

November 4, 2019



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on November 4, 2019 with a briefing at 11:06 a.m. in room 5ES, the public hearing at 1:26 p.m. in the Council Chambers in room 5ES of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Sam Childers	Diane Sherman
Krista De la Harpe	*Edward Stone
Rosemary Hinojosa	Courtney Spellicy
Evelyn Montgomery	Robert Swann
Donald Payton	Emily Williams – Chair
Leigh Richter	*Alicia Quintans
Katy Slade	*Elaine Velvin

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **No one**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **No one**

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:

Katherine Haskel
Elizabeth Mast

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing:

Katherine Haskel
Elizabeth Mast

The following Positions are vacant:

District 10
District 15

The following Staff was present:

Jennifer Anderson	Anna Lamberti Holmes
Liz Casso	Melissa Parent
Neva Dean	Marsha Prior
Elaine Hill	

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Public Testimony:

Approval of minutes – No Speakers

Recognition of Katherine Seale and her contributions and service to the Dallas Landmark Commission.

Speakers:

David Preziosi
Mattia Flabiano

Approval of Task Force members for CBD/Individual, West End, Fair Park, Junius Heights, Peak's Suburban/Edison La Vista, South Blvd/Park Row, State-Thomas/Wilson Block, Swiss/Munger Street, Wheatley/Tenth Street, and Winnetka Heights/Lake Cliff.

Speakers:

Alonso Harris

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda, C1 through C7, C9 through C11 followed by C8, D10, D1, D2, D3, D4, D5, D9 and the rest in their natural order.

Maker:	Spellicy				
Second:	Childers				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

CONSENT ITEMS

1. 1508 COMMERCE ST

Dallas Power & Light Building
CA190-009(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Install metal fence around courtyard at northwest corner of site – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install a new door opening on west elevation – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 4.2 for renovations to non-protected facades and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install black granite along the base of structure on the west and north elevations facing the patio – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 4.2 for renovations to non-protected facades and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. 3817 WENDELKIN ST

Big Spring Site
CA189-829(LC)
Liz Casso

Install detached sign with new landscaping in front yard - Approve – Approve with the condition that the sign be setback 15 feet from the public right-of way, with the finding that while the proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria section 10.1 which states that identification signs may be up to two feet in height, it is consistent with preservation criteria section 10.2 because it complies with the sign provisions of the Dallas City Code, and meets the criteria in section 41A-4.501(g)(6)(B) for Landmark Commission approval of work that does not strictly comply because the proposed work is historically accurate, is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria, and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

3. 3120 N HASKELL AVE

North Dallas High School
CA189-850(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Demolish three temporary classroom buildings using the standard demolition of a non-contributing structure because it is newer than the period of significance – Approve – The demolition meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structures are noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structures are newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay district; and demolition of the structures will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

4. 3120 N HASKELL AVE

North Dallas High School

CA190-012 (LC)

Liz Casso

1. Remove existing one-story rear addition – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Construct a storm shelter addition on rear elevation – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with sections 9.3, 9.4, 9.5, 9.6, 9.8 and 9.9 for new construction and additions and meets the standards in standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Reconfigure parking lot and building service area, including associated landscaping and metal screening around the new service area – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 3.3 for building site, section 3.5 for mechanical equipment screening, section 3.6(b) for landscaping, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Regrade and reconfigure sports field – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install new metal fencing. – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 3.7(c) for fences and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Replace existing pole sign in front yard with new electronic marquee sign – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 10.1 and 10.2 for signs and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
7. Install metal railing on sidewalk at south elevation – Approve with conditions – Approve drawings dated 10/7/19 with the conditions that a variance from the Board of Adjustment and a right-of-way license agreement with the City of Dallas is obtained prior to installation, with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(G)(6)(c)(i).

5. 1933 ELM ST

Harwood Historic District

CA190-011(LC)

Liz Casso

1. Modify existing front step and construct an accessible ramp at south elevation – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the condition that a variance from the Board of Adjustment and a right-of-way license agreement with the City of Dallas is obtained prior to installation, with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install two flat attached signs on south elevation – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 7.1 for signs and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. Install blade sign on south elevation – Approve with conditions – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19, with the condition that a right-of-way license agreement from the City of Dallas is obtained prior to installation, with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 7.1 for signs and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. 5835 REIGER AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA190-024(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Construct 600 sq. ft. accessory structure – Approve – Approve drawings and specifications dated 11-4-19 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 9.1 through 9.9 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

7. 2205 BOLL ST., #C

State Thomas Historic District
CA190-010(LC)
Liz Casso

Install roof mounted solar system on unit C – Approve – Approve drawings and specifications dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 51P-225.109(a)(14)(D)(ii) for solar panels and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

8. 1220 NORTH ST (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District
CA190-020(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Remove additions on right and left side of front elevation.
2. Replace five windows with wood double hung six-over-one windows and add two wood double hung six-over-one windows.
3. Relocate front entry to original location and install salvaged wood panel door.
4. Install board and batten siding.
5. Replace roof shingles.

