

February 4, 2013



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a regular meeting on February 4, 2013 with a briefing at 12:00 Noon in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:16 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternate

Michael Amonett
Hasani Burton
Ted Campbell
*Steve Clicque
Mattia Flabiano

John Johnson
Cris Jordan
*Ann Piper
Katherine Seale, Chair

Albert Silva
Suzanne Smith
Daron Tapscott
Kelli Thomas-Drake

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: None

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: None

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: **Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards**

The following Positions are vacant:

Districts 1 and 5

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty
Carolyn Horner

Bert Vandenberg
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Public Hearing:

Motion was made to move Consent Item 7 to the Discussion docket.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Smith
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale,
Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

Motion was made to approve Consent Items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, and 13 to follow staff recommendation with clarification to the conditions to Consent Item 10 that the condition is to approve the left column facing the house.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale,
Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

Motion was made to revise the Discussion agenda and take Discussion Item 2 first then Consent Item 7 followed by the remaining items in their normal order.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale,
Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

CONSENT ITEMS:

1. 2822 Maple Springs Blvd.

Harris Kemp House
CE123-009(CH)
Carolyn Horner

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on the added value of the land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$28,387.72 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval. Approval of a Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$28,387.72 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

2. 5526 Tremont St.

Junius Heights Historic District
CE123-007(CH)
Carolyn Horner

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$2,130.00 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval. Approval of a Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$2,130.00 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

3. 5537 Reiger Ave.

Junius Heights Historic District
CE123-010(CH)
Carolyn Horner

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$405.41 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval. Approval of a Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$405.41 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

4. 200 N. Rosemont

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CE123-008(CH)
Carolyn Horner

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years. Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility.

5. 218 S. Rosemont

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CE123-012(CH)
Carolyn Horner

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years. Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility.

6. 122 N. Winnetka Ave.

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CE123-011(CH)
Carolyn Horner

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$58,538.29 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval. Approval of a Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$58,538.29 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

7. 2038 Commerce Street (Discussion)

Bluitt Sanitarium-Aspley Building
CA123-217(MD)

Mark Doty

- 1) Install new entry and storefront on north facade.
- 2) Install new storefront on east facade.

Speakers: For: Stephen Hundley, AIA
Against: No one

Motion:

- 1) Install new entry and storefront on north facade. Approve with conditions - Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/16/13 with the condition that the existing transoms over the storefront remain in place with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fenestration and openings in the preservation criteria Section 5.3 and 5.6, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) **with the specification that the material to be used is wood.**
- 2) Install new storefront on east facade. Approve with conditions - Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/16/13 with the condition that the existing transoms over the storefront remain in place with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fenestration and openings in the preservation criteria Section 5.3 and 5.6, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) **with the specification that the material to be used is wood.**

Maker: Smith

Second Thomas-Drake

:

Results 13/0

:

Ayes:	- 13	Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque, Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale, Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against:	- 0	
Absent:	- 2	Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies:	- 2	1 and 5

8. 3500 S. Fitzhugh Ave

Fair Park Historic District
CA123-224(MD)

Mark Doty

Install temporary signage for phone/scan interpretation program. Approve with conditions - Approve drawings dated 1/16/13 with the condition that signage be removed by March 31, 2014, unless another Certificate of Appropriateness form is approved for signage to become permanent with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for signs in the preservation criteria Section 9.2, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

9. 3750 Cotton Bowl Plaza

Fair Park Historic District

CA123-222(MD)

Mark Doty

1) Install new canopies at Entrances C, D, and E. Approve drawings dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria for the Cotton Bowl Section 5.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

2) Install intermediate support of mesh ribbons on 2008 addition facade. Approve drawings dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria for the Cotton Bowl Section 5.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

3) Paint existing concourses. Paint colors either Sherwin Williams or Pantone Matching System (PMS). PMS - 302C, 660C, 549C, 477C, 727C, 4675C, 1215C, 4655C, 173C, 158C, 157C, 499C, 1685C, 302C, 227C. Sherwin Williams - SW 1026, SW 1027, SW 1022. Approve drawings dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria for the Cotton Bowl Section 5.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

