

SECTION 5

Transcript of the
July 1, 2024
Landmark Commission
Hearing
6205 LaVista Drive
CA234-395(CM)

1 THE CITY OF DALLAS LANDMARK COMMISSION

2 MONDAY, JULY 1, 2024

3

4

5 COMMISSIONERS IN ATTENDANCE:

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON

7 COMMISSIONER MONTGOMERY

8 COMMISSIONER COX

9 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT

10 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS

11 COMMISSIONER PREZIOSI

12 COMMISSIONER FOGLEMAN

13 COMMISSIONER REAVES

14 COMMISSIONER GAY

15 COMMISSIONER SHERMAN

16 COMMISSIONER GUEST

17 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR

18 COMMISSIONER HINOJOSA

19 COMMISSIONER RENAUD

20 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON

21

22 STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

23 MARISSA HINES MARCUS WATSON

24 RHONDA DUNN ADRIAN MCCLENDON

25 CHRISTINA MANKOWSKI

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

* * *

CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Let's go to day 6.
That is mine as well.

MS. MANKOWSKI: I first wanted to answer a question Mr. Preziosi asked. Roof was replaced in 2012 with matching color and material. So, original slate -- I mean, natural slate with the same color scheme. So, it has been over 20 years. Okay.

Christina Mankowski on behalf of City Staff, discussion Item number 66205 La Vista Drive, Swiss Avenue, Historic District CA234395CM, a request. The request is a certificate of appropriateness to place existing slate shingle roof with DaVinci Province synthetic slate in the color vineyard.

Staff recommendation that the request for a certificate of appropriateness to replace existing slate shingle roof with DaVinci Province synthetic slate in the color vineyard be denied without prejudice. The proposed work is inconsistent with the standards in City Code, Section 51A-4.501G6CI for contributing structures and the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.

COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: Task Force



1 recommendation, that the request for a certificate of
2 appropriateness to replace existing slate shingle
3 roof with DaVinci Province synthetic slate in the
4 color vineyard be denied without prejudice.

5 Materials are not typical of the style and period of
6 the home. The existing slate should be replaced with
7 a natural slate rather than synthetic slate.

8 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. Thank you.
9 We do have two registered speakers. I don't know who
10 wants to go first. But everybody who's going to
11 speak has to do the whole, tell me your name, tell me
12 your address, promise to tell the truth thing. Okay?

13 MS. SAMSON: Good afternoon. My name is
14 Monica Samson and I live in 624 Ambigade Drive in
15 Shady Shores, Texas. And I promise to tell the
16 truth. So, we have a -- at that location of the
17 subject property, we have slate roof that is very
18 old. It's very -- it's cracked and it's severely
19 damaged.

20 So, we have tried to replace it, but the
21 manufacturer in China no longer exists, they lost
22 their license and they disappeared decades ago. And
23 we don't have that same slate. We tried to repair it
24 multiple times before, but at this point it's like
25 beyond repair. And I have my expert roofer here and

1 I have examples of the DaVinci slate that we plan to
2 use.

3 MR. JOSEPH: You want my address at home
4 or my company address or.

5 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: You can do the company
6 one.

7 MR. JOSEPH: Okay. My name is Anthony
8 Joseph, AJ and 5552 Tenderfoot Trail, Fort Worth,
9 Texas.

10 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Are you going to tell
11 the truth?

12 MR. JOSEPH: I swear to tell the whole
13 truth.

14 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Thank you. All right.

15 MR. JOSEPH: Okay. So, as far as the
16 slate goes, it doesn't really matter to be honest
17 with you because slate is really going obsolete. And
18 the reason being is because of the Texas weather
19 conditions. Anything at 1.75 diameter hail will
20 shatter and crack slate.

21 As far as the DaVinci is synthetic, it can
22 withstand a lot more, it's durability, it's color
23 scheme is almost the same. As a matter of fact,
24 there's a DaVinci shingle on 6223 La Vista Drive as
25 well that I noticed. And it's a lot more safer in my

1 opinion. It's just my opinion because a slate flies
2 off a roof and hits somebody, it can really do some
3 damage and actually do some damage to people's cars.

