OFFICE OF THE CITY AUDITOR

VERIFICATION OF THE AFFIDAVITS OF COMPLIANCE RECEIVED UNDER THE CITY OF DALLAS' ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT TAX ABATEMENT CERTIFICATION PROCESS FOR 2002

Thomas M. Taylor, CPA City Auditor

Prepared by:

Paul T. Garner, CCP, CSP Senior Audit Manager

> Jim Greenwalt, CIA Auditor

May 2, 2003 Report No. 383

Memorandum



May 2, 2003

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council City of Dallas

At the request of the City Council Business and Commerce Committee, we have conducted a verification of the affidavits of compliance received under the City of Dallas' Economic Development Tax Abatement Certification Process.

Our observations and tests disclosed that the City of Dallas' Department of Development Services certification process for 2002 functioned as designed. The City has tax abatement agreements that reduce the City tax base by \$1,485,678,583 and represent \$10,396,779 in forgone City taxes for 2002. Additionally, as a result of our work, tax abatement account corrections will allow the City to levy an additional \$517,913 in taxes (\$9,775 in taxes for 2002 and an additional \$508,138 cumulatively over the period 2003-2010).

We appreciate the cooperation of City and Dallas Central Appraisal District staff during our examination.

Thomas M. Taylor

Thomas M. Taylor, CPA City Auditor

c: Teodoro J. Benavides, City Manager

VERIFICATION OF THE AFFIDAVITS OF COMPLIANCE RECEIVED UNDER THE CITY OF DALLAS' ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT TAX ABATEMENT CERTIFICATION PROCESS

CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
INTRODUCTION	1
Authorization Scope and Methodology Overall Conclusion Background	1 1 2 2
OPPORTUNITY FOR IMPROVEMENT	6
APPENDIX A	7
APPENDIX B	8
APPENDIX C	9
APPENDIX D	10
APPENDIX E	11
APPENDIX F	14

Authorization

At the request of the City Council Business and Commerce Committee, we have conducted a verification of the affidavits of compliance received under the City of Dallas' Economic Development Tax Abatement Certification Process. This verification was conducted under the authority of Chapter IX, Section 2 of the Dallas City Charter and the Annual Audit Plan approved by the City Council.

Scope and Methodology

The objectives were to determine whether:

- The companies had complied with the requirements outlined in the individual tax abatement agreements between the companies and the City.
- The companies had specifically complied with the improvements requirement as outlined in Section 2 and the job creation requirement as outlined in Section 3 of the tax abatement agreements between the companies and the City.
- The Economic Development Division (EDD) of the Department of Development Services had properly reviewed compliance of those abatees that previously met the improvement requirements.

Our audit was performed in accordance with generally accepted aovernment auditing standards accordingly, included tests of records and other procedures that we considered necessary in the The scope of our audit included the circumstances. verification of the information on the affidavits of compliance for 19 tax abatement agreements that began January 1, 2002 (Appendix A). Our review included onsite visits to the facilities. Additionally, we reviewed EDD records on 26 previously existing tax abatement agreements (Appendix B) and Housing Department records on its five previously existing tax abatement agreements (Appendix C). In our review of the tax abatement program, we tested the accuracy of property valuation information and tax abatement calculations provided by the Dallas Central Appraisal District (DCAD). We examined existing and proposed individual tax abatement accounts for compliance with the related contract terms as to the timing of the abatement and to its mathematical correctness.

Overall Conclusion

Our observations and tests disclosed that the City of Dallas has tax abatement agreements that reduce the City tax base by \$1,485,678,583 and represent \$10,396,779 in forgone City taxes for 2002. As a result of our work, tax abatement account corrections will allow the City to levy an additional \$517,913 in taxes (\$9,775 in taxes for 2002 and an additional \$508,138 cumulatively over the period 2003-2010). EDD's certification process for 2002 functioned as designed.

Background

The Public/Private Partnership Program is designed to increase the City's tax base by encouraging new business investment and promoting the creation/retention of quality jobs for Dallas residents. City Council Resolution #89-3264, October 11, 1989, adopted the initial Guidelines and Criteria governing the Public/Private Partnership Program for tax agreements and other includina incentive programs. infrastructure participation, development fee rebates. public improvement districts, and tax increment financing. According to state law, the City must readopt its Guidelines and Criteria every two years in order to offer tax abatement. The current Guidelines and Criteria were readopted on December 11, 2002.

Upon City Council authorization, the City provides tax abatement on added taxable value resulting from improvements made to either real estate or on the value of new business personal property. The value of land, existing real property improvements, or existing business personal property is not subject to tax abatement and remains on the City's tax rolls. Additionally, tax abatement is provided to prospective companies where "but for" the incentive the company would not have committed the project to a Dallas site. The "but for" test is assumed to be met in Southern Dallas and the Southern Dallas Enterprise Zones. The percentages and duration of tax abatement agreements vary based on geographical location, project type, investment, and job creation/retention. However, state law does not allow for tax abatement periods to exceed ten years.

Annually, all companies with existing tax abatement agreements must certify that they are in compliance with the terms and conditions of the tax abatement agreement in order to be eligible to receive an abatement on taxes due to the City. These conditions include, but are not limited to, job creation/retention, specific property improvement costs, dates for substantial completion of property improvements, and affordable housing requirements for residential abatements. Companies that do not submit affidavits of compliance to the City, and/or cannot evidence said compliance upon the request of City staff, should not receive the tax abatement.

In 2002, there were 107 eligible tax abatement agreements with the City (Appendix E). Of these agreements, 102 are under the direction of EDD. Five of the 107 agreements have affordable housing components and are under the direction of the Housing Department.

Of the 107 eligible tax abatement agreements, 83 agreements were certified to DCAD by EDD and the Housing Department to receive tax abatements in 2002. Of the 24 that were not certified to DCAD:

- Twelve were defaulted and terminated by EDD for not complying with their agreements.
- Four were denied for initial compliance.
- Seven are under review by EDD.
- One is now a tax-exempt property.

