

# Dallas City Council

Mayor

Eric Johnson

### Mayor Pro Tem

Adam Medrano

## Deputy Mayor Pro Tem

B. Adam McGough

### **Council Members**

Carolyn King Arnold Tennell Atkins Adam Bazaldua Paula Blackmon David Blewett Jennifer S. Gates Lee M. Kleinman Cara Mendelsohn Omar Narvaez Jaime Resendez Casey Thomas, II Chad West Audit of Proposed Budget Revenues Included in the Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget for the City of Dallas

September 13, 2019

Mark S. Swann City Auditor

## Objective and Scope

The audit objective was to determine whether the City of Dallas has effective processes to ensure reasonable proposed budget revenues are included in the City Manager's *Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget.* 

The audit scope was the major revenue sources included in the *Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget* and the associated supporting documentation.

### What We Recommend

There are no audit recommendations associated with this report.

## Background

Council Resolution 904027 directs the City Auditor to review and verify the reasonableness of the proposed budget revenues included in the City Manager's *Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget.* 

## What We Found

The City of Dallas has effective processes to ensure reasonable proposed budget revenues are included in the *Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget*. Further, the revenue forecast methodologies and material assumptions used in developing the proposed budget revenues are reasonable and adequately supported.

## Audit Results

The Office of the City Auditor reviewed major revenue sources totally \$2.54 billion or 78 percent of the \$3.27 billion of the proposed budget revenues included in the *Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget.* The remaining \$730 million, which are mainly derived from department reimbursements, and City of Dallas employee and retiree contributions for retirement and health benefits, were excluded from the review. The major revenue sources reviewed are identified in Exhibit 1.

Exhibit 1:

| Revenue Sources  | Fiscal Year<br>2018-19<br>Amended Budget | Fiscal Year<br>2018-19<br>Forecast Revenues | Fiscal Year<br>2019-20<br>Proposed Revenues |
|--|--|---|---|
| General Fund   |  |   |   |
| Ad Valorem Taxes                                       | \$727,886,279                            | \$728,961,732                               | \$792,080,970                               |
| Sales Tax  | 311,645,016                              | 317,296,876                                 | 325,566,185                                 |
| Franchise Fees   | 98,493,950                               | 100,173,285                                 | 96,004,542                                  |
| Enterprise Funds                                       |  |   |   |
| Water Utilities  | 665,005,577                              | 612,013,026                                 | 670,485,708                                 |
| Aviation - Concessions & Rentals                       | 126,086,966                              | 126,086,966                                 | 119,040,589                                 |
| Sanitation Services                                    | 114,157,465                              | 118,675,725                                 | 120,129,201                                 |
| Convention and Event Services -<br>Hotel Occupancy Tax | 64,249,315                               | 63,637,120                                  | 66,423,441                                  |
| Storm Water Fees                                       | 58,436,837                               | 58,465,982                                  | 60,921,458                                  |
| Debt Service   |  |   |   |
| Ad Valorem Taxes                                       | 270,069,503                              | 270,328,625                                 | 287,449,046                                 |
| Revenue Sources Reviewed                               | 2,436,030,908                            | 2,395,639,337                               | 2,538,101,140                               |
| Revenue Sources Not Included                           | 694,660,108                              | 702,469,109                                 | 730,310,155                                 |
| Total Revenues   | \$3,130,691,016                          | \$3,098,108,446                             | \$3,268,411,295                             |

### Revenue Sources Included in the Office of the City Auditor's Review

Source: Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget (Unaudited)

The City of Dallas has methodologies in place for forecasting revenues. The common methodologies used by the City of Dallas consist of regression analyses and/or historical trends, professional judgements, along with expertise from external consultants. Exhibit 2 (on pages 3 and 4) shows the total General Fund variance between budgeted revenues compared to actual revenues for Fiscal Years 2016 through 2018 were 2 percent or less.

#### Exhibit 2:

#### Fiscal Years 2016 Through 2018 General Fund Budgeted Revenues Compared To Actual Revenues (in thousands)

| General Fund                 | Fiscal Year                 | Fiscal Year               | — Variance — |         |
|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------|---------|
|                              | 2015-16<br>Budgeted Revenue | 2015-16<br>Actual Revenue | Dollar       | Percent |
| Ad Valorem Taxes             | \$559,636                   | \$560,307                 | \$671        | 0.1%    |
| Sales Tax                    | 281,272                     | 283,918                   | 2,646        | 0.9%    |
| Franchise Fees and Other Tax | 133,043                     | 134,920                   | 1,877        | 1.4%    |
| License and Permits          | 6,067                       | 6,523                     | 456          | 7.5%    |
| Intergovernmental            | 7,432                       | 8,019                     | 587          | 7.9%    |
| Service to Others            | 87,873                      | 85,252                    | -2,621       | -3.0%   |
| Fines and Forfeitures        | 33,462                      | 37,551                    | 4,089        | 12.2%   |
| Investment Income            | 961                         | 1,970                     | 1,009        | 105.0%  |
| Other Revenues               | 10,068                      | 12,412                    | 2,344        | 23.3%   |
| Total Revenues               | \$1,119,814                 | \$1,130,872               | \$11,058     | 1.0%    |