4 This DaVinci's a lot less likely than
5 slate to hurt somebody if it comes off a roof. And
6 she's actually holds pretty good, a lot more better
7 than slate would on a roof as far as durability wise
8 as well.

9 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Is that all for now or
10 do you have --

11 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah. Well, in the last four
12 years, Texas weather conditions have gotten worse,
13 the hail has gotten bigger and everything else. So,
14 just my recommendation, go to slate, the DaVinci.

15 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. I was just
16 examining the fake slate. I had to tap on it, like I
17 would ever tap on a roof or stand --

18 MR. JOSEPH: They actually --

19 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: -- why I did that, but
20 --

21 MR. JOSEPH: -- they have it at -- you can
22 actually go check if you guys want to look yourselves
23 and see how it looks on the roof at 6223 La Vista
24 Drive. So, I --

25 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: It's hard to imagine

1 how it looks at a distance, but we'll try. Okay.
2 So, let me ask commissioners what questions they may
3 have about this. Commissioner Cox?

4 COMMISSIONER COX: Have you put to
5 identify any products -- I understand you have a
6 supply chain problem now that the original slate
7 manufacturers disappeared in China somewhere. Are
8 there other manufacturers in the United States --

9 MR. JOSEPH: Yes, sir.

10 COMMISSIONER COX: -- produce slates.

11 MR. JOSEPH: Yes, ma'am.

12 COMMISSIONER COX: Are they any good.

13 MR. JOSEPH: Like I said, Texas weather
14 conditions, I don't agree with putting slate on a
15 roof. That's just my opinion, but slate is slate.

16 COMMISSIONER COX: Okay. Thank you.

17 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Other questions? Mr.
18 Preziosi? Oh, sorry, go ahead, Commissioner Offutt.

19 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: Excuse me. This is
20 for staff and based on the Swiss Avenue coordinates
21 itself, is it -- when is it allowed/appropriate to
22 change out materials on roofs (inaudible). I mean, I
23 know that that's happened significantly all
24 throughout the district. Thank you.

25 MS. MANKOWSKI: Under the roofs it states

1 it has to be appropriate and compatible, whatever the
2 roof is. However, you want to also maintain what was
3 originally original to the structure without changing
4 it if you can. There's -- I don't think Swiss -- I
5 think it's very open. It doesn't give specifics. I
6 believe it's section 9. Is it nine?

7 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: Okay. If I'm
8 hearing you correctly, it could be appropriate to
9 change out slate or something else; is that correct.

10 MS. MANKOWSKI: If -- it would depend on
11 each individual structure and what the roof material
12 you're trying to change out, it has to still be
13 compatible to the style of the home. It -- you can't
14 just, you know, take --

15 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: Okay. Let me ask it
16 in a different way. Virginia McAllister home, which
17 --

18 MS. MANKOWSKI: Yeah.

19 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: -- I think everybody
20 know whose Virginia is and how precise she was about
21 historic preservation and blah, blah, blah. That
22 roof was over the years changed out to asphalt. So,
23 was that appropriate or not.

24 MS. MANKOWSKI: What was originally there?

25 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: Slate.

1 MS. MANKOWSKI: If I were looking at it, I
2 would say no. I know that we have hail here, but I
3 did work on the vineyard where there are many slate
4 houses and they still install them now. And yes,
5 they can fall if they're -- if the wrong nails or
6 screws are used, you know, wrong metal, copper versus
7 steel. And if they rot out they can, but if they're
8 properly installed, a rock stone will last longer
9 than we will.

10 Essentially, and you know, I say if the
11 majority of the slate roof is still well intact, why
12 not weave in other pieces of natural slate because of
13 the variation in the color of this specific roof? I
14 think it would be very well blended. No one would
15 probably be able to tell where the patchwork is.

16 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay.

17 MR. JOSEPH: Are you done?

18 COMMISSIONER PREZIOSI: I can add -- I
19 think I can --

20 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER PREZIOSI: -- make this work.

22 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Commissioner Preziosi
23 thinks he knows how to deal with where we are now.

24 COMMISSIONER PREZIOSI: Okay. So I guess
25 my question for the applicants would be, can you

1 source original replacement tiles to be weaved into
2 this -- the existing slate, you could source slate to
3 weave into the exist -- to repair the patches and
4 weave into the existing slate.