Of the 83 City certified agreements, nine did not receive tax abatements for one of the following reasons:

- Not making application for tax abatement to DCAD.
- Not having an increase in appraised value over the base year amount; therefore, there is no increased value to abate.
- Being disqualified by DCAD for:
 - Not submitting the correct application.
 - Not providing evidence to DCAD of an assignment of the agreement to reflect a change in ownership of the property.

The remaining 74 tax abatement agreements for entities that received tax abatements comprised 113 related tax accounts that reduced the City tax base by \$1,485,678,583 and represent \$10,396,779 in forgone City taxes for the 2002 tax year (Appendix F).

We reviewed documentation on the following EDD's records:

- Nineteen of the 107 tax abatement agreements had a tax abatement period beginning January 1, 2002. (Appendix A) We determined that 15 of these agreements were in compliance and were eligible for the 2002 tax abatement. Four of the agreements were denied certification by EDD and are not eligible for the 2002 tax abatement. Three of the four agreements were denied due to failure to submit documentation for initial compliance. The other agreement was denied because of unpaid real property taxes.
- Ten of the 107 tax abatement agreements were judgmentally selected for review (Appendix B). These ten agreements were existing abatement agreements that are reviewed annually previously met all compliance and had requirements. We concluded that all of the related submissions for City certification were correctly evaluated by EDD. Seven of the ten agreements were certified to DCAD. Three of the ten agreements were denied certification because of an insufficient number of jobs as required in the agreement or a failure to make their annual application or report the number of jobs.
- Sixteen of the 107 tax abatement agreements, in which the initial year of the "job creation" clause was in full effect, were reviewed. Stated another way, 2002 was the first year that the entity had to meet the "job creation" requirement of the tax abatement agreement (Appendix B). Thirteen of the sixteen agreements were in compliance and were subsequently certified by EDD to DCAD. The other three did not submit job creation data or had an insufficient number of jobs as required in the agreement and were consequently not certified by EDD.

Verification of the Affidavits of Compliance Received under the EDD Tax Abatement Certification Process

INTRODUCTION

The City Auditor's Office reviewed and verified documentation on the five tax abatement agreements under the Housing Department. The Housing Department determined these agreements were in compliance with the affordable housing components and were certified to DCAD.

No further action is required on the existing agreements that are certified by EDD and the Housing Department.

Verification of the Affidavits of Compliance Received under the EDD Tax Abatement Certification Process

OPPORTUNITY FOR IMPROVEMENT

Our review was not intended to be a detailed study of every system, procedure, or transaction. Accordingly, the opportunity for improvement presented in this report may not be all-inclusive of areas where improvement may be needed.

Corrections made to tax abatement records will allow the City to cumulatively levy an additional \$517,913 in taxes for 2002-10.

We identified 12 tax accounts with errors on the DCAD Tax Abatement Exemption for 2002 schedule (Appendix D). Eleven of the accounts were related to eight of the tax abatement agreements, and one account was not an abatement recipient. These twelve accounts were not correctly recorded in DCAD records because of clerical input errors. Subsequently, we informed DCAD of the necessary corrections, and DCAD accordingly corrected the twelve accounts. These corrections will result in the City levying an additional \$9,775 in taxes for 2002. These corrections will positively affect the future calculations of the related tax abatements until the expiration of their individual tax abatement agreements. Therefore, the City should cumulatively levy an additional \$508,138 in taxes over the period 2003-2010 if all the related agreements remain in force.

DCAD has made the appropriate corrections to the related tax accounts and has provided the corrected information to EDD. No further action is required by EDD or DCAD for the 2002 tax abatements. The City Auditor's Office continues to monitor the initial compliance requirements of the tax abatement agreements and verify the accuracy of DCAD tax account records and calculations for the City's tax abatement agreements.

We recommend that the Assistant Director of EDD develop procedures to annually sample tax accounts for accuracy of the records and to notify DCAD of any discrepancies in the records.

Management's Response:

Development Services requests that the Office of the City Auditor continue to verify the accuracy of DCAD tax account records for the City's tax abatement agreements.

APPENDIX A: 2002 TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENTS BEGINNING JANUARY 1, 2002

TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENTS BEGINNING JANUARY 1, 2002	IENT	S BEGINNING JANL	JARY 1, 200	2
COMPANY	4	ABATEMENT TYPE (REAL 2002 INITIAL TANGIBLE PERSONAL COMPLIANCE PROPERTY)	2002 INITIAL COMPLIANCE	COMMENTS
ALBERTSON'S, INC & WEST CLIFF SHOPPING PLAZA I LIMITED PARTNERSHIP	H	RP	YES	
ARGENT PINNACLE PARK, L.P. (PROLOGIS TRUST)	-	RP	YES	
AVW AUDIO VISUAL, INC. & 4846 W. DAVIS, LLC		RP	YES	
BRIDGFORD FOODS CORP. #2		RP	YES	
CORRAL GROUP, INC.		RP	YES	
CRASH RESCUE	(1)	RP	ON	Did not submit Affidavit of Compliance
CUMBRE, INC.		RP	YES	
E. L. BOSS, JR., DBA BOTANICAL TECHNOLOGIES, INC.	(1)	RP	ON	Did not submit Affidavit of Compilance
HILLWOOD METRO NO. 8 L.L.C.		RP	YES	
ICDC	(1)	RP	ON	Did not submit Affidavit of Compilance
JEFFERSON AT KESSLER HEIGHTS (APTS)		RP	YES	
MORNING PARK, INC. as nominee for MPI REALTY, LTD.		RP	YES	
NEW WORLD AUTO IMPORTS INC. & SHAHAB SALEHOUN	(1)	RP	ON	Unpaid property taxes
OVERHEAD DOOR CORPORATION		TPP	YES	
PRO-LINE INTERNATIONAL, INC.		TPP	YES	
QUALEX PHOTOFINISHING LABS, INC.		TPP	YES	
STEWART & STEVENSON SERVICES, INC.		RP	YES	
USAA REAL ESTATE COMPANY		RP	YES	
WEST CLIFF SHOPPING PLAZA I LIMITED PARTNERSHIP		RP	YES	
Englishee.				

