#### **OFFICE OF THE CITY AUDITOR – FINAL REPORT**



# Audit of Proposed Budget Revenues Included in the Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget for the City of Dallas

September 10, 2021 Mark S. Swann, City Auditor

Mayor

Eric Johnson

Mayor Pro Tem

**Chad West** 

Deputy Mayor Pro Tem

Jaime Resendez

Council Members

Carolyn King Arnold

**Tennell Atkins** 

Adam Bazaldua

Paula Blackmon

B. Adam McGough

Cara Mendelsohn

Jesse Moreno

Omar Narvaez

Paul E. Ridley

Jaynie Schultz

Casey Thomas, II

Gay Donnell Willis



# Table of Contents

| Executive Summary                | 1 |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Audit Results                    | 2 |
| Methodology                      | 2 |
| Major Contributors to the Report |   |
| Management's Response            | 6 |

# **Executive Summary**

# Objective and Scope

The audit objective was to determine whether the City of Dallas has effective processes to ensure reasonable proposed budget revenues are included in the City Manager's Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget.

The audit scope was the major revenue sources included in the *Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget* and the associated supporting documentation.

#### What We Recommend

There are no audit recommendations associated with this report.

# Background

The City Council approved *Fiscal Year 2021 Audit Work Plan* prescribed the City Auditor to review and verify the reasonableness of the proposed budget revenues included in the City Manager's *Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget*. The \$282.5 million budgeted from the American Rescue Plan Act of 2021 for the *Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget* was not part of the review since the funds have been granted and are not estimated.

#### What We Found

The City of Dallas has effective processes to ensure reasonable proposed budget revenues are included in the *Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget*. Further, the revenue forecast methodologies and material assumptions used in developing the proposed budget revenues are reasonable and adequately supported.

### **Audit Results**

Exhibit 1:

The Office of the City Auditor reviewed major revenue sources totaling \$2.72 billion, or 78 percent of the \$3.49 billion of the proposed budget revenues included in the *Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget*. The remaining \$772 million, which are mainly derived from department reimbursements, and City of Dallas employee and retiree contributions for retirement and health benefits, were excluded from the review. The major revenue sources reviewed are identified in Exhibit 1.

Revenue Sources Included in the Office of the City Auditor's Review

| Revenue Sources  | Fiscal Year<br>2020-21<br>Amended Budget | Fiscal Year<br>2020-21<br>Forecast Revenues | Fiscal Year<br>2021-22<br>Proposed Revenues |
|--|--|---|---|
| General Fund   |  |   |   |
| Ad Valorem Taxes                                       | \$825,006,993                            | \$842,253,328                               | \$876,483,968                               |
| Sales Tax  | 305,073,041                              | 336,011,501                                 | 344,283,066                                 |
| Franchise Fees   | 83,444,095                               | 85,412,871                                  | 85,146,984                                  |
| Enterprise Fund  |  |   |   |
| Water Utilities  | 692,146,200                              | 672,903,109                                 | 713,732,650                                 |
| Aviation - Concessions & Rentals                       | 94,234,713                               | 92,427,523                                  | 111,964,255                                 |
| Sanitation Services                                    | 127,062,910                              | 125,943,184                                 | 137,982,207                                 |
| Convention and Event Services -<br>Hotel Occupancy Tax | 36,500,000                               | 36,438,189                                  | 58,310,171                                  |
| Storm Water Fees                                       | 66,355,747                               | 66,332,748                                  | 69,314,586                                  |
| Debt Service   |  |   |   |
| Ad Valorem Taxes                                       | 301,028,221                              | 306,222,303                                 | \$321,279,574                               |
| Revenue Sources Reviewed                               | \$2,530,851,920                          | \$2,563,944,756                             | \$2,718,497,461                             |
| Revenue Sources Not Included                           | 750,799,171                              | 729,777,705                                 | 772,268,150                                 |
| Total Revenues   | \$3,281,651,091                          | \$3,293,722,461                             | \$3,490,765,611                             |

**Source:** Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget (Unaudited)

The City of Dallas has methodologies in place for forecasting revenues. The common methodologies used by the City of Dallas consist of regression analyses and/or historical trends, professional judgements, along with expertise from external consultants. Exhibit 2 (on pages 3 and 4) shows the total General Fund variance between budgeted revenues compared to actual revenues for Fiscal Years 2018 through 2020 were less than 3 percent for all three years.

While common methodologies were used to forecast revenues for Fiscal Year 2021-22 revenues, the methodologies were adjusted as appropriate to consider the effects the COVID-19 pandemic could have throughout the remainder of Fiscal Year 2020-21 and all of Fiscal Year 2021-22. A conservative approach was taken to forecast the revenues.

