

December 4, 2017



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on December 4, 2017 with a briefing at 11:02 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:21 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

*John Allender
Michael Amonett
Diane Bumpas
*Sam Childers
Krista De La Harpe

Rosemary Hinojosa
Mattia Flabiano
Adam McGill
Evelyn Montgomery
Donald Payton

Katherine Seale, Chair
*Diane Sherman
Courtney Spellicy
Robert Swann
Emily Williams

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: No one

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **Paul Ridley**

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **No one**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: **Courtney Spellicy**

The following Position is vacant: District 3, and District 12

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty
Jennifer Anderson

Marsha Prior
Liz Casso

Theresa Pham
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to move Consent Item #1 to the Discussion agenda.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Motion was made to move Discussion Item D11 to the Consent agenda.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Motion was made to approve C2 – C14 and D11 following staff recommendation.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take C1, D1, D2, D3, D4, D5, D6, D8, D9, D10, D13 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

1. 1312 S ERVAY ST (Moved to Discussion)

Ambassador Hotel
CA178-082(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Restoration of the exterior stucco and masonry substrate.
2. Repair/replacement of all windows and doors.
3. Install new metal canopies at the north, south and west entries.
4. Construct elevator enclosure addition and new stairs at 6th floor terrace.
5. Construct patio, steps, ramp and pool deck at west elevation.
6. Install new landscape and hardscape.
7. Partial removal of perimeter wall.
8. Install new fencing.

Speakers: For: Paul Baca
Against: No one

Motion #1:

1. Restoration of the exterior stucco and masonry substrate. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the condition that final paint colors are submitted following mock-up for final approvals and come back.
2. Repair/replacement of all windows and doors. – Approve with condition that final paint colors are submitted following mock-up for final approvals and come back.
3. Install new metal canopies at the north, south and west entries. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Construct elevator enclosure addition and new stairs at 6th floor terrace. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Construct patio, steps, ramp and pool deck at west elevation. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Install new landscape and hardscape. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 6 for lighting and landscaping and Section 7 for public improvements, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
7. Partial removal of perimeter wall. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
8. Install new fencing. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	2/13				
		Ayes:	-	2	Flabiano, McGill
		Against:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Motion Failed.

Motion #2:

1. Restoration of the exterior stucco and masonry substrate. – Approve with conditions that final paint colors are submitted following mock-up.
2. Repair/replacement of all windows and doors. – Approve with conditions that final paint colors are submitted following mock-up.
3. Install new metal canopies at the north, south and west entries. Deny without prejudice with the finding of fact that the design as submitted is not compatible with the historic district.
4. Construct elevator enclosure addition and new stairs at 6th floor terrace. – Deny without prejudice with the finding that insufficient information was provided regarding the design and detailing of the roof.
5. Construct patio, steps, ramp and pool deck at west elevation. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. Install new landscape and hardscape. – Deny without prejudice with the finding of fact that the proposed plant material of native grasses are not compatible with the historic overlay.
7. Partial removal of perimeter wall. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
8. Install new fencing. – Approve drawings dated 11/8/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	*Allender				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

2. 5402 JUNIUS ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA178-083(MP)
Marsha Prior

Construct accessory structure in rear yard – Approve with conditions – Approve plans dated 11/15/2017 with the condition the accessory structure does not exceed the main structure in height and the roof shingles match that of the main structure in material, color, and style with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 9.2, 9.4, 9.8, and 9.9 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. 5307 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CD178-004(MP)
Marsha Prior

Demolish accessory structure using the standard "noncontributing structure because newer than period of significance". Approve – The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structure is noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structure is newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay district; and demolition of the structure will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

4. 201 E 6TH ST

Lake Cliff Historic District

CA178-095(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

1. Install wood columns on front porch – Approve plans dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(b) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace front door – Approve specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.1 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install four gable vents – Approve plans dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(b) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Construct addition and porch in rear – Approve with Conditions – Approve plans and specifications dated 11-13-17 with the condition that the windows installed are 1/1 wood windows with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 9 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install 8' wood fence in side and rear yard – Approve site plan and specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.11(d) and City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Install 3'6" picket fence in front and side yard – Approve site plan dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.11(a) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
7. Install brush concrete driveway in rear yard – Approve site plan dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.3 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
8. Remove walkway in front yard – Approve – The proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5. 222 E 6TH ST

