

160036

RECEIVED

2016 FEB 11 PM 2:47

CITY SECRETARY  
DALLAS, TEXAS



CITY OF DALLAS

## Memorandum

DATE February 9, 2016  
TO Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council  
SUBJECT **2015 Annual Report: Citizens Police Review Board**

The members of the Citizens Police Review Board is pleased to submit to the City Council the Annual Report of activities for 2015.

We appreciate the opportunity to serve on this Board and hope that you will continue supporting our efforts.

Please let me know if you have any questions regarding this report of the Board's work.

A handwritten signature in cursive that reads "Carl Raines (es)".

Carl Raines, Chair  
Citizens Police Review Board

### Attachments

cc: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council  
A.C. Gonzalez, City Manager  
Warren M. S. Ernst, City Attorney  
Craig D. Kinton, City Auditor  
Rosa A. Rios, City Secretary  
Daniel F. Solis, Administrative Judge  
Ryan S. Evans, First Assistant City Manager  
Eric D. Campbell, Assistant City Manager  
Jill A. Jordan, P.E., Assistant City Manager  
Mark McDaniel, Assistant City Manager  
Joey Zapata, Assistant City Manager  
Jeanne Chipperfield, Chief Financial Officer  
Sana Syed, Public Information Officer  
Elsa Cantu, Assistant to the City Manager – Mayor & Council

February 9, 2016

Page 2 of 2

**2015 Annual Report: Citizens Police Review Board**

**Notice: A quorum of the Board/Commission may attend this Board/Commission Sub-Committee meeting. This notification is being posted in the event a quorum is present**

A closed executive session may be held if the discussion of any of the above agenda items concerns one of the following:

1. Contemplated or pending litigation or matters where legal advice is requested of the City Attorney, Section 551.071 of the Texas Open Meetings Act.
2. The purchase, exchange, lease or value of real property, if the deliberation in an open meeting would have a detrimental effect on the position of the City in negotiations with a third person. Section 551.072 of the Texas Open Meetings Act.
3. The contract for a prospective gift or donation to the City, if the deliberation in an open meeting would have a detrimental effect on the position of the City in negotiations with a third person. Section 551.073 of the Texas Open Meetings Act.
4. Personnel matters involving the appointment, employment, evaluation, reassignment, duties, discipline or dismissal of a public officer or employee or to hear a complaint against an officer or employee. Section 551.074 of the Texas Open Meetings Act.
5. The deployment or specific occasions for implementation of security personnel or devices. Section 551.076 of the Texas Open Meetings Act.
6. Deliberations regarding economic development negotiations. Section 551.074 of the Texas Open Meetings Act.

160036

# **Table of Contents**

**Dallas Citizens Police Review Board  
2015 ANNUAL REPORT**

CITY OF DALLAS  
CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD

**2015 ANNUAL REPORT**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b><u>SECTION</u></b>	<b><u>PAGE</u></b>
Board Members.....	1
City Staff .....	2
Mission Statement.....	3
Objective.....	4
Guiding Principles.....	5
Board Training.....	6
Attendance Record.....	7
Success Indicators.....	8
Dallas Police Department Internal Affairs Allegation Summary: Number and "Types of Case Allegations" .....	9
Summary.....	10
Board Certification.....	11

160036

# **Citizens Police Review Board Members**

**Dallas Citizens Police Review Board  
2015 ANNUAL REPORT**

**DALLAS CITIZENS POLICE REVIEW BOARD  
2015**

160036

**Annual Report**

**Board Members**

<b>Board Member</b>	<b>District</b>	<b>Appointed by Councilmember</b>	<b>Appointed/ Reappointed</b>	<b>Member since</b>	<b>Terms served</b>	<b>Current status</b>
Janice Coffee	1	Griggs	10-7-15	12-18-13	1	Reappointed
Winnie Dixon	7	Davis	1-8-14	1-25-08	4	Holdover
Miriam Dominguez	2	Medrano	12-9-15	12-9-15	0	Appointed
Phil Foster	3	V. Hill	9-25-13	11-14-07	3	Holdover
Frances Gonzalez	15	Mayor	1-15-14	1-21-14	0	Forfeit 10-2-15
Loren Gilbert-Smith	4	Arnold	11-3-15	11-3-15	0	Appointed
Mario Gutierrez	6	Alonzo	10-7-15	2-2-12	2	Reappointed
Paul Hille	14	Kingston	10-14-15	11-3-15	0	Appointed
Thomas Jefferson	10	Allen	10-2-13	5-23-08	4	Holdover
Mike Pappas	11	Kleinman	8-26-15	9-3-2013	0	Reappointed
Carl Raines, Chair	5	Callahan	10-16-13	9-30-09	3	Holdover
Felix Saucedo, Vice-Chair	9	Clayton	10-7-15	12-2-10	2	Reappointed
Joshua Vernon	12	Greyson	10-21-15	3-9-15	0	Reappointed
Dwight Williams	8	Atkins	10-23-13	4-13-12	1	Resigned 6-15-15
VACANT	13	Gates	----	----	----	----

