

October 3, 2011



**CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES**

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a regular meeting on October 3, 2011 with a briefing at 12:00 P.M. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:00 P.M. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Robert Asberry
Lyle Burgin
Louis Cruz
Mattia Flabiano

Chris Gonzales
John Johnson
Robin Norcross
* Ann Piper

Paul Ridley
Albert Silva
Joy Strickland

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **Bill Peterson**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting:
None

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting:
Linda Ward

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing:
Linda Ward

The following Positions are vacant:

Districts 4, 6 and 12

The following Staff were present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty
Carolyn Horner

Bert Vandenberg
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Public Hearing:

Motion was made to move consent item #2 to discussion items.

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Ridley

Results: 12/0

Ayes:	- 12	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Johnson, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	-	None
Absent:	- 1	Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

Motion was made to approve consent items #1, 3, 4, 5 and 6 to follow staff recommendation.

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Ridley

Results: 12/0

Ayes:	- 12	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Johnson, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	-	None
Absent:	- 1	Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

1. 904 Cadiz St.

CE112-001(MD)

Mark Doty

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$34,969.71 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval.

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$34,969.71 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

***1:59 P.M. Commissioner Johnson excused himself and left the meeting.**

2. 3500 S. Fitzhugh Ave

Fair Park Historic District

CD101-030(MD)

Mark Doty

Museum of the American Railroad - Removal of Railroad Museum collection including; rolling stock, structures, signals, and rail using standard non-contributing because newer than period of significance.

Speaker: For: Bob LaPrelle

Motion:

Approve - The removal of the structures, signals and rail for the Museum of the American Railroad and taking no action on the request to remove the rolling stock as that is not within our jurisdiction.

Maker: Ridley

Second: Flabiano

Results: 11/0

Ayes:	- 11	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	-	None
Absent:	- 2	Johnson, Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

3. 400 N ERVAY ST.

U.S. Post Office

CA101-375(MD)

Mark Doty

- 1) U.S. Post Office - New landscaping plan, including dog run.
- 2) U.S. Post Office - Install decorative bollard and chain fencing, height not to exceed 2'-0".

1) Approve the landscape drawing and photographs dated 9/14/11 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for lighting and landscaping in the preservation criteria Section 7, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2) Approve the drawing dated 9/14/11 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for lighting and landscaping in the preservation criteria Section 7, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4. 486 N ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA101-377(CH)

Carolyn Horner

Plaque installation within Heights Garden Park

Approve the drawings dated 09/01/11 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

5. 416 S WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA101-367(CH)

Carolyn Horner

- 1) New single car garage structure
- 2) Remove three windows from rear façade and add a door

1) Approve the drawings dated 8/29/11 with the finding that the proposed work complies with the criteria in City Code Section 51P-87.111(a)(1) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2) Approve - Approve the drawings dated 8/29/11 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. 117 S WILLOMET AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA101-370(CH)

Carolyn Horner

New roof, using different color asphalt shingles

Approve the documents dated August 30, 2011 with the finding that the proposed work complies with the criteria in City Code Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(E) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Motion was made to take Discussion Item #1 and 2 next on the agenda followed by Discussion Items 4, 5 and follow the remaining order of the agenda.

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Johnson

Results: 12/0

Ayes:	- 12	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Johnson, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	-	None
Absent:	- 1	Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 5426 WORTH STREET

Junius Heights Historic District

CA101-CA101-373(CH)

Carolyn Horner

Construction of a new main structure.

Speaker: For: Gregg McGriff

Motion:

Approve the drawings dated 9/20/11 with the finding that the proposed work complies with the criteria in Ordinance 26331, Sections 8.3.d, 8.4, 8.6, 8.9, 8.10, and 8.11, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Silva
Second: Flabiano
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales,
Johnson, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley,
Silva, Strickland
Against: - None
Absent: - 1 Ward
Vacancies: - 3 4, 6 and 12

2. 5426 WORTH STREET

Junius Heights Historic District
CA101-378(CH)
Carolyn Horner
New garage construction

Speaker: For: Gregg McGriff

Motion:

Approve the drawings dated 9/20/11 with the finding that the proposed work complies with Ordinance 26331, Sections 9.2, 9.3, 9.4, 9.6, 9.8 and 9.9, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Johnson
Second: Ridley
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales,
Johnson, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley,
Silva, Strickland
Against: - None
Absent: - 1 Ward
Vacancies: - 3 4, 6 and 12

3. 502 N CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA101-372(CH)
Carolyn Horner
New commercial business sign

Motion:

Approve - Approve the drawings dated 9/23/11 with the finding that the proposed sign complies with the criteria in City Code Section 51P-87.117.3(a)(1)(H) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Ridley
Second: Burgin
Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales,
Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva,
Strickland
Against: - None
Absent: - 2 Johnson, Ward
Vacancies: - 3 4, 6 and 12

4. 335 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA101-386(CH)
Carolyn Horner

- 1) Infill rear porch, using materials on exterior to match existing on structure.
- 2) Relocate and replace two one-over-one windows with stained leaded glass windows.
- 3) Front and side facade multi-over-one window replacement.