5 MR. JOSEPH: It's -- I'll be honest with
6 you, and I got storm seal, which is, I had to seal
7 the whole roof because it was bad. Like it's short.
8 You can't just patch here patch there. It's short.
9 Like, it's not -- I wouldn't work on it like it is.
10 I wouldn't even try to patch it. That's how much
11 damage that is on this roof.

12 MS. MANKOWSKI: I don't mean patch it like
13 you would still have to remove the entire -- you
14 know, carefully remove all the slate, redo the
15 underlayment, and then, you know (inaudible).

16 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah. You have to put a
17 synthetic there --

18 MS. MANKOWSKI: Yeah.

19 MR. JOSEPH: You have to go down on --

20 MS. MANKOWSKI: So, you're going to remove
21 the roof anyway when you're -- if you replace it with
22 synthetic. So why not carefully remove each slate
23 and then fill in whatever the percentage is that is
24 damaged. That was my --

25 MR. JOSEPH: You're correct there, but

1 when it hails again next year, you're going to do the
2 same thing. I'm just -- you know, it doesn't -- it's
3 not impact resistant. It holds only up to 1.75 and
4 you guys get over that on a basis three times, four
5 times a year sometimes. You know, and it's not
6 durable to hold -- withstand them hits.

7 You're going to have to replace it
8 constantly, whether you go back up with slate or not,
9 you know, and that's just what I'm -- but as far as
10 that, I have storm seal on the whole roof to protect
11 anything from flying off during any storms that
12 happen now to protect anybody from getting hurt or
13 injured or anything like that. But I still say
14 synthetic is the best way to go.

15 MS. MANKOWSKI: Okay. And I know he asked
16 in the ordinance, it is section N, the roof forms
17 number 2, materials and colors. Roof materials and
18 colors must compliment the style and overall color
19 scheme of the building or structure. Tar and gravel
20 buildup is only permitted as a roof material on
21 covered porches and porte cocheres with flat roofs.
22 So that is what's given. However, Secretary of
23 Interior, you know, we want to replace in kind, like
24 for like when we can, that was Staff's position as
25 well as Task Force.

1 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: I have a comment.

2 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Well, it's right --
3 it's still time for questions. So let's get all
4 questions out of the way. And Commissioner Reaves
5 has been waving at me for a while.

6 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Well, one of the
7 advantages of being at home, you look stuff up
8 online, there's a product that's a real slate that --
9 but if you put it up, it says it's hand-quarried and
10 it's waterproof and it's kind of hail proof, and you
11 can use it on low-pitched roofs, but it's actual
12 slate.

13 MR. JOSEPH: This is a 14-pitch though.
14 Like straight up --

15 COMMISSIONER REAVES: It sounds like you
16 put it up just like you would asphalt shingles.

17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I do have a
18 question.

19 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay, hang on. I think
20 I want to let Ms. Reaves know that I believe the
21 applicant was saying that the pitch of this roof is
22 extremely high and therefore it takes different slate
23 than that. And I can't contradict that because I
24 have no idea what I'm talking about.

25 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Well, this

1 particular product is -- it doesn't say that it's not
2 for high-pitched roof. It says that it is also for
3 low-pitched roofs.

4 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Which is hard to keep
5 water out of low-pitched roofs. Okay. And you
6 should probably share that with Staff, because Staff
7 is who can discuss alternate products with people, we
8 don't usually do that. Commissioner Renaud you've
9 been sitting over there patiently waiting for me. Go
10 ahead.

11 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: I have a couple of
12 questions on the slate that's on the home already.
13 Did -- I thought I heard someone mention when this
14 roof was placed 2012 and it's lasted 12 years. Also
15 the dimensional size of it, it seems wider than
16 normal to me. That's just from your observation,
17 have you measured the slate --

18 MR. JOSEPH: If you -- yeah. If you
19 actually put them up side by side (inaudible).

20 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: Okay. So, they're
21 the same size. Okay, thank you.

22 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah. I actually got to say
23 DaVinci did a real good job as far as diameter and
24 everything else.

25 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: Thank you.

1 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Commissioner Hinojosa.
2 Oh, and then Commissioner Livingston will be after
3 Commissioner Hinojosa. Oh, you're muted.