| General Fund                 | Fiscal Year<br>2016-17 | Fiscal Year               | — Variance — |         |
|------------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|--------------|---------|
| General rona                 | Budgeted Revenue       | 2016-17<br>Actual Revenue | Dollar       | Percent |
| Ad Valorem Taxes             | \$610,219              | \$610,958                 | \$739        | 0.1%    |
| Sales Tax                    | 292,188                | 293,610                   | 1,422        | 0.5%    |
| Franchise Fees and Other Tax | 140,251                | 138,817                   | -1,434       | -1.0%   |
| License and Permits          | 4,891                  | 5,475                     | 584          | 11.9%   |
| Intergovernmental            | 8,501                  | 9,238                     | 737          | 8.7%    |
| Service to Others            | 93,941                 | 103,175                   | 9,234        | 9.8%    |
| Fines and Forfeitures        | 38,760                 | 35,923                    | -2,837       | -7.3%   |
| Investment Income            | 1,315                  | 3,263                     | 1,948        | 148.1%  |
| Other Revenues               | 7,616                  | 8,477                     | 861          | 11.3%   |
| Total Revenues               | \$1,197,682            | \$1,208,936               | \$11,254     | 0.9%    |

(...continued on page 4)

| General Fund                 | Fiscal Year                 | Fiscal Year               | — Variance — |         |
|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------|---------|
| General runa                 | 2017-18<br>Budgeted Revenue | 2017-18<br>Actual Revenue | Dollar       | Percent |
| Ad Valorem Taxes             | \$652,068                   | \$652,462                 | \$394        | 0.1%    |
| Sales Tax                    | 303,349                     | 305,398                   | 2,049        | 0.7%    |
| Franchise Fees and Other Tax | 135,320                     | 141,897                   | 6,577        | 4.9%    |
| License and Permits          | 4,669                       | 4,824                     | 155          | 3.3%    |
| Intergovernmental            | 9,548                       | 10,194                    | 646          | 6.8%    |
| Service to Others            | 116,117                     | 126,963                   | 10,846       | 9.3%    |
| Fines and Forfeitures        | 36,515                      | 35,171                    | -1,344       | -3.7%   |
| Investment Income            | 2,017                       | 4,450                     | 2,433        | 120.6%  |
| Other Revenues               | 6,580                       | 9,640                     | 3,060        | 46.5%   |
| Total Revenues               | \$1,266,183                 | \$1,290,999               | \$24,816     | 2.0%    |

Source: City of Dallas 2016-2018 Comprehensive Annual Financial Reports

In preparing the proposed budget revenues, City management develops revenue forecast methodologies, such as regression analyses and/or historical trends, and documents significant assumptions used to support the methodologies. The Office of the City Auditor's assessment considers the reasonableness of these revenue forecast methodologies; however, neither City management nor the Office of the City Auditor guarantees the achievement of the Fiscal Year 2019-20 proposed budget revenues.

## Methodology

We interviewed department personnel, reviewed revenue forecast methodologies and material assumptions for reasonableness, verified consistency of the budget documents, and performed various analyses.

This performance audit was conducted in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, and appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

## Major Contributors to the Report

Andrew Yates, CPA, CIA – Assistant City Auditor III Enrique J. Fuentes – Assistant City Auditor II Lee Chiang, CIA, CISA – Project Manager Rory Galter, CPA – Audit Manager

#### Memorandum



- DATE: September 9, 2019
- TO: Mark S. Swann, City Auditor
- SUBJECT: Response to Audit Report: Audit of Proposed Budget Revenues Included in the Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget

This letter acknowledges the City Manager's Office received and reviewed the *Audit Report: Audit of Proposed Budget Revenues Included in the Fiscal Year 2019-20 Proposed Annual Budget for the City of Dallas.* 

We appreciate the professionalism and quality of work demonstrated by your staff throughout this engagement.

Sincerely,

T. C. Broadnax City Manager

C: Kimberly Bizor Tolbert, Chief of Staff M. Elizabeth Reich, Chief Financial Officer Jack Ireland, Director, Office of Budget Sheri Kowalski, City Controller

> "Our Product is Service" Empathy | Ethics | Excellence | Equity