing
 - 13% of fleet maintenance privatized through the Serco contract



Alternative Fuel Use

	Percent of vehicles and heavy equipment using alternative fuel
Dallas FY04	30.7%
Dallas FY05	56.3%
Dallas FY06	27.2%
Dallas FY07	26.9%
ICMA FY07	8.3%

- Dallas ahead of ICMA average in use of alternative fuels
 - Dallas actual usage much higher when biodiesel is included in calculation



Customer Satisfaction

	Percent of customers/ respondents rating quality of service as:			
	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor
Dallas (March 2007)	22%	44%	24%	10%
ICMA FY07	64.4%	28.1%	4.2%	3.2%

- Dallas behind ICMA for customers satisfied with service
- Dallas uses City-wide customer survey to report to ICMA, however, other surveys targeting customer at time of service yield different results



FY09 Proposed Action Items

- Participate in third annual Citywide Internal Customer Survey
- Continue involvement with Texas Chapter of RMFMA
- Conduct ZIP process improvement at Paint and Body Shop
- Participate in ZIP process with DPD to focus on squad car availability
- Continue implementation of ISO 18001 (Safety) and integrate with QMS and EMS