4 COMMISSIONER HINOJOSA: Oh, sorry. I
5 wanted to ask if the -- we approved removal of this
6 in replacement with the DaVinci, would you all take
7 away all that slate? Would you all remove all that
8 slate down to the whatever.

9 MR. JOSEPH: Yes, ma'am. Because we have
10 to put belt down -- new belt down and every down
11 synthetic belt. And we have to check to see if
12 there's any rafters or anything -- any wood that's
13 rotten up there that we've got to replace as well.

14 COMMISSIONER HINOJOSA: Okay. Thank you.

15 MR. JOSEPH: Yes, ma'am.

16 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: I have a
17 question.

18 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. Hang on
19 Commissioner Livingston, I think you were next in
20 line.

21 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: I was just going
22 to ask is that's the entire swatch palette color.

23 MS. MANKOWSKI: It just this one of them,
24 is the vineyard. The other one is a light gray.

25 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: Okay.

1 MS. MANKOWSKI: He just wanted to show you

2 --

3 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: So --

4 MS. MANKOWSKI: -- it doesn't represent
5 the variation.

6 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: Okay. Yeah. I
7 knew they did. No. I knew that they did that. I
8 was just (inaudible).

9 MS. MANKOWSKI: Yeah. Very --

10 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah. It's -- it actually
11 mimics it pretty good. The roof that's up there now
12 this. Yes, sir.

13 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. Who else
14 was online, Commissioner Ander --

15 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: A question?

16 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Me.

17 MS. MANKOWSKI: Cummings and Anderson.

18 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. Because
19 Commissioner Anderson already spoke on this one, I
20 don't remember.

21 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: No.

22 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. And then
23 Commissioner Cummings, I see you waving at me, Mr.
24 Cummings. Okay.

25 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: My question is,

1 what is this imitation slate made of? Just what is
2 the material.

3 MR. JOSEPH: It's synthetic.

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: What is it made
5 of.

6 MS. MANKOWSKI: Plastic.

7 MR. JOSEPH: Plastic vinyl. It's plastic
8 --

9 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: Yeah. It's a
10 vinyl plastic mixture.

11 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Okay. My next
12 question is, we know what slate looks like after two
13 or 300 years on a house or on a building. Do we know
14 -- is there studies (inaudible) to show what happens
15 in the hot Texas sun when this plastic product gets
16 fried? Is it going to get white? Is it going to get
17 (inaudible).

18 MR. JOSEPH: Well, so far to be honest
19 with you, that DaVinci that you have right here in
20 Dallas, that's on the historical -- one of the
21 historical houses over there is also -- it looks
22 pretty good. So, I haven't got on the roof. I don't
23 want to knock on them people's door and say, can I
24 see your product and see how it looks. But actually
25 they back it up to 50 years, they say, but it hasn't

1 been out that long. So, nobody really knows, to be
2 honest with you.

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: But nobody really
4 knows what's going to happen in the Texas sun with
5 this product.

6 MR. JOSEPH: Well, actually, they -- like
7 I said, they had this -- they have it at 6223 La
8 Vista Drive already this same product. So this same
9 product that's already over there is -- it looks
10 pretty good. So I don't know how long they had it,
11 if it's been there a year, if it's been there two
12 years, if it's been there three years. I don't know
13 when it was approved through you all to put it up on
14 that house, but it's there.

15 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Thank you.

16 MR. JOSEPH: Yes, sir.

17 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. Commissioner
18 Cummings?

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Just for your
20 information, you mentioned 6223 La Vista, it's on
21 your screen now.

22 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Is that in the Historic
23 District.

24 MS. MANKOWSKI: Yes.

25 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: It is, okay.

1 MS. MANKOWSKI: That was a --

2 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: I haven't seen it
3 before. I think I would remember the (inaudible).

4 MR. JOSEPH: And it really does, it really
5 is. When you put it down, it's -- I work with a lot
6 of stone code and steel too. When you put those
7 products down and it's on a solid surface, it's not
8 really going anywhere. As long as it's installed
9 right, it holds up to two -- it is showing two inch
10 hail, but that it's -- you know, and then the regular
11 slate's 1.75. So, I say that synthetic is actually
12 holding up better than regular slate to hail.

