

December 6, 2021



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on December 6, 2021 with a briefing at 10:40 a.m. and the Public Hearing at 1:10 p.m. online with WebEx.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

Sam Childers – Dist. 11	Louis Renaud – Dist. 9
Jeff Cummings – Alt. Position 3	Reagan Rothenberger – Dist. 12
Mark Guest – Dist. 14	Diane Sherman – Dist. 1
Katherine Haskel – Chair – Dist. 3	Katy Slade – Dist. 13
Rosemary Hinojosa, Dist. 6	Courtney Spellicy – Dist. 8
Evelyn Montgomery – Vice Chair – Dist. 2	Robert Swann – Dist. 4
Larry Offutt – Dist. 5	Elaine Velvin, Dist. 15

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **No one**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **No one**

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:
No one

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing:
No one

The following Positions are vacant:

Districts 7 and 10

The following Staff was present:

Trevor Brown	Murray Miller
Liz Casso	Marsha Prior-Robertson
Elaine Hill	Bertram Vandenberg

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, December 6, 2021

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Public Testimony:

No speakers

Approval of Minutes – November 1, 2021

Motion was made to move consent items C7, C8 and C9 to the Discussion Agenda.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Childers				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

Motion was made to approve Consent items, C1 – C6, C10, C13, C14 and C15 following staff recommendations.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Childers				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

Motion was made to approve Consent items, C11 and C12 following staff recommendations.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Childers				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

Commissioner Sherman did not hear or vote on these items

Motion was made to re-order the Discussion Agenda and hear items, C8, C9, D1, D2, D4, D6, C7, D3, and D5.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Childers				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

CONSENT ITEMS

1. 2807 HARRY HINES BLVD

Pike Park
CA212-057(LC)
Liz Casso

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a bronze sculpture south of Santos Rodriguez Center be **approved** in accordance with drawings dated 12/6/21.

2. 1907 ELM ST

Harwood Historic District, Majestic Theatre
CA212-055(LC)

Liz Casso

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a flat attached sign on south elevation be **approved** in accordance with drawings dated 12/6/21.

3. 507 S HARWOOD ST

Harwood Historic District

CA212-056(LC)

Liz Casso

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install handrails on existing front steps on east elevation be **approved** in accordance with drawings dated 12/6/21.
2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a concrete ramp at rear entrance on west elevation be **approved** in accordance with drawings dated 12/6/21

4. 6032 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District

CA212-069(TB)

Trevor Brown

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace concrete lead walk and step be **approved with Condition** in accordance with the drawings dated 12/6/2021 with the condition that the lead walk is straight from the front porch to the sidewalk and that the drawings be revised accordingly and resubmitted to the Office of Historic Preservation prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new concrete porch and steps be **approved** in accordance with the drawings dated 12/6/2021.
3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new porch post be **approved** in accordance with the drawings dated 12/6/2021.
4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new brick path be **approved** in accordance with the drawings dated 12/6/2021.

5. 2525 PARK ROW AVE

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District

CA212-067(MP)

Marsha Prior

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install salvaged wood windows where windows had been previously bricked in be **approved with conditions** that the salvaged windows are one-over-one wood windows.

6. 4615 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA202-012(MP)

Marsha Prior

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear addition be **approved** in accordance with the drawings dated 12/6/2021.

7. 4937 SWISS AVE (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA212-059(MLP)

Melissa Parent

A Certificate of Appropriateness to install new front yard Landscaping.

Speakers: For: No Speakers
Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new front yard landscaping be **approved** in accordance with plan dated 12/6/2021 with the condition that all East Palatka Holly trees be maintained as shrubs as to not obscure the primary facade.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

8. 338 S FLEMING AVE (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District
CA212-066(MP)

Marsha Prior

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-story main structure.

Speakers: For: Annemarie Bristow
Randy Shear
Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-story main structure be **Denied without prejudice** as it will have a negative effect on the district, because the existing building is potentially a contributing structure currently called a non-contributing structure.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Renaud				
Results:	14/0				

		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

9. 338 S FLEMING AVE (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District
CD212-006(MP)
Marsha Prior

A Certificate for Demolition to demolish a noncontributing structure using the standard 'replace with more appropriate/compatible structure.'

Speakers: For: Annemarie Bristow
Randy Shear
Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the Certificate for Demolition to demolish a noncontributing structure using the standard 'replace with more appropriate/compatible structure be **denied without prejudice** with the finding of fact a determination of contributing status has not yet been determined and such an assessment would need to be conducted with the overview, and as per outlined by, the Director of the Office of Historic Preservation.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

10. 311 N MARKET ST

West End Historic District
CA212-054(LC)
Liz Casso

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a flat attached sign on east elevation be **approved** in accordance with drawings dated 12/6/21.

11. 106 N CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-061(MLP)
Trevor Brown

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to:

1. construct new rear accessory structure be approved in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 12/6/2021 **approved with the condition** that the all railings be constructed entirely of wood and compatible with detailing of original railings in the district and that the drawings be revised accordingly and resubmitted to the Office of Historic Preservation prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. install wood railing on front porch of main structure be approved in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 12/6/2021 **approved with the condition** that the railing height not exceed the height of the window sills under the porch and that the drawings be revised accordingly and resubmitted to the Office of Historic Preservation prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. install wood railing on front porch of main structure be approved in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 12/6/2021 **approved with the condition** that the railing height not exceed the height of the window sills under the porch and that the drawings be revised accordingly and resubmitted to the Office of Historic Preservation prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. paint the main and accessory structure body Behr NA470-2 "Oceanic Climate," and trim Behr PPU18-06 "Ultra-Pure White" be **approved**.