10. 5727 Worth Street

Junius Heights Historic District

CA123-214(CH)

Carolyn Horner

Replace two column wrappers on front porch. Approve with conditions - Approve the request dated 1/3/13 with the finding that the proposed column work complies with Ordinance 26331, Sections 4.1.b, 4.3, and 4.5, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i). Condition: **all column and trim materials and design to match existing materials and design as on the original column on the left-hand side as facing house.**

11. 1309 Main Street

Republic National Bank (Davis) Building

CA123-208(MD)

Mark Doty

1) Install 21 Colorbar and Colorblast 12 fixtures on east facade 17th floor ledge. Approve - Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for building site and landscaping and outdoor lighting in the preservation criteria Section 3.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2) Install four LED string lights on east facade 19th and 21st floor ledges. Approve - Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for building site and landscaping and outdoor lighting in the preservation criteria Section 3.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3) Remove four non-working lighting units and install six high power wall washers on north facade 5th floor ledge. Approve - Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for building site and landscaping and outdoor lighting in the preservation criteria Section 3.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4) Install one LED security light on east facade of building in alley. Approve - Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for building site and landscaping and outdoor lighting in the preservation criteria Section 3.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

12. 218 S. Rosemont Ave.

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA123-210(MD)
Mark Doty

Repaint exterior of main structure and garage. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 2835 'Craftsman Brown', Trim - SW 2833 'Roycroft Vellum', Accent - SW 2836 'Quartersawn Oak'. Approve - Approve paint colors dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(B) and (C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

13. 410 N. Winnetka Ave.

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA123-209(MD)
Mark Doty

Repaint exterior of main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 6075 - 'Garret Gray', Trim/Columns - SW 7100 'Arcade White', Window Trim/Door - SW 6020 'Marooned'. Approve paint colors dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(B) and (C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 719 Glendale Street

Junius Heights Historic District
CA123-219(CH)
Carolyn Horner

Replace front columns with new front columns, different design.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion:

Replace front columns with new front columns, different design. **Deny without prejudice - Request does not comply with Ordinance 26331, Sections 4.1.b, and 4.3. The applicant has not provided sufficient documentation to justify the addition of the new column design.**

Maker: Silver

Second: Flabiano

Results: 13/0

Ayes:	- 13	Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque, Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale, Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against:	- 0	
Absent:	- 2	Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies:	- 2	1 and 5

2. 5306 Worth St.

Junius Heights Historic District
CA123-216(CH)
Carolyn Horner

- 1) Replace porch railing with new rail.
- 2) Construct new column bases to match house.
- 3) Construct new tapered column tops.

Speakers: For: Michael Renfro
Against: No one

Motion:

- 1) Replace porch railing with new rail. Deny without prejudice – Request does not comply with Ordinance 26331, Sections 4.1.b, and 4.3. The applicant has not provided sufficient documentation to justify the addition of the new railing design.
- 2) Construct new column bases to match house. Deny without prejudice - Request does not comply with Ordinance 26331, Sections 4.1.b, and 4.3. The applicant has not provided sufficient documentation to justify the addition of the new column design.
- 3) Construct new tapered column tops. Deny without prejudice -Request does not comply with Ordinance 26331, Sections 4.1.b, and 4.3. The applicant has not provided sufficient documentation to justify the addition of the new tapered column design. Staff recommends keeping the square columns.

Maker: Thomas-Drake
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes:	- 13	Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque, Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale, Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against:	- 0	
Absent:	- 2	Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies:	- 2	1 and 5

3. 502 N. Clinton Ave.

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA123-218(MD)
Mark Doty
Install new attached signage.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

Install new attached signage. Approve - Approve drawing dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for signs in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(15), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) with the finding of fact that a similar sign has been approved under an earlier CA for this property.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 12/1

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale,
Silva, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against: - 1 Smith
Absent: - 2 Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

4. 117 S. Clinton Ave.