13 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right.
14 Commissioner Cummings, you have a question?

15 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Yeah. I have a
16 couple questions. And I'm very familiar -- I'm just
17 also very familiar with this product. I've actually
18 used this product on a one of the few remaining
19 Carnegie libraries in Texas. So, I'm very rehearsed
20 with the product.

21 The -- but my questions are, this is also
22 a stork materials and we don't like -- we like to
23 replace in kind as we've heard. The slate that's
24 there, there's been talk about the sizes. What's the
25 thickness of the slate that's there that's -- that

1 has been failing.

2 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah. I don't have it on me.

3 It's -- when you butt it up against side by side,

4 it's almost identical. It's probably about --

5 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: I know, slate --

6 MR. JOSEPH: Go ahead.

7 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Slate thicknesses

8 I know comes in three sixteenths up to three eighths,

9 typically a quarter inch thick --

10 MR. JOSEPH: I think --

11 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: -- they hold up --

12 they've been holding up for a long -- I have a

13 90-year-old house with slate roof. Been going

14 through storms for a while, they hold up really well.

15 I've seen slate used on dormers and vertical

16 applications as well. Let's talk about the roof

17 pitches. It holds up well, so I'm wondering --

18 MR. JOSEPH: It's three eight --

19 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: -- I'm trying to

20 figure out what the condition is a little bit more

21 there. If it's a thinner slate tile that's used --

22 MR. JOSEPH: This is three eighths.

23 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Post replacement is

24 three eights, what's up there now?

25 MR. JOSEPH: It's the same size.

1 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: It's the same size as
2 that. Okay.

3 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah.

4 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: So, we're going with
5 three eights on old new. Okay.

6 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Okay. So the
7 thickness is three eights, the existing that's up
8 there is three eights.

9 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah.

10 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Okay. All right.
11 Well, thank you for the questions and the answer.
12 Thank you.

13 MR. JOSEPH: Yes, sir. Thank you.

14 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. Anybody
15 else have a question? If not --

16 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: I will, another
17 question.

18 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay.

19 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: The ridge pieces,
20 how are those in the synthetic, is that one piece
21 that actually bridges or is it actually two pieces
22 like a real slate.

23 MR. JOSEPH: It's just like it is up there
24 right now. They have a real, I guess they have a cap
25 one. Yeah. Same as this. It'd be the same as

1 (inaudible).

2 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: Understood. But --

3 MR. JOSEPH: Are you talking about the
4 original?

5 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: -- the ridge --
6 okay. But it's one piece that overlaps rather than
7 two.

8 MR. JOSEPH: Yeah.

9 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: Okay. Thank you.

10 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. If that's
11 all of our questions, then it's time for someone to
12 make a motion. Oh, good, Commissioner Reaves are you
13 going to make a motion?

14 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Yes, sir. I move
15 that we accept Staff recommendation. Do I need to
16 read -- oh, I need to do all that other stuff.

17 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: You have to do all that
18 reading about the address and the ACA number and all
19 that.

20 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Yeah. Okay. I
21 moved for 6205 La Vista Drive, Swiss Avenue
22 Historical District CA234-395CM (inaudible) I move
23 that we accept Staff Task Force recommendation.

24 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. We cannot move
25 to accept a Task Force recommendation.

1 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Okay. Staff --

2 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Only a Staff one.

3 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Staff

4 recommendation.

5 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. So, you're
6 moving to follow Staff recommendations for their
7 reasons that they gave?

8 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Yes.

9 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: That the proposed work
10 is inconsistent with the standards?

11 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Would you like me to
12 read this to you? That the request for the
13 certificate of **appropriate is to replace existing
14 slight shingle roof with DaVinci product synthetic
15 slate in the color vine -- vineyard be denied without
16 prejudice. This proposed work is inconsistent with
17 the standards of the City code section 50 --

18 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: You don't have to read
19 the section.

20 COMMISSIONER REAVES: -- for continuity
21 structures and the Secretary of the Interior
22 Standards for Rehabilitation.

23 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. Thank you. That
24 was very well spoken. I just don't know how you came
25 up with that so quickly. Okay. You'll have a second

1 on this.