**Technical Advisory Committee:**

Lieutenant Leo Daniels  
Lieutenant Tarrick McGuire  
Lieutenant Glen Edney

City of Arlington  
City of Arlington  
City of Ft. Worth

160036

# **City Staff Members**

**Dallas Citizens Police Review Board  
2015 ANNUAL REPORT**

## **Staff Members**

- City Manager's Office
  - Ryan S. Evans, First Assistant City Manager
  - Shun Session, Board Coordinator
  
- Dallas Police Department
  - Deputy Chief Gil Garza, Internal Affairs
  - Lieutenant Monique Alex, Internal Affairs
  - Lieutenant Scott Hart, Internal Affairs
  - Lieutenant Paulette Richardson, Internal Affairs
  - Lieutenant William Griffith, Internal Affairs
  - Pavala Armstrong and Sylvia McClellan, Assistant City Attorney Office



160036

# **Mission Statement**

**Dallas Citizens Police Review Board  
2015 ANNUAL REPORT**

## **Mission Statement**

To improve the sense of public safety and confidence in the Dallas Police Department within the community by providing:

- A means for citizens to communicate their concerns regarding alleged inappropriate police behavior;
- An avenue for the public to obtain some remedial action regarding Internal Affairs Division investigations and Division Referral reviews in circumstances in which the Board deems same appropriate and as provided for in the Board's enabling ordinance;
- A vehicle (the Board) for making impartial recommendations for changes or improvements in the operation of the Dallas Police Department;
- An advisory body to the City Council with regard to the operations and policies of the Dallas Police Department, its policies, operations and practices, as well as the public's perception of same.

# **Objective**

## **Objective**

The Dallas Citizens Police Review Board meets once monthly (the second Tuesday) in order to provide citizens who have made complaints against police department employees an opportunity to voice dissatisfaction with the results of the Police Department Internal Affairs Division Investigations and Chain-of-Command (Division Referrals) reviews and to develop recommendations to the Dallas Police Department through the Office of the City Manager for changes or improvements in the operation of the Dallas Police Department, as well as to perform its advisory function to the City Council with regard to the operations and policies of the Dallas Police Department, as well as the public's perception of same.

160036

# **Guiding Principles**

**Dallas Citizens Police Review Board  
2015 ANNUAL REPORT**

## Guiding Principles

- Authority:** Dallas City Code, Chapter 37, Article III Dallas Citizens Police Review Board (CPRB) Section 37-31
- Members:** 15 members, one appointed by each member of the City Council
- All members shall be appointed for a term to expire on September 1. All subsequent appointments will be made in August of each odd-numbered year for a two-year term beginning on September 1. Members shall serve until their successors are appointed and qualified
- Qualifications:** No special qualifications for membership
- Officers:** Mayor appoints the chair, subject to confirmation by a majority of the City Council; full City Council appoints the Vice-Chair
- Functions:** The Citizens Police Review Board is primarily an advisory board. The Board hears complaints against Dallas Police Officers, where the citizen is not satisfied with the results of the Internal Affairs Division and Chain-of-Command (division level) investigations. The Board's powers are set by City ordinance.

### WHAT THE REVIEW BOARD CAN AND CANNOT DO:

The Review Board **cannot**:

1. Overturn Internal Affairs and Chain-of-Command (division level) decisions.
2. Require the officer being complained of to appear before the Board.
3. Award money damages for citizens.
4. Discipline or recommend discipline of police officers.
5. Decide who was right and who was wrong in a particular case.
6. Dismiss tickets or charges against citizens.

The Review Board **can**:

1. Make recommendations to the City Manager's Office concerning officers that are the subject of a complaint.
2. Agree or disagree with an Internal Affairs or Chain-of-Command (division level) decision.
3. Request Internal Affairs or Chain-of-Command to conduct further investigations.
4. Do its own investigation or hire a third party investigator.
5. Subpoena Witnesses (other than the officer being complained of).

160036

# **Training**

## **Training**

The ordinance requires that Board members are provided two training classes per term to become familiar with police procedures. Two training classes were accomplished during 2014.