Footnotes: (1) Were not certified to receive tax abatement for 2002.

APPENDIX B: 2002 TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENTS JOB REVIEW

2002 IAA ABALEMENI AGREEMENIS JOBS REVIEW	-			The same of the sa	THE RESIDENCE OF THE PERSON NAMED IN
COMPANY		ABATEMENT TYPE (REAL / TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY)	2002 JOBS COMPLIANCE TESTING	2002 JOBS COMPLIANCE	COMMENTS
ABF FREIGHT SYSTEM, INC.		RP	ANNUAL	YES	
COMPUCOM SYSTEMS, INC. (COMP DELEWARE LP)	(1)	RP	ANNUAL	ON	No job information received
DALLAS FREIGHTLINER, INC. (BOWEN & ASSOC, LLC)		RP	ANNUAL	YES	
ERNST & YOUNG W/C-W #5 LTD (SAN JACINTO)		TPP	ANNUAL	YES	
FIRST USA FINANCIAL, INC. (COMERICA)	(1)	TPP	ANNUAL	ON	Insufficient number of jobs
FIRSTPLUS FINANCIAL GROUP WILEPERCO		RP	ANNUAL	YES	
HKS/OLY PRTSHP (ECOM)		RP	ANNUAL	YES	
VEXTLINK TEXAS, INC. (X O COMMUNICATION)	(1)	TPP	ANNUAL	ON	No job information received
SEARS LOGISTICS SERVICES, INC.		TPP	ANNUAL	YES	
TEXAS INSTRUMENTS, INC. (DMOS 6/R&D1)		TPP	ANNUAL	YES	
AFFILIATED COMPUTER SERVICES, INC.		RP	INITIAL	. YES	
ALBERTSON'S, INC (JEFFERSON)		RP	INITIAL	YES	
ALLEGIANCE TELECOM, INC. (Phase I)		TPP	INITIAL	YES	
ERNST & YOUNG LLP (MAIN)		TPP	INITIAL	YES	
FREEMAN DECORATING COMPANY		RP	INITIAL	YES	
FRITO-LAY (STONEBRIDGE)		RP	INITIAL	YES	
HBE CORP. (SEVEN SEVENTEEN HB)		RP	INITIAL	YES	
NTERNET MARKETING & CREATIVE CONCEPTS (IMC*)		RP	INITIAL	YES	
MORNING STAR PRODUCTIONS, INC.	(1)	RP	INITIAL	ON	Insufficient number of jobs
OMNICON GROUP, INC & HARWOOD CENTER LP		TPP	INITIAL	YES	
PINNACLE INDUSTRIAL CENTER LP (BLDG A)		RP	INITIAL	YES	
QUILTCRAFT INDUSTRIES, INC. & LJP REALTY, LTD.		TPP	INITIAL	YES	
REUNION HOTEL/TOWER JV & HUNT-WOODBINE REALTY		RP	INITIAL	YES	
ROBERT YOUNG ASSC & RYA INVESTMENT CO	(1)	RP	INITIAL	ON	Insufficient number of jobs
SOUTHERN FOOD GROUPS (SCHEPPS DAIRY)		RP	INITIAL	YES	
SYLVAN I:30 ENTERPRISES, INC.	(1)	RP	INITIAL	ON	No job information received

OFFICE OF THE CITY AUDITOR

APPENDIX C: 2002 TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENTS HOUSING DEPARTMENT (MULTI-FAMILY)

PERSONAL PROPERTY)	TESTING	THE PROPERTY OF	
RP	THE RESERVE THE PARTY OF THE PA	TESTING	
	ANNUAL	YES	
RP	ANNUAL	YES	
8 8 8			ANNUAL