Lake Cliff Historic District

CA178-097(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Install Royal Sovereign composition shingles in color "Charcoal" – Approve specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

6. 1207 ANNEX AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA178-091(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Construct deck on northwest side of main structure – Approve site plan and specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

7. 4722 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA178-086(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Install railing on front porch. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve - with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install 5" tongue and groove front porch flooring. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. - Approve with the finding the completed work is consistent with the criteria for porches and balconies in the preservation criteria Section 3.22, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Concrete float front and rear porch steps. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Remove muntin and mullion patterns from front windows. – Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fenestration and openings in the preservation criteria Section 3.10, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Construct 20"x20" porte cochere columns. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Install railing on porte cochere. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
7. Construct balcony on rear elevation. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
8. Replace door and window trim. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
9. Install Hardiboard skirting. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve as completed with the finding that although the proposed work does not comply with Section 3.6 that states imitation materials are allowed on accessory structures only if they are in keeping with the style and materials on the main structure, it meets the criteria for landmark commission approval of work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the completed work is historically accurate, it is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.
10. Construct brick cheekwalls to match existing. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

8. 4722 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CD178-002(MD)

Mark Doty

Demolish accessory structure using standard 'non-contributing to historic overlay district.' Work completed without a Certificate for Demolition. – Approve - The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structure is noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structure is newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay

district; and demolition of the structure will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

9. 4422 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA178-090(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

1. Install ribbon driveway – Approve site plan dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Construct front walk and walk from garage to porte cochere – Approve – Approve site plan dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

10. 4500 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA178-093(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

1. Install new front and rear doors – Approve specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install new decorative lighting at front door – Approve specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.5 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install new security lighting – Approve specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.5 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 4705 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA178-085(MD)

Mark Doty

Construct two-story single family residential structure. – Approve drawings and specifications dated 11/15/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for new construction and additions in the preservation criteria Sections 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 4.6, 4.8, and 4.9, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

12. 426 S CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA178-094(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

1. Construct accessory structure – Approve site plan and specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(1) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install 8' wood fence – Approve site plan dated 11-13-17 with the finding that although the proposed work does not comply with Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(iii) stating that fences in the cornerside facade must not be directly in front of the cornerside facade, it meets the criteria for landmark commission approval of work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the proposed work is historically accurate, it

is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

13. 204 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA178-100(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Install addition in rear – Approve plans dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(2) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Enclose carport and install garage doors – Approve plans dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(1) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Paint main and accessory structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body and trim: "Tawny Owl;" Accent: "Tavern Oak" – Approve paint specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

14. 107 N WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA178-098(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Construct accessory structure – Approve plans dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(1) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 2501 N HARWOOD ST

St. Ann’s School
CA178-076(LC)
Liz Casso

Construct a one-story covered patio addition on east elevation. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Kenneth Demko
Against: No one

Motion:

Construct a one-story covered patio addition on east elevation. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve as submitted with the finding of fact that the minimal attachment to the building will not have an adverse effect on the historic structure.**

Maker:	McGill				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	14/1				

		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	1	*Sherman
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

2. 1800 MAIN ST

Mercantile Bank Building
CA178-084(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Replace front doors and transoms at northwest corner of structure with new steel doors.
2. Modify storefront windows on north elevation.
3. Install steel awning along north elevation, northwest corner, and west elevation.