Speakers:	For:	Mark Martinek
	Against:	No one

Motion

1. Remove additions on right and left side of front elevation – Approve - Approve drawing dated 11/4/19 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace five windows with wood double hung six-over-one windows and add two wood double hung six-over-one windows – Approve – Approve drawing dated 11/4/19 and photo of salvaged windows with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. Relocate front entry to original location and install salvaged wood panel door – Approve – Approve drawing dated 11/4/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install board and batten siding – Approve – Approve proposed work with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.9 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Replace roof shingles – Approve – Approve roof specifications dated 11/4/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.19 and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

9. 1701 N MARKET ST

West End Historic District
CA190-014(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Replace 42 steel windows on north, west and east elevations with aluminum windows – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 5.5 for window setback and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace six wood windows on north elevation, 1st floor, with aluminum windows – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 5.5 for window setback and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

10. 3735 HAVANA ST

Wheatley Place Historic District
CA190-017(MP)
Marsha Prior

Re-install brick chimney on front elevation – Approve with conditions – Approve rebuilding chimney with the condition that brick salvaged from the chimney demolition is used, that the chimney has the same dimensions and profile as original, and that same brick inset as the original chimney is installed with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 4.1(a) and 4.1(b), and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 217 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA189-835(MLP)

Melissa Parent

1. Replace existing asbestos siding on rear accessory structure with new teardrop wood siding
Approve - Approve photos dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Remove one window and one door opening on front facade of rear accessory structure -
Approve - Approve drawings dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
3. Replace garage door on rear accessory structure with new garage door - Approve - Approve drawings and specifications dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. 717 RIDGEWAY ST

Junius Heights Historic District

CA189-026(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

1. Construct addition and dormers.
2. Replace missing and damaged brick.
3. Install walkway and walkway tiles in front yard.
4. Install patio on front elevation.
5. Remove three windows on front facade and replace with French Doors.
6. Remove three windows on front facade and replace with French doors or three wood windows.
7. Replace 25 windows on the main structure.
8. Remove five windows on north elevation.
9. Remove three windows on south elevation.
10. Remove two windows on rear elevation.
11. Relocate door on north side.
12. Replace window on rear elevation with French doors.
13. Install siding on rear and side elevations.
14. Paint main structure. Body (brick): Benjamin Moore HC-167 "Amherst Grey;" Trim: Dunn Edwards DEA187 "Black;" Accent 1: Benjamin Moore HC-181 "Heritage Red;" Accent 2: Dunn Edwards DET-649 "Carrara."
15. Paint accessory structure. Body: Benjamin Moore HC-167 "Amherst Grey;" Trim: Dunn Edwards DEA-187 "Black."
16. Install Brava cedar shake roof tile in color "Aged Brava."

Speakers: For: Yvonne Wong

Against: No One

Motion

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, November 4, 2019

1. Construct addition and dormers – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 8.3(b) stating that additions must be in the Craftsman or Tudor style typical to contributing main buildings within this tract and have brick veneer on the front and side facades. It is also not consistent with preservation criteria Section 8.5 stating that the massing, shape, building and roof form, materials, solid-to-void ratios, details, color, and general appearance of additions must be compatible with the existing historic structure.
2. Replace missing and damaged brick – Deny – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(d) stating that brick added to protected facades must match the original brick as closely as possible in color, texture, module size, bond pattern, and mortar color and because the utility brick size proposed does not match the original standard size brick on the main structure.
3. Install walkway and walkway tiles in front yard – Deny – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 stating that new sidewalks and walkways must be constructed of brick, brush finish concrete, stone, or other appropriate material and that replacement of existing walkways and steps must be consistent with the original style, and because the materials proposed are not appropriate for the Tudor style architecture or the historic district.
4. Install patio on front elevation – Deny – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(a) stating that the front facade is a protected facade or with Section 7.4 stating that front porch floor finishes must be concrete, wood, or other appropriate materials and because the material proposed for the porch floor is not appropriate for the Tudor architectural style or the historic overlay district. It is also not consistent with City Code Section 51A-4.501(e)(4)(C) stating that the addition of conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings will not be undertaken.
5. Remove three windows on front facade and replace with French Doors – Deny – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(a) stating that the front facade is a protected facade or with Section 5.1 stating that historic windows must remain intact and their openings must be preserved on protected facades except that they may be replaced if necessary due to damage or deterioration. It is also not consistent with Section 5.3 stating that replacement windows must express mullion size, light configuration, and material to match the original; and it is also not consistent with Section 5.7 stating that new door openings in protected facades are permitted only where there is evidence that historic openings have been filled or the safety of life is protected.
6. Remove three windows on front facade and replace with French doors or three wood windows – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with Section 5.1 stating that historic windows must remain intact and their openings must be preserved on protected facades except that they may be replaced if necessary due to damage or deterioration and because the applicant did not provide enough evidence to justify replacement of the windows; because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(a) stating that the front façade is a protected façade; because it is inconsistent with Section 5.1 stating that historic windows must remain intact and their openings must be preserved on protected facades except that they may be replaced if necessary due to damage or deterioration. It is also not consistent with Section 5.3 stating that replacement windows must express mullion size, light configuration, and material to