APPENDIX D: 2002 TAX ABATEMENT CORRECTIONS

			200	12 TAX ABA	2002 TAX ABATEMENT CORRECTIONS	RRECTIO	NS							
COMPANY	DCAD REPORT		ACCOUNT	EXPIRATION DATE	TAXES SAVED	2003 TAXES SAVED	2004 TAXES SAVED	2005 TAXES SAVED	2006 TAXES SAVED	2007 TAXES SAVED	2008 TAXES SAVED	2009 TAXES SAVED	2010 TAXES SAVED	TOTALS
AFFILIATED COMPUTER SERVICES, INC.	(1)	00000194	194122000000	2010	\$2,858	\$2,858	\$2,858	\$2,858	\$2,869	\$2,869	\$2,869	\$2,869	\$2,589	\$25,7
AFFILIATED COMPUTER SERVICES, INC.	(2)	00000	000001942995000000	2010	\$3,125	\$3,125	\$3,126	\$3,126	\$3,137	\$3,137	\$3,137	\$3,137	\$3,137	\$28.1
8912 LLC	(3)	00000	00000778924000000	NONE	\$2,287		\$2,287	\$2,287		\$2,295	\$2,295	\$2,295	\$2,295	\$20.62
INTERNATIONAL CENTER DEVELOPMENT II & III, LTD.	(4)	00092	000929000101A0000	2005	\$1,505			\$1,505	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$8.0
BOWEN & ASSOCIATES	(2)	00000	00000575963000000	2003			NA	NA	16	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$4,548
BOWEN & ASSOCIATES	1 (9)	00000	00000575964000000	2003	NA.	\$924	6	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	292
ABFFREIGHT	(7)	00770	007708000A0010000	2006	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$10,605	NA	NA	NA	\$10,60
OFH FTAX LP	000	00755	0075570F0000000700	2006	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$39,465	NA	NA	NA	\$39,466
CFH FTAX LP	4 (8)	00755	0075570F000000000	2006	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$24,022	NA	NA	NA.	\$24,0
EBAN VILLAGE I LTD	(10)		00135700022040000	2006	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$8,704	NA	NA	NA	\$8,704
ROSS AKARD ACQUISITION	(11)	00000	00000112294000000	2005	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$11,913	\$11,913	\$11,913	\$11,913	\$11,913	\$59,580
ALLEGIANCE TELECOM	(12) 2		99200021600193950	2002	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	\$96,492	\$96,492	\$98,492	\$289,47
TOTAL TAXES SAVED					\$9,775	\$15,247	\$9,775	\$9,775	\$20,214	\$103,010	\$116,706	\$116,706 \$116,706	\$116,706	\$517,913
2003-2010 CUMMULATIVE SAVINGS						\$15,247	\$25,022	\$34,797	\$55,011	\$158,021	\$274,727	\$391,433	\$391,433 \$508,138	
			The second second	EX	EXPLANATIONS				1			2000		
(1) AFFILIATED COMPUTER SERVICES, INC.	DCAD) had an inco	CAD had an incorrect base value											ı
(2) AFFILIATED COMPUTER SERVICES, INC.	DCAD	Thad an inco	CAD had an incorrect base value											
(3) 8912 LLC	Not an	n abated prop	perty, but on DC	AD report to re	lot an abated property, but on DCAD report to receive abatement until 2010.	until 2010.								
(4) INTERNATIONAL CENTER DEVELOPMENT II & III, LTD.	DCAD) had an inco	CAD had an incorrect base value											
(s) BOWEN & ASSOCIATES	DCAD	Thed an inco	CAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2004 (of eligibility dat	e of 2004 (1 add	1 additional year).								
(4) BOWEN & ASSOCIATES	DCAD	Thad an inco	CAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2004	of eligibility data	e of 2004 (1 add	1 additional year).								
(7) ABF FREIGHT	DCAD) had an inco	med expiration	of eligibility dat	CAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2007 (1 additional year)	tional year).								
(8) CFH FTAX LP	DCAD	Thed an Inco	rrect expiration	of eligibility dat	CAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2007 [1 additional year]	Sonal year).								
(9) CPH FTAX LP	DCAD	Chad an inco	rrect expiration	of eligibility dat	CAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2007 (1 additional year)	fional year).								
(10) EBAN VILLAGE LLTD	DCAD	O had an inco	rrect expiration	of eligibility dat	CAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2007 (1 additional year)	fornal year).								
(11) ROSS AKARD ACQUISITION	DCAD	D had an inco	rrect expiration	of eligibility dat	ICAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2010 (5 additional years)	ional years)								
112) ALLEGIANCE TELECOM	DCAD	Thad an inco	med expiration	of elicibility data	CAD had an incorrect expiration of eligibility date of 2010 (3 additional years)	Speay lengt								

APPENDIX E: 2002 ELIGIBLE TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENTS

COMPANY		AGRM	EFF	TERM	ABATE	BASE	EXPR	RESLT
(MULTI-FAMILY IN BOLD)		TYPE	DATE	YEARS	%	YEAR	DATE	NO.
COMMERCIAL					4000	4000	2000	06 2066
ABF FREIGHT SYSTEM, INC.	(7)	RP	1997	10	100%	1996	2006	95-3255
AETNA LIFE/CARTER-CROWLEY	(7)	TPP	1997	10	100%	1996	2006	96-1390
AFFILIATED COMPUTER SERVICES, INC.	(5)	RP	2001	10	75%	2001	2010	00-027
ALBERTSON'S, INC & WEST CLIFF SHOPPING PLAZA I LIMITED PARTNERSHI	(7)	RP	2002	10	90%	2001	2011	01-247
ALBERTSON'S, INC (JEFFERSON)	(7)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	99-332
ALDER TOOKS, ING (ALL) ENGOTY		1	2000					99-333
ALLEGIANCE TELECOM, INC W/ NCX OFFICE DEVELOPMENT, LP (Phase I)	(7)	TPP	2001	10	75%	2000	2010	00-143
ALLEGIANCE TELECOM, INC. W/IM JV	(7)	TPP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	98-032
AMBERJACK, LTD. (STONEBRIDGE LC)	(7)	RP	1997	10	90%	1996	2006	96-364
AMERICAN PALLET RECYCLERS, INC. & OSTROVITZ AND GWINN, LLC	(3)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-015 97-345
ARGENT PINNACLE PARK, L.P. (PROLOGIS TRUST)	(7)	RP	2002	10	90%	2001	2011	00-191
AT&T CORP. & CROWN EXCHANGE PARTNERS	(3)	RP	1995	10	100%	1994	2004	94-400
AVW AUDIO VISUAL, INC. & 4546 W. DAVIS, LLC	(7)	RP	2002	10	75%	2001	2011	01-078
BRIDGFORD FOODS CORP. #2 (CHANCELLOR ROW)	(5)	RP	2002	8	75%	2000	2009	00-294
BRIDGFORD FOODS CORP. (GOOD-LATIMER)	(7)	RP	1996	10	100%	1995	2005	94-435
BRONCO BOWL HOLDING, INC.	(7)	RP	1996	10	75%	1995	2005	95-195
BUD'S SALADS, INC.	(7)	RP	1994	10	100%	1993	2003	93-207
CENTEX CORPORATION W/ CENTEX OFFICE CITYMARK I, LP	(7)	TPP	2001	5	50%	1999	2005	99-388
CENTEX CORPORATION W/ INTERNATIONAL CENTER DEVELOPMENT II & III	(7)	TPP	1997	10	75%	1996	2006	95-054
COMERICA BANK	(7)	RP	1995	10	100%	1994	2004	94-22
COMPUCOM SYSTEMS, INC.	(1)	RP	1997	10/5	75%/50%	1996	2006	96-29
COPPER TANK BREWING CO. (MEGGS RICHARD LLC)	(1)	RP	1996	10	100%	1995	2005	95-418
CORPORATE REINVESTMENTS	(7)	RP	2002	10	90%	2000	2011	00-19
CORRAL GROUP, INC.	(7)	RP	2001	10	90%	2000	2010	00-057
CRASH RESCUE	(2)	RP	2002	10	50%	2002	2011	00-188
CROW FAMILY HOLDINGS INDUSTRIAL TEXAS LP	(7)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	99-38
CUMBRE, INC	(5)	RP	2002	5	50%	2001	2006	01-22
DALLAS AUTO AUCTION W/ ADT PROPERTY HOLDINGS	(7)	RP	1993	10	50%/75%	1991	2002	91-20
DALLAS FREIGHTLINER, INC. (BOWEN & ASSOC. LLC)	(7)	RP	1994	10	100%	1993	2003	94-08
DALLAS TRANSFER & TERMINAL STORAGE	(7)	RP	1994	10	100%	1993	2003	93-30
DALLAS WORLD AQUARIUM CORP. (DARYL RICHARDSON GOURMET)	(7)	RP	1993	10	50%	1992	2002	92-16 95-41
DAYTON HUDSON CORP. (TARGET)	(7)	RP	1994	10	100%	1994	2003	93-41
DSW INVESTMENTS LIMITED & DSW INVESTMENTS I, INC.	(7)	RP	2001	10	90%	2000	2010	00-08
E. L. BOSS, JR., DBA BOTANICAL TECHNOLOGIES, INC.	(2)	RP	2001	10	50%	1999	2010	99-05
EDDINS ENTERPRISES, INC. (FRIENDLY CHEVROLET)	(7)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-25
ERNST & YOUNG LLP & RAK MAIN PLACE ASSOCIATES L.P. (MAIN)	(7)	TPP	2000	5	75%	1999	2004	99-17
ERNST & YOUNG LLP & RAK MAIN PLACE ASSOCIATES L.P. (MAIN) ERNST & YOUNG W/C-W #5 LTD (SAN JACINTO)	(7)	TPP	1998	10	100%	1995	2007	95-34
EXE TECHNOLOGIES, INC. W/BLI-8787	(5)	RP	1999	10	90%	1998	2008	98-35
FAIR PARK HEALTH CARE, INC. (DALLAS N.H. REALTY LTD)	(7)	RP	1995	10	100%	1994	2004	94-02
FEATHERLITE BUILDING PRODUCTS	(7)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-15
FIRST USA FINANCIAL, INC. (COMERICA)	(1)	TPP	1996	10	100%	1995	2005	95-06
FIRSTPLUS FINANCIAL GROUP WILEPERCQ	(5)	RP	1998	10	50%	1997	2007	97-39
FOR KEEP'S SAKE, INC.	(7)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-36
FREEMAN DECORATING COMPANY & RED BIRD INDUSTRIAL PARK, LP	(7)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	99-10
FRITO-LAY (STONEBRIDGE)	(7)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	99-03
FRITD-LAY, INC.	(7)	TPP	1995	10	50% & 75%	1994	2004	94-35 95-41
								97-01