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA123-212(MD)
Mark Doty

Install three pendant light fixtures on front porch. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

Install three pendant light fixtures on front porch. Deny without prejudice - Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that states architectural detail should be typical of the style and period of the main building. Preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3).

Maker: Tapscott
Second: *Clicque
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale,
Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

5. 416 S. Clinton Ave.

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA123-223(MD)
Mark Doty

- 1) Remove eave material and replace with 1 x 4 tongue and groove siding.
- 2) Replace all window sashes with new windows sashes.
- 3) Install new beaded board on porch ceiling.
- 4) Install new composition shingle roof, 30 year - laminate, Tamko 'Black Walnut'.
- 5) Replace existing doors on rear facade.
- 6) Install new door in existing door on garage.

- 7) Create new garage door opening.
- 8) Install new porch lights.
- 9) Repaint exterior of main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 6104 'Kaffee', Trim - SW 6102 'Portabello', Accent - SW 6881 'Cayenne'.
- 10) Remove two chimneys on rear 50% of roof.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

- 1) Remove eave material and replace with 1 x 4 tongue and groove siding. Deny without prejudice - Deny the request with the finding that the applicant has not provided sufficient information showing existing eave material (roof decking) cannot be repaired.
- 2) Replace all window sashes with new windows sashes. Deny without prejudice - Deny the request with the finding that the applicant has not provided sufficient information showing existing windows cannot be repaired.
- 3) Install new beaded board on porch ceiling. Deny without prejudice - Deny the request with the finding that the applicant has not provided sufficient information showing existing beaded board porch ceiling cannot be repaired.
- 4) Install new composition shingle roof, 30 year - laminate, Tamko 'Black Walnut'. Approve – Approve image and specification dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for roof colors in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(E), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 5) Replace existing doors on rear facade. Approve – Approve specification dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 6) Install new door in existing door on garage. Approve – Approve drawing and specification dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for garages in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(12), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 7) Create new garage door opening. Approve – Approve drawing and specification dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for garages in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(12), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 8) Install new porch lights. Approve – Approve specification dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for architectural detail in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 9) Repaint exterior of main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 6104 'Kaffee', Trim - SW 6102 'Portabello', Accent - SW 6881 'Cayenne'. Approve – Approve paint colors dated 1/16/13 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(B) and (C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 10) Remove two chimneys on rear 50% of roof. Approve –The proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Burton
Second: Silver
Results: 13/0

Ayes:	- 13	Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque, Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale, Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against:	- 0	
Absent:	- 2	Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards

Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

6. 1319 W. Davis St.

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA123-211(MD)

Mark Doty

Install one 48"x96" aluminum, flat attached sign on north facade.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion:

Install one 48"x96" aluminum, flat attached sign on north facade. Approve with conditions - proposed signage with the condition the sign is reduced in size to 36"x96" with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for signage in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(15), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Tapscott

Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale,
Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards

Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS:

- 1) Approval of 2011-2012 Annual Report
- 2) Discuss potential date for site visit for Cotton Bowl lighting 'mock-up', 6:30 P.M. – 7:30 P.M., meet there.
- 3) Approval of the January 7, 2013 Minutes.

Motion was made to approve the 2011-2012 Annual Report.

Maker: Silva

Second: Campbell

Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque,
Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale,
Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards

Vacancies: - 2 1 and 5

Motion was made to approve the Minutes for the January 7, 2013 meeting as amended.

Maker: Campbell

Second: Flabiano

Results: 13/0

Ayes:	- 13	Amonett, Burton, Campbell, *Clicque, Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan, *Piper, Seale, Silva, Smith, Tapscott and Thomas-Drake
Against:	- 0	
Absent:	- 2	Timothy Dickey and Doug Edwards
Vacancies:	- 2	1 and 5

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at **2:13 P.M.**

Katherine D. Seale

Date