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, November 4, 2019

match the original; and it is also not consistent with Section 5.7 stating that new door openings in protected facades are permitted only where there is evidence that historic openings have been filled or the safety of life is protected.

7. Replace 25 windows on the main structure – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof necessary to justify the work since sufficient evidence was not submitted to justify replacement, measurements were not provided to ensure that the windows sizes will not be altered, and accurate cut sheets were not provided.
8. Remove five windows on north elevation – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.1 stating that historic windows must remain intact and their openings must be preserved on protected facades except that they may be replaced if necessary due to damage or deterioration.
9. Remove three windows on south elevation – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work.
10. Remove two windows on rear elevation – Approve – Approve plans dated 11-4-19 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i)
11. Relocate door on north side – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.1 stating that historic doors must remain intact and their openings must be preserved on protected facades except that they may be replaced if necessary due to damage or deterioration.
12. Replace window on rear elevation with French doors – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof necessary to justify the work since accurate cut sheets were not provided.
13. Install siding on rear and side elevations – Deny – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.2 stating that all additions and alterations must be architecturally sensitive and appropriate to the overall design of the existing structure and because neither the wood siding or Hardiboard siding proposed is appropriate for a Tudor style structure or the historic overlay district; and it is also not consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.5 stating that historic materials must be repaired when possible and replaced only when necessary.
14. Paint main structure. Body (brick): Benjamin Moore HC 167 "Amherst Grey;" Trim: Dunn Edwards DEA187 "Black;" Accent 1: Benjamin Moore HC-181 "Heritage Red;" Accent 2: Dunn Edwards DET-649 "Carrara" – Deny – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(e) stating that brick, cast stone, and concrete elements on protected facades may not be painted except that portions of the structure that had been painted prior to the effective date of the ordinance may remain painted and because the brick is not currently painted.
15. Paint accessory structure. Body: Benjamin Moore HC-167 "Amherst Grey;" Trim: Dunn Edwards DEA-187 "Black" – Deny – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 9.2 stating that accessory structures must be compatible in color with the main building.

				Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	- 0	
		Absent:	- 2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	- 2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

3. 4902 WORTH ST

Munger Place Historic District
CA190-016(MLP)
Melissa Parent

1. Install new Carrera tile slab above front entry facade on main structure.
2. Replace lights on front porch and balcony ceilings with new brush brass light.
3. Install two new sconce lights along front entrance of main structure and replace rear entrance light with new sconce light.
4. Install new Carrera tile to front entrance steps and cheekwall on main structure.
5. Install new Saltillo tile on front concrete walkway.
6. Install new 0'-8" raised concrete cheekwall with Saltillo tile cap along front walkway.
7. Install new antique brush brass house numbers on front of main structure.

Speakers:	For:	No one
	Against:	No one

Motion

1. Install new Carrera tile slab above front entry facade on main structure - Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because tile on the front façade would have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure and on the historic overlay district.
2. Replace lights on front porch and balcony ceilings with new brush brass light – Deny without prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) on the basis that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure and the historic overlay district.
3. Install two new sconce lights along front entrance of main structure and replace rear entrance light with new sconce light – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) on the basis that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure and the historic overlay district.
4. Install new Carrera tile to front entrance steps and cheekwall on main structure – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because tile on the front entrance steps would have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.
5. Install new Saltillo tile on front concrete walkway – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because tile on public and private walkways/sidewalks and concrete caps on waterfall steps would have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.
6. Install new 0'-8" raised concrete cheekwall with Saltillo tile cap along front walkway – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-

consistent with preservation criteria Sections 2.11 and 2.12 and meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4. Install concrete patio and driveway – Approve with conditions – Approve site plan dated 11/4/19 with the condition that material is brush finish concrete with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.3 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Hinojosa				
Second:	Montgomery				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

5. 4817 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA190-023(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Install landscaping in front yard.
2. Install landscaping in rear and side yards.
3. Install fence.
4. Construct pool with water feature in rear yard.