APPENDIX E: 2002 ELIGIBLE TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENTS

Water the Property of Control of		AGRM	EFF	TERM	ABATE	BASE	EXPR	RESLT
(MULTI-FAMILY IN BOLD)		TYPE	DATE	YEARS	%	YEAR	DATE	NO.
HBE CORP. (SEVEN SEVENTEEN HB)	(7)	RP	1999	10	100% & 90%	1997	2008	96-390
HILLWOOD METRO NO. 6 L.L.C.	(7)	RP	2002	10	90%	2000	2011	00-3732
HKS/OLY PRTSHP (ECOM)	(7)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-254
HOME DEPOT, INC. (HD DEV PROPERTIES LP) (LEMMON)	(7)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-031
HOME DEPOT, INC. W/2800 FOREST LN	(7)	RP	1998	5	25%	1997	2002	97-045
CDC	(2)	RP	2000	10	90%	1998	2009	98-158 99-233
INTERNATIONAL CENTER DEVELOPMENT II & III, LTD.	(7)	RP	1996	10	100%	1995	2005	95-065
INTERNET MARKETING & CREATIVE CONCEPTS (IMC?) & CULLUM INTEREST	(7)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	99-233
LAZO TECHNOLOGIES, INC.	(7)	TPP	1999	10	50%	1998	2008	98-178
LBI ELECTRO OPTICS CORP. (GUS WARREN)	(1)	RP	1999	10	90%	1998	2008	98-311
LOGIX COMMUNICATIONS WINFOMART	(1)	TPP	1999	10	90%	1998	2008	98-190
MCDONALDS CORP. WIKAREN SKINNER	(7)	RP	1995	10	100%	1994	2004	94-251
MEDLINE INDUSTRIES, INC. (1200 TOWN LINE RD ASSOC)	(7)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-119
MINYARD PROPERTIES W/MINYARD FOODS (MLK)	(6)	RP	1995	10	100%	1994	2004	94-09
MINYARDS FOOD STORES, INC. (CAMP WISDOM)	(7)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	98-01
MOCKINGBIRD PARTNERS LP (3300 HOTEL PROPERTY)	(7)	RP	1999	10	90%	1998	2008	98-03
MORNING STAR PRODUCTIONS, INC. /	(3)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	98-35
NEW WORLD AUTO IMPORTS INC. & SHAHAB SALEHOUN	(2)	RP	2002	10	90%	2001	2011	01-05
NEXTLINK TEXAS, INC. W/AP.PRESCOTT (X O COMMUNICATION)	(1)	TPP	1999	10	75%	1998	2008	98-33
NORWEST CORP.	(3)	RP	1997	10	90%	1996	2006	96-38
OMNICOM GROUP, INC & HARWOOD CENTER LP	(7)	TPP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	99-23
OPTEL (TVMAX TELECOMMUNICATIONS INC)	(3)	TPP	1999	10	90%	1998	2008	98-18
OVERHEAD DOOR CORPORATION	(7)	TPP	2002	7	75%	2001	2008	01-30
PCS PRIMECO LP (PAGING NETWORK)	(1)	TPP	1996	10	75%	1995	2005	95-24
PECAN DELUXE CANDY COMPANY	(7)	RP	1994	10	100%	1993	2003	93-35
PECO II, INC.	(3)	TPP	2001	10	75%	2000	2010	00-06
PINNACLE INDUSTRIAL CENTER LP (BLDG A)	(7)	RP	2001	10	90%	1998	2010	98-36
PINNACLE INDUSTRIAL CENTER LP (BLDG-E-C)	(7)	RP	2001	10	90%	1998	2010	98-36
PINNACLE INDUSTRIAL CENTER LP (BLDG-H-G)	(7)	RP	2001	10	90%	1998	2010	98-36
PRO-LINE INTERNATIONAL, INC.	(7)	TPP	2002	10	90%	2000	2011	00-37
QUALEX PHOTOFINISHING LABS, INC.	(7)	TPP	2002	5	50%	2001	2006	01-05
QUILTCRAFT INDUSTRIES, INC. & LIP REALTY, LTD.	(7)	TPP	2000	10	75%	1999	2009	99-01
REUNION HOTEL/TOWER JV & HUNT-WOODBINE REALTY	(7)	RP	2001	10	90%	1998	2009	98-24
ROBERT YOUNG ASSC & RYA INVESTMENT CO	(1)	RP	2000	5	50%	1999	2004	99-17
ROSS AKARD ACQUISITION, LP	(5)	RP	2001	5	50%	2000	2005	00-16
SEARS LOGISTICS SERVICES, INC.	(7)	TPP	1999	10	75%	1998	2008	98-31
SOUTHERN FOOD GROUPS (SCHEPPS DAIRY)	(5)	RP	2000	10	90%	1998	2009	98-32
STANDARD FRUIT AND VEGETABLE CO., INC.	(5)	RP	1998	10	90%	1997	2007	97-15
STANDARD MEAT COMPANY LP (SYSCO FOOD SERVICES)	(1)	RP	1996	10	100%	1995	2005	95-19
STEMMONS CORNERSTONE CROSSING I, L.P. & JUS-MADE	(7)	RP	2001	7	90%	2000	2007	00-23
STEWART & STEVENSON SERVICES, INC.	(7)	RP	2002	10	90%	2000	2011	00-16
SUPREME PRINTING COMPANY	(1)	TPP	1995	10	100%	1995	2004	95-06
SYLVAN I-30 ENTERPRISES, INC.	(1)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	99-13
TCDFW UNT BTS, LP (CROW FAMILY HOLDINGS)	(7)	RP	2000	7	90%	1999	2006	99-38
TEXAS INSTRUMENTS, INC. (DMOS 6/R&D1)	(7)	TPP	1998	10	100%	1996	2007	98-11
TOWER 2001 LP (BRYAN TOWER)	(7)	RP	1999	10	100%	1996	2008	96-11
TRANSAMERICA CORP. WITRIZEC RENAISSANCE	(7)	TPP	1997	10	90%	1996	2006	96-18
UNITED FRONT OF DALLAS	(4)	RP	1,001				2300	98-19
USAA REAL ESTATE COMPANY (SBC)	(7)	RP	2002	10	90%	2001	2011	00-19