Speakers: For: Zac Porter
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace front doors and transoms at northwest corner of structure with new steel doors. – Approve drawings dated 11/22/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) **with the condition that the replacement doors match the building's existing mullion color.**
2. Modify storefront windows on north elevation. – Approve drawings dated 11/22/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with Sections 6.4 and 6.6 for fenestration and openings, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) **with the condition that the windows on storefront match the building's existing mullion color, that the window glass proportion remain the same and not be subdivided with mullions, and windows may be operable sliding glass windows.**
3. Install steel awning along north elevation, northwest corner, and west elevation. – Approve drawings dated 11/22/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with Section 6.7 for awnings, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) **with condition that the steel awning match Sherwin Williams color – SW-6804-Dignity Blue.**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Williams				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

3. 714 HUNTLEY ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA178-088(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Create opening on front porch and install: Option a) French doors to match existing secondary front doors; or Option b) 9-lite door to match existing primary front door.
2. Resize windows and locations on right side and rear elevations.

Speakers: For: Donnie Mixon
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Create opening on front porch and install: Option a) French doors to match existing secondary front doors; or Option b) 9-lite door to match existing primary front door – **Approve with the conditions that the applicant uses Option B and based on photographic evidence submitted by applicant 12-4-2017.**
2. Resize windows and locations on right side and rear elevations – **Approve drawings dated 11/15/17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8.5 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).**

Maker:	Williams				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

4. 717 LIPSCOMB AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA178-072(MP)
Marsha Prior

Paint brick on main structure and wood trim. Brand: Behr, Body - HDC-CT 03 "Candlewick." Brand: Behr, Trim - Ultra Base 4850 "Ultra Pure White." Brand: Sherwin Williams, Accent - Custom Color "Graphic Coal." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Jessica Brazeal
Against: No one

Motion #1:

Paint brick on main structure and wood trim. Brand: Behr, Body - HDC-CT 03 "Candlewick." Brand: Behr, Trim - Ultra Base 4850 "Ultra Pure White." Brand: Sherwin Williams, Accent - Custom Color "Graphic Coal." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny** – The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501 (g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not

consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(e) which states that brick on protected facades may not be painted.

Maker:	*Sherman				
Second:	*Childers				
Results:	2/13				
		Ayes:	-	2	*Sherman, *Allender
		Against:	-	13	Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

***Motion Failed.**

Motion #2:

Paint brick on main structure and wood trim. Brand: Behr, Body - HDC-CT 03 "Candlewick." Brand: Behr, Trim - Ultra Base 4850 "Ultra Pure White." Brand: Sherwin Williams, Accent - Custom Color "Graphic Coal." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – Deny without prejudice with the finding of fact that it does adversely affect the historic streetscape, but we request that owner experiment with removal of paint and report back to us because the completed work is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(e) which states that brick on protected facades may not be painted.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	13/2				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	2	*Sherman, Hinojosa
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

5. 5415 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA178-118(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Replace 16 windows with wood double-hung windows. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Install one gable window. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Install one window. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Cris Lamont
Against: Laura Koppang

Motion:

1. Replace 16 windows with wood double-hung windows. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501 (g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant has not provided sufficient information to meet the burden of proof required to justify the proposed work.
2. Install one gable window. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501 (g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant has not provided sufficient information to meet the burden of proof required to justify the proposed work.
3. Install one window. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501 (g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant has not provided sufficient information to meet the burden of proof required to justify the proposed work.

Maker:	Allender				
Second:	*Sherman				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

6. 5307 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA178-104(MP)
Marsha Prior

Speakers: For: Tam Pham
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Build rear addition to main structure – **Approve with conditions** – Approve drawings and specifications dated 11/15/17 with the condition that the siding is an exact match in material, profile, and dimension, and that the window trim is an exact match in material and style to the existing, historic window trim with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Repair and replace windows – **Approve with conditions** – Approve with condition that Window #1 thru 11 and Window #27 and 28 are repaired and that Window #29 and 30 are replaced with 4/1 wood windows that are an exact match to historic Windows #1 and 2 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

3. Replace front door – **Approve Alternative Door No. 2** with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
4. Construct accessory structure – Approve with conditions – Approve drawings dated 11/15/17 with the condition that the height of the accessory structure does not exceed the height of the main structure with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) **and with the condition that if egress in the accessory structure is required by Building Inspection, the Landmark Commission will allow the entry door on any of the sides.**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Williams				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

7. 119 E 6TH ST

Lake Cliff Historic District
CA178-092(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Replace vinyl skirting with white lattice on east, west, and rear sides.
2. Install and 8-0' wood board-on-board fence in side yard.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace vinyl skirting with white lattice on east, west, and rear sides – **Deny without Prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(b) stating that reconstruction and renovation of protected facades must be appropriate and must employ materials similar to the historic materials in texture, color, pattern, grain, and module size.
2. Install and 8-0' wood board-on-board fence in side yard – **Deny without Prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.11(b) stating that interior side yard fences that are located in the front 50% must be at least 70% open.