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I'll second it.

3 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Who was the second.

4 MS. MANKOWSKI: I think Anderson first.

5 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Fogleman is our second

6 on this. All right. Is there any comment?

7 Commissioner Livingston?

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I'd like to make a
9 comment if I may.

10 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. Well,
11 Commissioner Livingston already had spoken, so let's
12 go.

13 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: Yeah. I just --
14 that's why I asked the question about the -- someone
15 asked it before me about the ordinance and the
16 regulation requirement in the neighborhood, you know,
17 relative to historic as far as that neighborhood and
18 what's consistent. Because in my mind, the material,
19 the product is trying to be designed to emulate that
20 historic product with a consideration of, you know,
21 weather tolerance.

22 So, it's just -- you know, I'm a little
23 bit torn on that product in comparison with a comp
24 roof or some of the other photos in the neighborhood,
25 you know, based on what the whole design of that

1 product is for, which is to mimic original slate, but
2 with more durability.

3 So, I mean, you know, my -- I'm torn
4 because my common sense kind of response to that
5 effort is like, okay, so that's why I won't be
6 supporting the motion.

7 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. Thank you.
8 Commissioner Anderson?

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: I just want to
10 make note --

11 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Then Commissioner
12 Offutt after Commissioner Anderson.

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: But there was a --
14 once in a lifetime, hopefully a hailstorm about 15
15 years ago. And many of the slate and tile -- most of
16 them on **twist were damaged and literally all of
17 them came back. They went through, got -- the tile
18 manufacturers came to the Lakewood Library and they
19 all got together and matched the color tiles and
20 slate they had and literally all of the houses got
21 new slate roofs from their insurance companies. So,
22 there is a bit of a precedent if you will, that
23 houses in Swiss Avenue keep their original tiles and
24 slate if at all possible.

25 Furthermore, it appears that most of the

1 slate is still up there. A slate and tile protected
2 roof, there's a file -- something goes down, a felt.
3 So, it makes more sense to take the slate off and
4 repair the slate -- the roof, repair the felt and put
5 the tile back on and repair -- replace the -- that
6 what is missing.

7 So yeah, I would be concerned if there was
8 no slate left and we were starting from scratch but
9 the back door of the slate is still there. We'd be
10 throwing away the original material for no good
11 reason. Thank you.

12 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Commissioner Offutt.

13 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: Thank you. I asked
14 specifically about the materials because of the
15 incredible mix we have within our district, tiles
16 coming off and composition going up and not being
17 able to tell the difference from a distance. So, I'm
18 -- I will not be supporting this motion because our
19 ordinance specifically allows for complimentary
20 materials to mesh with what was there before. Thank
21 you.

22 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: I have a question
23 or a comment for the -- actually for clarification,
24 please.

25 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay.

1 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Clarification of
2 Staff, going back to this materials questioning. Is
3 the -- am I to understand the ordinance will allow a
4 synthetic product to replace in this situation here.

5 MS. MANKOWSKI: It doesn't specifically
6 say it. I'll read it verbatim.

7 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Yeah.

8 MS. MANKOWSKI: It's section N roof forms
9 roman II, materials and colors. Roof materials and
10 colors must compliment the style and overall color
11 scheme of the building or structure. Tar and gravel
12 buildup is only permitted as a roof material on
13 covered porches and porte cocheres with flat roofs.
14 That's all it says.

15 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Okay. Thank you.
16 I will be supporting the denial on the roof. I don't
17 think we are in a situation to start approving
18 synthetic materials across the board such as this.
19 And on something like this, it doesn't seem to be
20 that there is a warrant, a need for this because of
21 lessening the weight. I think slate tiles have a
22 history of lasting for a long time. There may need
23 to be some patching from time to time, but I won't be
24 supporting to replace the roof so.

25 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. Thank you.

1 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: In this nature
2 (inaudible).

3 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Mr. Cummings? I don't
4 know if there's any -- anybody else. I -- I'll say
5 that normally I do not like artificial materials
6 replacing original material. We all understand that
7 vinyl windows do not look right on the thing that's
8 why we dislike them. They aren't inappropriate.