Commissioner Sherman did not hear or vote on this item

12. 106 N CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CD212-004(MLP)
Melissa Parent

That the request for a Certificate of Demolition to demolish under standard "Replace with more appropriate/compatible structure" be **approved**.

Commissioner Sherman did not hear or vote on this item

13. 333 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-063(MLP)
Melissa Parent

Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Main: SW9139 "Debonair." Trim: SW7070 "Site White." Accent: SW6237 "Dark Night" be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 12/6/21.

14. 1107 W JEFFERSON BLVD

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-065(MLP)
Melissa Parent

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint the main structure: Brand: Sherwin Williams, Main: SW6212 "Quietude," Fascia and Trim: SW7623 "Cascades," Front door: SW6746 "Julep" be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 12/6/21.

15. 222 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-062(MLP)
Melissa Parent

Paint main and rear accessory structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Main: SW9141 "Waterloo." Trim and porch rails: SW6239 "Upward." Accent: SW2819 "Downing Slate" be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 12/6/21.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. 5833 COLUMBIA AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA212-070(MGM)
Murray G. Miller

A Certificate of Appropriateness to Construct a new single-family residence.

Speakers: For: Tam Pham
Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new single-family residence at 5833 Columbia Avenue be denied without prejudice, Per Staff Recommendation and for the reasons outlined in the Case Analysis as well as the referenced sections of the code with the finding of fact the design is not commensurate with the character and appearance of the district.

Maker:	Sherman					
Second:	Renaud					
Results:	14/0					
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin	
		Against:	-	0		
		Absent:	-	0		
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10	

2. 5012 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District
CA212-064(MGM)
Murray G. Miller

A Certificate of Appropriateness to:

1. replace existing pedestrian doors on rear elevation of accessory structure with new bifold "nana wall" swing doors.
2. replace garage doors on front elevation of rear accessory structure with 3-ganged window. Infill with siding to match.

Speakers: For: Travis Ripley, Ripley Renovations LLC

Against: No Speakers

Motion #1

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace existing pedestrian doors on rear elevation of accessory structure with a new bifold "Nana Wall" be approved 2) Replace garage doors on front elevation of rear accessory structure with 3-ganged window. Infill with siding to match be approved with the condition that a new design be 3-ganged windows but in the organization of those 3-ganged windows be within an elevation of a garage door and that the windows be in the same style as on the existing house.

Maker:	Renaud				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	13/1				MOTION FAILED
		Ayes:	-	1	Hinojosa
		Against:	-	13	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

Motion #2

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace existing pedestrian doors on rear elevation of accessory structure with new bifold "nana wall" be approved 2) That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace garage doors on front elevation of rear accessory structure with 3-ganged window and infilled with siding to match be denied without prejudice.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	

		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10
--	--	------------	---	---	-------------------

3. 319 N EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-060(MLP)
Trevor Brown

A Certificate of Appropriateness to Install new landscaping along corner side yard

Speakers: For: No Speakers
Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to Install new landscaping along corner side yard be **denied without prejudice**.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

4. 226 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CD212-005(MLP)
Melissa Parent

A Certificate for Demolition to demolish rear accessory structure. Work completed without Certificate of Demolition.

Speakers: For: Peter Murgola
Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the request for demolition be **approved**, contrary to Staff Recommendation, because there is sufficient evidence to suggest that very little of the building actually was contributing having been added onto repeatedly over the years and that the amount of historic fabric to necessitate contributing status was no longer there.

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, December 6, 2021

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	9	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Offutt, Renaud, Sherman, Slade, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	5	Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Spellicy, Rothenberger
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

5. 1312 S Ervay

Ambassador Hotel

Liz Casso

A Landmark Commission Authorized Hearing to consider removal of the Historic Overlay for the Ambassador Hotel (H-20), on the east side of Ervay Street, south of Griffin Street East.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

 Against: No Speakers

Motion #1

Approve as submitted.

Maker:	Offutt				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	1/13				MOTION FAILED
		Ayes:	-	1	Offutt
		Against:	-	13	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

Motion #2

Deny without prejudice the request to remove historic overlay with the following findings of fact:

The original historic structure had significant historic and spatial relationship with Old City Park (Dallas Heritage Village), the city's oldest public park, which should guide replacement construction.

The original structure was of unique historic value in and of itself, which should guide replacement construction.

The original construction had a significant spatial relationship with nearby historic buildings, which are among the few remaining historic structures in the Cedars neighborhood. The original structure served as a focal point, a pin marking an important place in the neighborhood development, which should guide replacement construction.

It is important for the safety of landmarked structures in Dallas to avoid setting a precedent of relinquishing Landmark Commission oversight of replacement structures for destroyed landmarked structures.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

6. 1904 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.

Forest Theater

Liz Casso

A Landmark Commission Authorized Hearing to consider an Historic Overlay for the Forest Avenue Theater, on the southwest corner of Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard and South-Central Expressway.

Speakers: For: Nancy McCoy
David Preziosi

Against: No Speakers

Motion

Follow Staff Recommendations of **approval**, subject to preservation criteria and the Designation Committee recommendation, approval subject to preservation criteria and with committee edits to nomination and preservation criteria of Historic Overlay.

Maker:	Offutt				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin

		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

Commissioner Cummings did not hear or vote on this item.

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS

Motion

Approval of Minutes – November 1, 2021

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, Cummings, Guest, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Rothenberger Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	2	District 7 and 10

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing was adjourned at 4:42p.m.

Katherine Haskel, Chair

Date