Maker:	Williams				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	14/0				

		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

8. 5201 TREMONT ST

Munger Place Historic District
CA178-080(LC)
Liz Casso

Install a freestanding mailbox at the front property line. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Christopher Long
Against: No one

Motion:

Install a freestanding mailbox at the front property line. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve with the condition that applicant locate the mailbox away from the sidewalk and within 25% of the front building face in one of the following locations: Option A, near intersection of walkway and driveway beside curved bench; or Option B, near the potted plant on the right side of the front porch landing.**

Maker:	Williams				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

9. 4417 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA178-073(MD)
Mark Doty

1. Remove two windows on west elevation.
2. Replace windows with wood, one-over-one windows. Working partially completed.
3. Install wood siding on front and side elevations. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. Install new front door, sidelights, and transom window. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness application.

5. Install Hardi-board siding on rear elevation. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
6. Install 6" Cedar shingles on front dormer.
7. Install multi-light window in rear dormer. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Alex Simon
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Remove two windows on west elevation. – **Approve drawing dated 11/15/17 with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).**
2. Replace windows with wood, one-over-one windows. Working partially completed. – **Approve with conditions - Approve specifications dated 11/15/17 with the condition the original window trim profile is recreated with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).**
3. Install wood siding on front and side elevations. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – **Approve with the finding of fact that the partially completed work is compatible with and does not negatively affect the historic overlay district.**
4. Install new front door, sidelights, and transom window. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness application. – **Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).**
5. Install Hardi-board siding on rear elevation. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. - **Approve with the condition that the Hardi Board is installed smooth side out.**
6. Install 6" Cedar shingles on front dormer. – **Approve with conditions - Approve proposed work with the condition that the existing window trim is left in place, with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).**
7. Install multi-light window in rear dormer. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – **Deny without prejudice - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) on the basis that style of window is not compatible with the historic overlay district with the finding of fact that multi-light windows are not appropriate and one over one window is more appropriate. Applicant to resubmit with a more appropriate window.**

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Amonett, Bumpas,*Childers, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Reichel, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	3, and 12

10. 2314 SOUTH BLVD

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District
CA178-075(MP)
Marsha Prior
Construct two-story house and accessory structure.

Speakers: For: Barry Brewer
Against: No one

*Commissioner Childers was excused and left the meeting for the day.

Motion:

Construct two-story house and accessory structure – Deny without prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the floor plate heights are not compatible with the historic district and with the finding of fact that more information is needed regarding floor to floor height, porch condition and building setback.

Maker:	*Allender				
Second:	*Sherman				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

11. 6333 BRYAN PKWY (Moved to Consent)

Swiss Avenue Historic District
CA178-079(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Remove window opening on north elevation and infill with brick. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Remove window opening on west elevation and infill with brick. Work initiated without Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

12. 123 ANTHONY ST

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District
CA178-074(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Install Hardie board siding on rear elevation.
2. Install new front and rear doors.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion #1:

1. Install Hardie board siding on rear elevation – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the criteria in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the proposed Hardie board is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.9 which states that restoring original historic finish materials is encouraged.
2. Install new front and rear doors – **Approve** specifications dated 11/15/17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	*Allender				
Second:	*Sherman				
Results:	6/8				
		Ayes:	-	6	*Allender, Bumpas, Payton, *Sherman, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	8	Hinojosa, Montgomery, Amonett, Flabiano, Seale, De La Harpe, Mcgill, Spellicy
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Motion Failed.