Exhibit 2:

### Fiscal Years 2018 Through 2020 General Fund Budgeted Revenues Compared To Actual Revenues (in thousands)

| General Fund                 | Fiscal Year<br>2017-18 | Fiscal Year<br>2017-18 | — Variance — |         |
|------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|--------------|---------|
|                              | Budgeted Revenue       | Actual Revenue         | Dollar       | Percent |
| Ad Valorem Taxes             | \$652,068              | \$652,462              | \$394        | 0.1%    |
| Sales Tax                    | 303,349                | 305,398                | 2,049        | 0.7%    |
| Franchise Fees and Other Tax | 135,320                | 141,897                | 6,577        | 4.9%    |
| License and Permits          | 4,669                  | 4,824                  | 155          | 3.3%    |
| Intergovernmental            | 9,548                  | 10,194                 | 646          | 6.8%    |
| Service to Others            | 116,117                | 126,963                | 10,846       | 9.3%    |
| Fines and Forfeitures        | 36,515                 | 35,171                 | -1,344       | -3.7%   |
| Investment Income            | 2,017                  | 4,450                  | 2,433        | 120.6%  |
| Other Revenues               | 6,580                  | 9,640                  | 3,060        | 46.5%   |
| Total Revenues               | \$1,266,183            | \$1,290,999            | \$24,816     | 2.0%    |

| General Fund                 | Fiscal Year<br>2018-19<br>Budgeted Revenue | Fiscal Year<br>2018-19<br>Actual Revenue | — Variance — |         |
|------------------------------|--|--|--------------|---------|
|                              |  |  | Dollar       | Percent |
| Ad Valorem Taxes             | \$727,886                                  | \$729,596                                | \$1,710      | 0.2%    |
| Sales Tax                    | 311,645                                    | 313,461                                  | 1,816        | 0.6%    |
| Franchise Fees and Other Tax | 133,348                                    | 135,697                                  | 2,349        | 1.8%    |
| License and Permits          | 5,671                                      | 6,349                                    | 678          | 12.0%   |
| Intergovernmental            | 9,563                                      | 10,178                                   | 615          | 6.4%    |
| Service to Others            | 122,048                                    | 114,016                                  | -8,032       | -6.6%   |
| Fines and Forfeitures        | 34,245                                     | 35,823                                   | 1,578        | 4.6%    |
| Investment Income            | 2,435                                      | 8,236                                    | 5,801        | 238.2%  |
| Other Revenues               | 6,320                                      | 9,744                                    | 3,424        | 54.2%   |
| Total Revenues               | \$1,353,161                                | \$1,363,100                              | \$9,939      | 0.7%    |

| General Fund                 | Fiscal Year<br>2019-20<br>Budgeted Revenue | Fiscal Year<br>2019-20<br>Actual Revenue | — Variance — |         |
|------------------------------|--|--|--------------|---------|
|                              |  |  | Dollar       | Percent |
| Ad Valorem Taxes             | \$787,420                                  | \$789,114                                | \$1,694      | 0.2%    |
| Sales Tax                    | 325,566                                    | 310,737                                  | -14,829      | -4.6%   |
| Franchise Fees and Other Tax | 129,340                                    | 120,944                                  | -8,396       | -6.5%   |
| License and Permits          | 5,154                                      | 4,486                                    | -668         | -13.0%  |
| Intergovernmental            | 11,383                                     | 15,670                                   | 4,287        | 37.7%   |
| Service to Others            | 127,077                                    | 104,353                                  | -22,724      | -17.9%  |
| Fines and Forfeitures        | 27,222                                     | 24,313                                   | -2,909       | -10.7%  |
| Investment Income            | 4,664                                      | 5,544                                    | 880          | 18.9%   |
| Other Revenues               | 6,685                                      | 7,530                                    | 845          | 12.6%   |
| Total Revenues               | \$1,424,511                                | \$1,382,691                              | -\$41,820    | -2.9%   |

**Source:** City of Dallas 2018-2020 Comprehensive Annual Financial Reports

In preparing the proposed budget revenues, City management develops revenue forecast methodologies, such as regression analyses and/or historical trends, and documents significant assumptions used to support the methodologies. The Office of the City Auditor's assessment considers the reasonableness of these revenue forecast methodologies; however, neither City management nor the Office of the City Auditor guarantees the achievement of the Fiscal Year 2021-22 proposed budget revenues.

# Methodology

We interviewed department personnel, reviewed revenue forecast methodologies and material assumptions for reasonableness, verified consistency of the budget documents, and performed various analyses. The five internal control components of the *Standards for Internal Control in the Federal Government* were considered in this engagement.

This performance audit was conducted in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, and appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

# Major Contributors to the Report

Lee Chiang, CIA, CISA, ACDA – In-Charge Auditor Rory Galter, CPA – Engagement Manager Enrique J. Fuentes, CFE Carron Perry, CIA Mamatha Sparks, CIA, CISA, CRISC

#### Memorandum



DATE: September 2, 2021

o: Mark S. Swann – City Auditor

SUBJECT

Response to Audit of Proposed Budget Revenues Included in the Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget for the City of Dallas

This letter acknowledges the City Manager's Office and the Office of Budget & Management Services received the *Audit of Proposed Budget Revenues Included in the Fiscal Year 2021-22 Proposed Annual Budget for the City of Dallas.* 

The City has strong internal controls in place to ensure reasonable proposed budget revenues are included in the proposed annual budgets. We are pleased, but not surprised, that the City Auditor concluded that the City's revenue forecast methodologies are reasonable and adequately supported.

We appreciate the professionalism and quality of work demonstrated by your staff throughout this engagement.

Sincerely,

C: Kimberly Bizor Tolbert, Chief of Staff M. Elizabeth Reich, Chief Financial Officer

Jack Ireland, Director, Office of Budget & Management Services

"Our Product is Service"
Empathy | Ethics | Excellence | Equity