Speakers: For: Nancy Chartier

Motion:

- 1) Approve - Approve the drawings dated 8/2/11 with the finding that the proposed work complies with the criteria in City Code Sections 51P-87.111(a)(2) and 51P-87.111(a)(10)(A), and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2) Approve the drawings dated 8/2/11 with the finding that the proposed work complies with the criteria in City Code Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(B), and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 3) Approve – Approve with conditions for the use of Marvin Signature wood windows only as presented to Landmark Commission on 10-3-2011.

Maker: Silva
Second: Strickland
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales,
Johnson, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley,
Silva, Strickland
Against: - None
Absent: - 1 Ward
Vacancies: - 3 4, 6 and 12

5. 1836 W DAVIS ST

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA101-365(CH)

Carolyn Horner

1) New construction of multi-family housing

2) New Landscape plan

Speakers: For: Larry Good and Mark Meyer

Speakers: Against: Jim Anderson, Glen Jones, Petrine Abrahams and Jack Hagler

***1:59 P.M. Commissioner Johnson excused himself and left the meeting.**

Motion:

1) Approve as submitted

2) Approve as submitted

Maker: Burgin

Second: No one

Results: Motion Failed for lack of a second

Motion:

Deny without prejudice - Deny drawings dated 8/23/11, the proposed work is not compatible with the historic overlay district because the proposed structure does not comply with City Code Section 51P-87.117.3(a)(1)(H), due to the use of hardi siding material.

2) Approve - Approve the plans dated 09/21/11 with the finding that the proposed work complies with the criteria in City Code Sections 51P-87.117.3(d)(2)(A), 51P-87.117.3(d)(2)(B)(iii), 51P-87.117.3(d)(2)(C), 51P-87.117.3(d)(2)(E), 51P-87.117.3(d)(2)(H) and 51P-87.117.3(d)(2)(I), and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Strickland

Second: Cruz

Results: 9/2

Ayes:	- 9	Asberry, Cruz, Gonzales, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	- 2	Flabiano, Burgin
Absent:	- 2	Johnson, Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

Motion was made to take consent item #2 next on the agenda.

Maker: Flabiano

Second: Gonzales

Results: 11/0

Ayes:	- 11	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	-	None

Absent: - 2 Johnson, Ward
Vacancies: - 3 4, 6 and 12

6. 2843 METROPOLITAN AVE

Wheatley Place Historic District

CD101-010(MD)

Mark Doty

Demolition of a residential structure 3,000 square feet or less pursuant to a court order (51A-4.501(i) of the Dallas City Code).

Motion:

Approve staff recommendation extending the continuing suspension period as outlined in 51A-4.501(i)(8)(A)(iii).

Maker: Silva

Second: Strickland

Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales,
Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva,
Strickland
Against: - None
Absent: - 2 Johnson, Ward
Vacancies: - 3 4, 6 and 12

7. 224 LANDIS STREET

Tenth Street Historic District

CD101-022(MD)

Mark Doty

Demolition of a residential structure 3,000 square feet or less pursuant to a court order (51A-4.501(i) of the Dallas City Code).

Motion:

Approve - The proposed demolition meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(i)(7) because the City Attorney has received a court issued order for demolition and the suspension of the certificate of demolition is not a feasible option to alleviate the nuisance in a timely manner.

Maker: Silva

Second: Flabiano

Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales,
Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva,
Strickland
Against: - None
Absent: - 2 Johnson, Ward
Vacancies: - 3 4, 6 and 12

8. 218 N CLIFF STREET

Tenth Street Historic District

CD101-023(MD)

Mark Doty

Demolition of a residential structure 3,000 square feet or less pursuant to a court order (51A-4.501(i) of the Dallas City Code).

Motion:

Approve - The proposed demolition meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(i)(7) because the City Attorney has received a court issued order for demolition and the suspension of the certificate of demolition is not a feasible option to alleviate the nuisance in a timely manner.

Maker: Silva

Second: Cruz

Results: 10/1

Ayes:	- 10	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva,
Against:	- 1	Strickland
Absent:	- 2	Johnson, Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS

1. September 6, 2010 Minutes.

Motion was made to approve the minutes for the September 6, 2011.

Maker: Ridley

Second: Flabiano

Results: 11/0

Ayes:	- 11	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	- None	
Absent:	- 2	Johnson, Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

2. 2012 Landmark Commission Calendar

Motion was made to approve the 2012 Landmark Commission Calendar.

Maker: Ridley

Second: Flabiano

Results: 11/0

Ayes:	- 11	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	- None	
Absent:	- 2	Johnson, Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at 3:10 p.m.

Maker: Gonzales

Second: Flabiano

Results: 11/0

Ayes:	- 11	Asberry, Burgin, Cruz, Flabiano, Gonzales, Norcross, Peterson, Piper, Ridley, Silva, Strickland
Against:	- None	
Absent:	- 2	Johnson, Ward
Vacancies:	- 3	4, 6 and 12

Chris Gonzales, Chair

November 8, 2011