The following training sessions were conducted:

- **Tuesday, January 13, 2015 – Dallas Police Department Body Worn Cameras presentation provided by Deputy Chief Andrew Acord, Dallas Police Department**
- **Tuesday, December 8, 2015 – Open Government Training video (Open Meetings and Texas Public Information Act)**

In addition to the two training classes, the Board completed additional activities:

- **Tuesday, January 13, 2015 – Board members discussed and adopted the 2014 Annual Report**



160036

# **Attendance**

# 2015 Dallas Citizens Police Review Board Attendance Record

District	Member	1/13	2/10	3/10	4/14	5/12	6/9	7/14	8/11	9/8	10/13	11/10	12/8
1	Janice Coffee			MC				CR					
2	Miriam Dominguez			MC				CR					A
3	Phil Foster		A	MC				CR					
4	Loren Gilbert-Smith	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	New Member 11/3
5	Carl Raines, CHAIR			MC		A		CR					
6	Mario Gutierrez	A		MC				CR		A			
7	Winnie Dixon							CR		A	A		
8	Dwight Williams			MC			Resigned 6/15	CR					
9	Felix Saucedo			MC				CR					
10	Thomas Jefferson			MC				CR					
11	Mike Pappas			MC				CR					
12	Joshua Vernon				New member 3/9								
13	VACANT	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V
14	Paul Hille			MC				CR					
15	Frances Gonzalez		A	MC			A	CR			Forfeit 10/25		1

Reg = Regular Meeting, A = Absent, V = Vacant, CR = Council Recess, MC = Meeting Cancelled

160036

# **Success Indicators**

160036

**Dallas Citizens Police Review Board  
2015 ANNUAL REPORT**

# SUCCESS INDICATORS

## Dallas Citizens Police Review Board

### Performance

January – December 2015

	JAN	FEB	MAR	APR	MAY	JUNE	JULY	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV	DEC	TOTALS
<b>Monthly Summary:</b>													
<b>Dallas Police Department Cases</b>													
Cases investigated by Internal Affairs (IAD)	36	32	25	16	21	32	24	43	18	18	11	10	286
Internal Affairs Cases referred to the Division (DR)	16	14	17	17	18	10	17	21	32	24	16	19	221
<b>Total IAD and DR Cases Filed</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>39</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>64</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>507</b>
<b>Board Activity Detail</b>													
Complainants scheduled to appear	3	2	MC	3	4	2	CR	2	2	2	1	0	21
Complainants that were a No-Show	2	0	MC	2	3	2	CR	1	1	1	1	0	13
Complainants 2 <sup>nd</sup> (final) notice case dismissed	2	0	MC	0	2	1	CR	1	0	1	1	0	8
<b>Board Review of New Appeals</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>MC</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>CR</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Board Review of Pending Appeals</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>MC</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>CR</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Total Cases Reviewed By Board Jan-Dec 2015</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>MC</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>CR</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>8</b>
Status Report on Pending Police Involved Shootings	0	0	MC	0	0	0	CR	0	0	0	0	0	0
Board Review of Completed Police Involved Shootings	0	0	MC	0	0	0	CR	0	0	0	0	0	0
Board Training Sessions	1	0	MC	0	0	0	CR	0	0	0	0	1	2
<b>Board Case Conclusion</b>													
Concur w/IAD or Division findings	1	1	MC	0	1	0	CR	1	0	0	0	0	19
Not to Concur w/IAD or Division findings	0	0	MC	0	0	0	CR	0	1	1	0	0	3
Referred to CMO for Recommendation	0	0	MC	0	0	0	CR	0	0	0	0	0	0
Case Referred to IAD/Follow-up Report	0	1	MC	1	0	0	CR	0	0	0	0	0	3

Note: All complainants receive two notifications of the date and time scheduled on the agenda by regular mail. If the complainant does not attend after the second notification, the Board will dismiss their case without prejudice.

MC = Meeting Cancelled (March cancelled due to spring Break)  
CR = Council Recess

160036

# **Internal Affairs Allegation Summary**



160036

# **Summary**

# SUMMARY

(Information provided by Dallas Police Department, Internal Affairs Division)

- The Dallas Police Department has selected the Taser brand Axon Body Camera system for officers to use. This program dictates that officers who frequently receive complaints will be issued cameras first
  - 276 body cameras placed in active service since September 1, 2015
  - Original contract was for 200 cameras per year for 5 years
  - 400 already purchased will be in service by January 1, 2017
  - Bass Foundation donated money to expedite program
  
- All regular marked patrol vehicles are equipped with L3 brand in-car camera systems
  - Field supervisors do random reviews of in-car video to ensure compliance with department policy
  - The DVR Review Team reviews all vehicle pursuits for compliance
  - 1142 violations noted 2015 by the DVR Review Team
  - Noted violations are forwarded to officers' chain of command for action
  
- Internal Affairs Staffing was increased during 2015
  - 33 Sergeants and Detective positions now authorized
  - 65% increase since January 2015
  
- Blue Team is now being used to enter and track the following incidents:
  - Officer response to resistance (use of force)
  - Vehicle Pursuit
  - Foot Pursuits
  - Consent Searches
  - Non-Consent Searches (where no arrest is made)
  - Probation Failures
  - Lost Property
  - Summary Discipline
  - Division Referrals
  - Commendations



160036

# **Board Certification**

## **BOARD CERTIFICATION**

The forgoing report meets all of the criteria set forth in the City of Dallas Code of Ordinances; Section 8-1.1. This report has been compiled based upon the input received from the Dallas Police Department Internal Affairs Division and Cases reviewed by the Members of the Dallas Citizens Police Review Board.