9 Most of the cementitious boards that
10 people want to replace with siding are not approvable
11 right now because they're not in the right shapes.
12 They don't look like the original siding. I'm
13 suspecting that this artificial slate roof, if the
14 colors are right and that it probably at a distance
15 you can't tell the difference. I'm suspecting that,
16 I don't know for sure because I haven't witnessed it.

17 And therefore in a quandary as to what we
18 ought to do about this one, it does appear that if
19 this roof completely fails, they would be able to ask
20 us for a plain old ugly composition roof. I have one
21 of those too. I'm calling it ugly. I have -- most
22 of us have one and that would be less good than the
23 plastic slate is even if real slate is better and not
24 everything's not a yes or no. Some things are a
25 sliding scale.

1 So, I'm not sure, I wouldn't be inclined
2 to allow them to go ahead with the artificial slate.
3 Perhaps not until though they have re-examined -- not
4 to oppose you, sir. They had a second opinion about
5 whether or not they could do that whole take the
6 slate off and check it again.

7 Just to verify that this existing
8 beautiful slate couldn't be reused. But ultimately,
9 if it can't, I think I would think that the plastic
10 might be a good solution. That's just my opinion.
11 Commissioner Cox, you have an opinion?

12 COMMISSIONER COX: I do. Commissioner
13 Offutt, you mentioned that Virginia wouldn't have had
14 something wrong with her roof. Well, Virginia
15 wouldn't have but Dorothy might have. And I can
16 remember sitting in the garden room and talking to
17 Virginia about this.

18 And she was putting in CA for replacing
19 impediment on the front of the house because her
20 mother had taken off the original, some 20 years
21 earlier because she wanted the house to look more
22 modern. And the savage house was not going to ever
23 look more modern, you know, so. But you know, it's
24 just, you go back to that. But I don't think that
25 comes from modern historical district things. I

1 think that's just how her family went on things.

2 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: All right. Thank you.

3 And yes they -- I heard about her mother from
4 Virginia too sometimes. So interesting relationship
5 I'm sure; aren't they all? Any other comments before
6 we vote on this? All right. Then it's time to vote.
7 All those in favor of this motion please say aye.

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Aye.

9 COMMISSIONER HINOJOSA: Aye.

10 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Aye.

11 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: I am going to say aye.

12 And are there any opposed.

13 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: Opposed.

14 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. We're going to
15 do a roll call vote. We do that one when I can't
16 count. Okay. We're (inaudible) Okay. Marcus, you
17 do it.

18 MR. WATSON: District 1, Sherman?

19 COMMISSIONER SHERMAN: Aye.

20 MR. WATSON: District 2, Montgomery.

21 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: I said aye.

22 MR. WATSON: District 3, Fogleman?

23 COMMISSIONER FOGLEMAN: Aye.

24 MR. WATSON: District 4, Taylor?

25 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Aye.

1 MR. WATSON: District 5, Offutt.
2 COMMISSIONER OFFUTT: No.
3 MR. WATSON: District 6, Hinojosa.
4 COMMISSIONER HINOJOSA: Aye.
5 MR. WATSON: District 7, Livingston.
6 COMMISSIONER LIVINGSTON: Nay.
7 MR. WATSON: District 9, Renaud.
8 COMMISSIONER RENAUD: Nay.
9 MR. WATSON: District 10, Cox.
10 COMMISSIONER COX: (Inaudible).
11 MR. WATSON: District 11, Gay?
12 COMMISSIONER GAY: Nay.
13 MR. WATSON: District 13, Preziosi.
14 COMMISSIONER PREZIOSI: Nay.
15 MR. WATSON: District 14, Guest?
16 COMMISSIONER GUEST: Aye.
17 MR. WATSON: Alternate Anderson.
18 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Aye.
19 MR. WATSON: And Alternate Reaves.
20 COMMISSIONER REAVES: Aye.
21 MR. WATSON: And Alternate Cummings.
22 COMMISSIONER CUMMINGS: Aye.
23 MR. WATSON: I have nine yeses, six nos.
24 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. So this motion
25 carried if not by a lot. Again, because this was

1 denial, it is possible for a fee to appeal to CPC,
2 the City Plan Commission. And they would solely
3 determine whether they feel we ruled in error that is
4 violated expectations of the ordinance.