APPENDIX E: 2002 ELIGIBLE TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENTS

COMPANY (MULTI-FAMILY IN BOLD)		AGRM TYPE		TERM. YEARS	ABATE	BASE YEAR	EXPR DATE	RESLTN NO.
	(1)	RP	1997	10	100%	1995	2006	95-2431 96-0442
	(7)	RP	1997	10	90%	1996	2006	96-3282 96-3283
	(7)	TPP	2001	5	50%	2000	2005	00-0871
	(7)	RP	1999	10	90%	1998	2008	08-3548
	(3)	RP	1999	10	90%	1998	2008	96-2742
The state of the s	(7)	RP	2000	10	90%	1999	2009	98-1750 99-3648
WEST CLEF SHOPPING PLAZA I LIMITED PARTNERSHIP	(7)	RP	2002	10	90%	2002	2011	00-1181 00-1183 01-2473
MULTI-FAMILY								
EBAN VILLAGE I, LTD. (APTS)	(7)	RP	1997	10	100%	1997	2006	97-0679
GASTON APT LP PS (APTS)	(7)	RP	1999	10	90%	1997	2008	97-0692
	(7)	RP	1997	10	100%	1995	2006	94-3886
	(7)	RP	2002	10	100%	1999	2011	96-3583 99-1298
JEFFERSON AT THE NORTH END LP (APTS)	(7)	RP	1999	10	100%	1996	2008	95-2468 96-2261
Footnotes: 1. Defaulted and terminated by Economic Development Division. 2. Denied For Initial compliance for 2002. 3. Under review by Economic Development Division. 4. Tax exempt property. 5. Base value higher or equal to market value (no added value). 6. Submitted incorrect application. 7. Received tax abatement.								