Motion #2:

1. Install Hardie board siding on rear elevation – **Approved with the finding of fact the work will not have an adverse effect on the historic district and the property is in the process of court ordered demolition.**
2. Install new front and rear doors – **Approved with the finding of fact the work will not have an adverse effect on the historic district and the property is in the process of court ordered demolition.**

Maker:	Amonett				
Second:	Spellicy				
Results:	12/2				
		Ayes:	-	12	Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	2	*Allender, *Sherman
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

13. 110 S CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA178-096(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Construct addition in rear.
2. Replace front door.
3. Install porch railing and column on front porch.
4. Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body: SW3264 "Hunters Pointe" or SW3263 "Farm to Table;" Trim: SW4066 "Pure and Simple;" Exterior Door: SW7591 "Red Barn" or Glidden 09YR 0/305 "Classic Burgundy."

Speakers: For: Gabriel Santos
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Construct addition in rear – Approve with Conditions – Approve plans dated 11-13-17 with the condition that the siding and windows are wood with the finding that the proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) and roof is to match existing home.
2. Replace front door – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since no report on the condition of the existing door was submitted. Applicant to resubmit.
3. Install porch railing and column on front porch – Approve with the condition that the rail and columns will be installed per drawings dated 11-13-17 and not as currently installed.
4. Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body: SW3264 "Hunters Pointe" or SW3263 "Farm to Table;" Trim: SW4066 "Pure and Simple;" Exterior Door: SW7591 "Red Barn" or Glidden 09YR 0/305 "Classic Burgundy" – Approve specifications dated 11-13-17 with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	13/1				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, , Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	1	*Sherman
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Motion was made to the take Task Force and Designation applications next on the agenda following by the remaining items on the agenda.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La

					Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

14. 310 N EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA178-099(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Install 4" Hardiboard skirting.
2. Paint main structure. Brand: Behr. Body: PPU18-02 "Pencil Point;" Trim: 720C-2 "Chocolate Froth;" Accent: PPU18-19 "Intellectual;" Porch floor stain: ST-134 "Curry."

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install 4" Hardiboard skirting – **Recommend denial of Hardiboard for skirt. There are no Hardiboard detail or dimensions close to 117 novelty siding. Also no evidence of damage/deterioration. Please provide photos/evidence.**
2. Paint main structure. Brand: Behr. Body: PPU18-02 "Pencil Point;" Trim: 720C-2 "Chocolate Froth;" Accent: PPU18-19 "Intellectual;" Porch floor stain: ST-134 "Curry" – **Approve body color and trim color but not the accent color.**

Maker:	*Sherman				
Second:	McGill				
Results:	12/2				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	2	Hinojosa, Spellicy
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

15. 312 N ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA178-089(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson
Install chimney cap.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

Install chimney cap – Approve image labeled "4th choice brown or copper" and dated 11-13-17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	*Sherman				
Second:	*Allender				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

MISCELLANEOUS ITEM:

Waiver of the one-year time limit on the final decision of a denied certificate of appropriateness requesting to paint previously painted concrete on the front porch floor of 5614 Swiss Avenue (CA167-538(EH)).

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

To waive the one-year time limit on the final decision of a denied certificate of appropriateness requesting to paint previously painted concrete on the front porch floor of 5614 Swiss Avenue (CA167-538(EH)).

Maker:	*Sherman				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS:

Approval of Minutes from November 6, 2017.

Maker:	McGill				
--------	--------	--	--	--	--

Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Approval of Task Force members for Swiss Avenue and Munger Place Historic Districts.

Speakers: For: Jill Donaldson, Paul Ridley, Christopher Hart, Beth Bradley
Against: No one

Motion:

Approval of Task Force members for Swiss Avenue and Munger Place Historic Districts

Maker:	McGill				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Montgomery, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	*Childers
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

Motion:

Approval of Designation Committee

***Commissioners Amonett and Montgomery recused themselves and did not vote on this matter.**

Maker:	McGill				
Second:	Flabiano				
Results:	12/0				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Bumpas, Flabiano, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, McGill, Payton, Seale, *Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	*Childers, Amonett, Montgomery
		Vacancies:	-	3	3, 12, and 14

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at 6:26 P.M.

Katherine Seale, Chair

Date