Speakers:	For:	Taylor Perrine
	Against:	No one

Motion

1. Install landscaping in front yard – Approve with conditions – Approve landscape plan dated 11/4/19 with the condition that the low volt light post is no more than 12” tall with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Install landscaping in rear and side yards – Approve - Approve landscape plan dated 11/4/19 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
3. Install fence – Approve – Approve with condition that the 9 wooden fences may extend on the right side of the house to the “red gate”, but must be 6’ wrought iron fence from the “red gate” to the porch with a metal horizontal cap per 2.14 addendum B.
4. Construct pool with water feature in rear yard – Approve – Approve pool and water feature as shown. Approve basketball court as shown. Lamp posts in front 50% denied. Lamp posts in rear 50% to be 9' max tall.

				Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	- 0	
		Absent:	- 2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	- 2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

8. 302 N CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA190-006(MLP)

Melissa Parent

Replace existing wood front porch floor with new Aeratis pvc flooring.

Speakers: For: Andrew Guy

 Against: No one

Motion

Replace existing wood front porch floor with new Aeratis pvc flooring - Denial without Prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria for alterations in Section 51P-87.111(a)(11)(E) that states “Each main building must have a front porch or entry treatment with a shape, roof form, materials, and colors that are typical of the style and period of the building. A front entrance or porch must reflect the dominant horizontal and vertical characteristics of the main building.”

Maker:	Spellicy			
Second:	Swann			
Results:	14/0			
		Ayes:	- 14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	- 0	
		Absent:	- 2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	- 2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

9. 314 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA190-007(MLP)

Melissa Parent

1. Replace front porch decking on main structure with new composite decking. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Enlarge concrete steps at front porch.

3. Install two new metal flowerbed planters in front yard. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. Install new wrought iron fence and gate in side yard.
5. Relocate existing wood gate 26'-6" closer to front facade. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness.
6. Install new gravel driveway ribbons.
7. Install gravel alongside front walkway.
8. Install 0'-4" stone edging along front sidewalk.

Speakers:	For:	Alexander Quintanilla
	Against:	No one

Motion

1. Replace front porch decking on main structure with new composite decking. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve with the condition a concrete porch is installed and there is no change in footprint.
2. Enlarge concrete steps at front porch - Approve - Approve photos dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for front entrances and porches in the preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(11)(E) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install two new metal flowerbed planters in front yard. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve with the condition flowerbeds to be no deeper than 36 inches.
4. Install new wrought iron fence and gate in side yard - Approve - Approve site plan dated 11/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fences in the preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(ii) with the finding that more screening is needed for an exterior A/C unit and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Relocate existing wood gate 26'-6" closer to front facade. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) on the basis that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure and on the historic overlay district.
6. Install new gravel driveway ribbons - Approve proposed work with the condition that gravel is to be the same as was approved for 406 S. Willomet in size and color to meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(b)(C)(i) and preservation criteria 51P-87.111(b)(9)(B)(iii) stating gravel must be compatible in texture, color and style with the main building.
7. Install gravel alongside front walkway – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) on the basis that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.
8. Install 0'-4" stone edging along front sidewalk – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) on the basis that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	De la harpe				
Results:	14/0				

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, November 4, 2019

		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

10. 3819 MAPLE AVENUE

Old Parkland Hospital
Z189-299(LC)
Liz Casso

Hearing to consider an application for an amendment to the preservation criteria of Historic Overlay No. 31, Old Parkland Hospital.

Speakers:	For:	Rob Baldwin Harlan Crow Craig Hamilton
	Against:	No One

Motion

Approval, subject to preservation criteria.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS

Motion

Approval of Minutes – October 7, 2019

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Swann				

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, November 4, 2019

Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

Motion

Removal of the task force members for Fair Park to be voted on separately.

Maker:	Spellicy				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

Motion

Approve the task force members for Fair Park.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	De la harpe				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

Commissioner Spellicy recused herself and did not hear or vote on this case.

Motion

Remove Wheatley/Tenth Street new task force member applications to be discussed.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

Motion

Approval of the new task force members for CBD/Individual/West End, Junius Heights, Peak Suburban/Edison LaVista, South Blvd/Park Row, State Thomas/Wilson Block, Swiss/Munger Street.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	De la harpe				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Quintans, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

Motion

Approve Wheatley/Tenth Street task force members as presented by staff.

Maker:	Spellicy				
Second:	Childers				
Results:	12/2				
		Ayes:	-	12	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Payton, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Quintans, Velvin, Williams

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, November 4, 2019

		Against:	-	2	Montgomery, Swann
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Mast
		Vacancies:	-	2	Dist. 10, Dist. 15

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing was adjourned at 5:11 P.M.

Emily Williams, Chair

Date