APPENDIX F: 2002 TAX ABATEMENTS

			2002	TAX	ABATEMENTS			The state of the s	The second second second
COMPANY	ABATEMENT TYPE (REAL/ TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY)	EFFECTIVE DATE	TERM	PERCENTAGE	EXPIRATION DATE	2002 MARKET VALUE	2002 APPRAISED VALUE ABATED	2002 ABATED TAXES @\$0.6998 PER \$100	2002 LEVIED TAXES @\$0.6998 PER \$100
COMMERCIAL									
ABF FREIGHT SYSTEM, INC.	RP	1997	10	100%	2006	\$4,151,250	\$1,515,470	\$10,605	\$18,44
AETMA LIFEICARTER-CROWLEY	TPP	1997	10	100%	2006	\$16,172,750	\$13,638,810		20
LBERTSONS, INC. & WEST CLIFF SC (HAMPTON)	RP	2002	10	%06	2011	\$3,916,860	\$3,525,174	\$24,669	\$2,741
ALBERTSONS, INC. (JEFFERSON)	RP	2000	10	%06	2009	\$6,675,900	\$5,404,032		
ALLEGIANCE TELECOM, INC. WINCX OFFICE DEV (PHASE I)	TPP	2001	10	75%	2010	\$16,795,100	\$12,596,324	\$88,149	\$29,38
LLEGIANCE TELECOM, INC. WIM JV	TPP	1998	10	%06	2007	\$45,294,400	\$40,764,555	\$285,270	\$31,700
AMBERIACK, LTD (STONEBRIDGE LC)	RP	1997	10	%06	2006	\$10,584,750	\$9,072,072	\$63,486	\$10,586
RIGENT PINNACLE PARK L.P. (PROLOGIS TRUST)	RP	2002	10	%06	2011	\$16,558,430	\$12,901,615	\$90,286	\$25,590
WW AUDIO VISUAL, INC. 8 4646 W. DAVIS, LLC	RP	2002	10	75%	2011	\$5,449,950	\$3,649,462		\$12,600
BRIDGEORD FOODS CORP. (GOOD-LATIMER)	RP	1996	10	100%	2005	\$2,053,740	\$1,013,950		\$7,27
BRONCO BOWL HOLDING, INC.	RP	1996	10	75%	2005	\$3,008,360	\$1,433,947	51	\$11,01
BUD'S SALADS, INC.	RP	1994	10	100%	2003	\$112,430	\$15,600	\$109	\$67
SENTEX CORPORATION W/ CENTEX OFFICE CITYMARK I, LP	ТРР	2001	10	9,09	2005	\$759,000	\$379,500		\$2,656
ENTEX CORPORATION W/ INTERNATIONAL CENTER DEV	ТРР	1997	10	75%	2006	\$17,338,240	\$9,899,844		\$52,054
COMERICA BANK	RP	1995	10	100%	2004	\$7,440,880	\$4,906,750		\$17,73
ORPORATE REINVESTMENTS (MORNING PARK, INC)	RP	2002	10	%06	2011	\$36,797,750	\$32,800,239	\$229,536	\$27.97
ORRAL GROUP, INC.	RP	2001	10	%06	2010	\$1,178,240	\$760,239	\$5,320	\$2,92
ROW FAMILY HOLDINGS INDUSTRIAL TEXAS LP	RP	2000	10	%06	2009	\$8,095,060	\$6,936,561	\$48,542	
DALLAS AUTO AUCTION WEADT PROPERTY HOLDINGS	RP	1993	10	50%/75%	2002	\$7,246,630	\$3,799,552	\$26,589	\$24,12
DALLAS FREISHTUNER, INC. (BOWEN & ASSOC, LLC)	RP	1994	10	100%	2003	\$2,202,000	\$782,000		\$9,93
MLLAS TRANSFER & TERMINAL STORAGE	RP	1994	10	100%	2003	\$3,400,000	\$1,580,000	03	\$12,876
IALLAS WORLD AQUARRUM CORP.	RP	1993	10	20%	2002	\$3,146,380	\$1,169,945		\$13,83
SAYTON HUDSON CORP. (TARGET)	RP	1994	10	100%	2003	\$7,160,170	\$3,309,780	\$23,162	\$26,94
5W INVESTMENTS LIMITED & DSW INVESTMENTS I, INC.	RP	2001	10	%06	2010	\$1,695,710	\$247,833	51,734	\$10,13
DOINS ENTERPRISES, INC. (FRIENDLY CHEVIOLET)	RP	1998	10	20%	2007	\$8,998,600	54,330,773	330,307	\$32,00
ERNST & YOUNG LLP & RAK MAIN PLACE ASSOCI L.P. (MAIN)	dal	2000	0	10%	2004	95,080,700	97,803,024		19
AND DADO WELL THE CASE WELLINGS TO SEE SPECIAL TO STATE TO SEE THE STATE OF THE SECOND	440	1990	2 0	4000	2000	64 063 480	6404.750		58.83
EATHER! ITE BUILDING PRODUCTS	00	1008	10	7,00	2007	\$2 730 420	\$1.837.784	\$11.461	\$7.648
OR KEEP'S SAKE, INC.	RP	1998	10	%06	2007	\$309,850	\$175,365	\$1,227	\$94
REEMAN DECORATING COMPANY & RED BIRD IND PARK, LP.	RP	2000	10	%06	2009	\$11,208,450	\$9,597,555	\$67,164	\$11,27
FRITO-LAY 1999	RP	2000	10	%06	2009	\$2,936,370	\$2,189,052	\$15,319	\$5,23
RITO-LAY, INC.	TPP	1995	10	50% & 75%	2004	\$34,652,870	\$18,176,946	\$127,202	\$115,29
GRANNUM COMMUNICATIONS DALLAS, INC. (GCI DALLAS)	RP	1996	10	100%	2002	\$607,920	\$182,920	\$1,280	\$2,97
4BE CORP. (SEVEN SEVENTEEN HB)	RP	1999	10	100% & 90%	2008	\$106,298,750	\$87,931,092	\$615,342	\$128,53
HILINDOD METRO NO. 8 L.L.C.	RP	2002	10	%06	2011	\$12,136,520	\$10,814,598	\$75,681	\$9,25
HKS/OLY PRTSHP (ECOM)	RP	1998	10	%06	2002	\$8,000,000	\$5,549,904	\$38,838	\$17,14
KOME DEPOT, INC. (HD DEV PROPERTIES LP) (LEMMON)	RP	1998	10	%06	2007	\$9,562,000	\$4,050,837	\$28,348	\$38,56
HOME DEPOT, INC. MIZ800 FOREST LIN (KILKEE TRUST)	RP	1998	2	25%	2002	\$11,542,840	\$959,250		\$74,064
NTERNATIONAL CENTER DEVELOPMENT II & III, LTD.	RP	1996	10	100%	2005	\$59,965,930	\$57,798,470	,	\$15,16
ATERNET MARKETING & CREATIVE CONCEPTS (IMC*)	RP	2000	10	%06	5008	\$3,316,000	\$1,491,489	"	\$12.76
AZO TECHNICI CICIES (NC	TDD	1000	40	50%	SOOR	\$2 775 430	5276 ABA	64 035	267.40