5 So, one could do that. You could also try
6 coming back with perhaps more evidence of the utter
7 failure of the existing slate. Something that might
8 sway those last few votes you needed to a different
9 resolution. But as it stands now, you have received
10 a denial on this request and I encourage you to work
11 with Staff to move forward.

12 MR. JOSEPH: I want to clarify real quick.

13 MR. WATSON: Mr. (Inaudible) what's your
14 vote on that?

15 SPEAKER 3: Aye.

16 MR. WATSON: Okay.

17 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay. So that doesn't
18 change anything. So, I'm sorry that things did not
19 go quite your way. I reiterate, I still am not sure
20 which way to go with this and that the --

21 MR. JOSEPH: Excuse me ma'am, a question
22 please.

23 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: -- this might be a
24 wonderful new solution, but I don't know.

25 MR. JOSEPH: How did the Heller house get

1 approved right down the street? Like just asking.

2 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Good question. And it
3 may have gotten approval. I'm not going -- I'm not
4 insinuating anything, but they may have done it
5 without approval. But each case is unique and stands
6 on its own. So, even if we let everybody else in the
7 whole district get it, we don't have to get -- let
8 you get it. So that's the way it is.

9 MR. JOSEPH: No. Well, I understand what
10 you're saying. I -- and I'll just go back and look
11 at it again, take pictures. But you cannot take that
12 slate off, put it back up and think it's going to be
13 all hunky doors. It's not -- it's brittle, it's old.
14 You're going to have to replace the whole roof
15 regardless.

16 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay.

17 MR. JOSEPH: Point taken. You take that
18 slate off, you're not putting it back up.

19 MR. WATSON: One option you have because
20 this was denial without prejudice. If you can come
21 back and have more evidence that really convince them
22 that it cannot be redone --

23 MR. JOSEPH: Yes, sir.

24 MR. WATSON: -- then you can try again.

25 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: And what might help is

1 -- it's an additional expense. If you consulted
2 someone who regularly works with historic houses, I
3 don't know how much you do that. But a second
4 opinion of someone who's first thought when they see
5 historic houses is, gosh, I want to save every part
6 of it. And if they agree then we'd be really
7 impressed, I suppose. Okay. Because we assume most
8 people think it'd be easier to start over.

9 MS. MANKOWSKI: If I may add. I -- we've
10 had about five roofers look at it and it's -- there
11 is a consensus that the roof is no longer functioning
12 and that this product performs better, has less
13 weight, lasts longer and helps with the temperature
14 as well. So, we've had five roofers. At this point
15 --

16 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Okay.

17 MS. MANKOWSKI: -- the -- it has a wrap.
18 That roof has been wrapped, it wrapped indefinitely
19 and it was not an inexpensive process to have that.
20 So, what you're asking is for us to unwrap it and
21 re-evaluate?

22 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: I'm not asking you to
23 do anything. I have --

24 MS. MANKOWSKI: You suggesting.

25 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: -- I'm suggesting --

1 MS. MANKOWSKI: Yeah.

2 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: -- what I pretty much
3 said was, I know that there's a natural tendency for
4 people who fix things to think, well, if I got rid of
5 all the other stuff, I could fix it from new and
6 that'd be a lot easier, that's what I want to do too.
7 So, ask someone -- if none of those five that agreed
8 were people who often work with historic houses and
9 usually say, let's try to save it, find somebody like
10 that and let them look at it would be a good idea.

11 It's what I would do if you were my sister
12 and I wanted to suggest, but I can't suggest it to
13 you as a member of this commission. And then you can
14 come back to us. We would like to help you find a
15 solution. And I -- I'm one of the ones on the fence,
16 so I'm speaking as a person who didn't know which way
17 to go.

18 MS. MANKOWSKI: Okay. Thank you very
19 much.

20 CHAIR MONTGOMERY: Bye.
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIPTION

I, Joseph Juvenson, do hereby certify that the provided audio recording media was transcribed by me or reduced to typewriting under my supervision, that said transcript is a true transcription of the audio recording; that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to the action involved in these proceedings; and, further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties thereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the action.

Joseph Juvenson

JOSEPH JUVENSON, Official Transcriptionist