APPENDIX F: 2002 TAX ABATEMENTS

			4004	2	ADA LEMENT	,	Secretary or designation of the last	The second little designation of the least	Section of the Section of Section 2
COMPANY	ABATEMENT TYPE (REAL/ TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY)	EFFECTIVE DATE	YEARS	ABATEMENT PERCENTAGE	EXPIRATION DATE	2002 MARKET VALUE	2002 APPRAISED VALUE ABATED	2002 ABATED TAXES @\$0.6998 PER \$100	2002 LEVIED TAXES @\$0.6998 PER \$100
MCDONALDS CORP. WIXAREN SKINNER	RP	1985	10	100%	2004	\$541,810	\$396,420	\$2,774	10'1\$
MEDLINE INDUSTRIES, INC. (1200 TOWN LINE RD ASSOC)	RP	1998	10	%06	2007	\$4,027,110	\$3,450,861	\$24,149	\$4,03.
MINYARDS FOOD STORES, INC. (CAMP WISDOM)	RP	2000	10	%06	2009	\$3,613,900	\$2,762,460	\$19,332	36'9\$
MOCKINGBIRD PARTNERS LP (3300 HOTEL PROPERTY)	RP	1999	10	%06	2008	\$5,500,000	\$3,817,854	\$26,717	211,77
OMNICON GROUP, INC & HARMOOD CENTER LP	TPP	2000	10	%06	2009	\$1,641,070	\$1,089,110	\$7,622	\$3,863
COVERHEAD DOOR CORPORATION	TPP	2002	7	75%	2008	\$3,827,800	\$2,846,424	\$19,919	\$6,86
PECAN DELUXE CANDY COMPANY	RP	1994	10	100%	2003	\$2,872,740	\$2,547,270	\$17,826	\$2,27
PINNACLE INDUSTRIAL CENTER LP (BLDG A)	RP	2001	10	%06	2010	\$11,217,560	\$9,962,121	\$69,715	\$8,786
PINNACLE INDUSTRIAL CENTER LP (BLDG-E C)	RP	2001	10	%06	2010	\$11,520,000	\$10,221,157	\$71,528	\$9,08
PINNACLE INDUSTRIAL CENTER LP (BLDG-H G)	RP	2001	10	%06	2010	\$6,000,000	\$5,328,234	\$37,287	\$4,70
PRO-LINE INTERNATIONAL, INC.	TPP	2002	10	%06	2011	\$10,903,150	\$316,472	\$2,215	\$74,086
QUALEX PHOTOFINISHING LABS, INC.	TPP	2002	2	50%	2006	\$9,804,180	\$553,202	\$3,871	\$64,73
QUILTCRAFT INDUSTRIES, INC. & LJP REALTY, LTD.	TPP	2000	10	75%	2009	\$2,012,880	\$66,843	\$468	\$13,61
REUNION HOTEL/TOWER JV & HUNT-WOODBINE REALTY	RP	2001	10	%06	2009	\$85,927,760	\$24,297,912	\$170,037	\$431,28
SEARS LOGISTICS SERVICES, INC.	TPP	1999	10	75%	2008	\$4,919,300	\$192,087	\$1,344	\$33,08
STEMMONS CORNERSTONE CROSSING L.L.P. & JUS-MADE	RP	2001	7	%06	2007	\$4,919,880	\$3,081,807	\$21,586	\$12,86
STEWART & STEVENSON SERVICES, INC.	RP	2002	10	90%	2011	\$10,727,740	\$9,483,543	\$86,366	
TCDFW UNT BTS, LP (CROW FAMILY HOLDINGS)	RP	2000	7	%06	2006	\$7,808,910	\$6,894,678	\$48,249	
TEXAS INSTRUMENTS, INC. (DMOS 6R8D1)	TPP	1998	10	100%	2007	\$831,456,910	\$816,219,062	\$5,711,901	\$106,63
TOWER 2001 LP	RP	1999	10	100%	2008	\$55,872,840	\$43,007,840	\$300,969	\$90,02
TRANSAMERICA CORP. WITRIZEC RENAISSANCE	TPP	1997	10	80%	2006	\$9,981,520	\$8,981,478	\$62,852	966'9\$
USAA REAL ESTATE COMPANY (SBC)	RP	2002	10	80%	2011	\$22,834,570	\$12,282,570	\$85,953	\$73,843
UTILITY TRALER OF DALLAS, INC.	RP	1997	10	80%	2006	\$1,799,520	\$1,384,722	\$9,690	\$2,903
VARTEC TELECOM, INC. & LEPERCO CORP INCOME FUND, L.P.		2001	2	90%	2005	\$7,935,000	\$3,168,455	\$22,173	S
VICEROY DELIVERY LP WIDELIVERY LIMITED, INC.	RP	1999	10	%06	2008	\$1,800,000	\$631,341	\$4,418	
WALT HALL KIRBY ASSOCIATES, LTD.	RP	2000	10	90%	2009	\$4,123,880	\$2,792,439	\$19,541	\$9,31
WEST CLIFF SHOPPING PLAZA I LIMITED PARTNERSHIP	RP	2002	10	%06	2011	\$4,092,920	\$2,760,831	\$19,320	\$9,32
TOTAL COMMERCIAL (rounded)				200000000000000000000000000000000000000		\$1,642,066,000	\$1,365,303,520	\$9,554,394	\$1,936,784
MULTI-FAMILY				A					
EBAN VILLAGE L LTD. (TABONO JV) (APTS)	RP	1997	10	100%	2006	\$1,600,000	\$1,243,790	\$8,704	
GASTON APT LP PS (APTS)	RP	1997	10	100%	2006	\$33,350,000	\$30,928,460	\$216,437	\$16,946
JEFFERSON AT BRYAN PLACE, LP (APTS)	RP	1999	10	%06	2008	\$32,532,530	\$28,168,303	\$197,122	\$30,54
JEFFERSON AT KESSLER HEIGHTS (APTS)	RP	2002	10	100%	2011	\$18,964,200	\$17,145,910		\$12,72
JEFFERSON AT THE NORTH END LP (APTS)	RP	1999	10	100%	2008	\$44,500,000	\$42,888,600		\$11,27
TOTAL MULTI-FAMILY (rounded)		TO SUCKE IN	20000000	100000000000000000000000000000000000000	200000000	\$130,946,730	\$120,375,063	\$842,385	\$73,98
SCHOOL ASSESSMENT AND ASSESSMENT OF THE PARTY OF THE PART						A44 444 444 44	. 40E 640 E03		40.040.704