

**REDISTRICTING COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES  
DALLAS CITY HALL, ROOM 6ES  
THURSDAY, AUGUST 4, 2011**

Commission Members Present:

Dr. Ruth Morgan, Chair  
Billy Ratcliff, Vice Chair  
Hollis Brashear  
Domingo Garcia  
Gary Griffith  
Donna Halstead  
Mary Hasan  
Mark Hord  
Elizabeth Jones  
Jon Brooks Love  
John Loza  
John Lozano  
Stanley Mays  
Daniel "Corky" Sherman  
Tom Wood

Staff Present:

Yasmin Tolliver, Redistricting Manager  
Barbara McAninch, Asst. City Attorney  
Lindsay Kramer, Demographer  
Peter Bratt, Redistricting Coordinator  
Daisy Torres, Redistricting Coordinator  
Arlicia Herron, Office Assistant

Commission Members Absent:

None

Members of the Public Present: 25

Media Present: 3

**6:00 P.M.** Meeting called to order by Chair, Dr. Ruth Morgan. A quorum was present.

1. Opening Remarks
  - None
  
2. Approval of August 2, 2011 Minutes
  - Motion: Commissioner Wood moved to approve the August 2, 2011 Minutes. Seconded by Commissioner Loza
    - o Ayes: 13
    - o Nays: 0
  - The motion passed unanimously (Commissioner Jones and Commissioner Lozano were not present at the vote).
  
3. Staff Updates
  - Commission Meeting Schedule and Work Timeline
    - a) Project Manager Yasmin Tolliver reviewed the Commission meeting schedule and work timeline. The Public Forum will be Saturday, August 20 at 2:00 pm. A request for the City Council Chambers has

2011 AUG 10 AM 9:18  
CITY SECRETARIAT  
DALLAS, TEXAS  
RECEIVED

been made and the Conference Room at the Central Library is a back-up location.

- b) The Project Manager informed the Commission that Staff had received over 300 emails from Lake Highlands area residents since July 30, 2011 in opposition to the drawing of District 10 to separate the neighborhood in proposed plan cPlan16.

4. Commissioner Plan or Partial Plan Submission Presentation

- Chair Morgan informed the Commission that Commissioner Jones would be late to the meeting, requiring the delay of her presentation to a later portion of the meeting. Without objection from the Commission, Chair Morgan moved to item e on the agenda.

e) cPlan04 Submission Summary

- Demographer Lindsay Kramer provided a summary of cPlan04. The plan has a total population deviation of 9.28%. District 2 has the highest population deviation of 4.34%, and District 4 has the lowest population deviation of -4.94%. cPlan04 has 7 minority districts and 2 minority coalition districts. Districts 1 and 2 are less compact than their existing incarnations, while Districts 4, 5, and 6 all improved on their existing compactness scores, while the rest remained close to the existing scores.

f) cPlan04 Submission Presentation

- Commissioner Billy Ratcliff presented cPlan04. He stated that his objective was to follow the Redistricting Guidelines and create a city wide map that adhered to the 2010 census data. His approach was to listen to the people who spoke at the public hearings. Based on their opinions, he created a Hispanic district in Pleasant Grove, kept Buckner Terrace intact, and kept communities of interest together. He also created a minimum of 7 minority districts. As requested by testimony, he kept Kleberg-Riley in District 8. As a result, there is a 64.5% Hispanic voting age population in the new Pleasant Grove seat (District 5). For District 7, he combined the two parts of Buckner Terrace, and maintained Fair Park and South Dallas. As a result, there were four majority Hispanic districts, three majority African American districts, five majority white districts and two majority minority coalition districts in this plan. Mr. Ratcliff did not try to create new districts in the north part of Dallas, but took the information based on plans presented by others and voting age population data.

g) cPlan04 Questions

- A question and answer session on cPlan04 among the Commissioners followed.

h) cPlan04 Public Comment

- There was no public comment on cPlan04.
- i) cPlan16 Submission Summary
- Demographer Lindsay Kramer provided a summary of cPlan16. The plan has a total population deviation of 7.90 %. District 9 has the largest population with a deviation of 3.83%, while District 2 had the lowest population with a deviation of -4.07%. cPlan16 has 7 minority districts and 2 minority coalition districts. Districts 1, 5, and 6 all have a total Hispanic population exceeding 75%, but the voting age population of Hispanics in each district is below 70%. Districts 10 and 12 are less compact than under the current plan, while Districts 4 and 5 increased in their compactness scores.
- j) cPlan16 Submission Presentation
- Commissioners Garcia, Ratcliff, and Love presented cPlan16. Commissioner Garcia stated this plan tried to accommodate the testimony heard at the public hearings as much as possible. This plan had input from City Council members Sandy Greyson, Dwaine Caraway, Carolyn Davis, Tennell Atkins, Scott Griggs, Delia Jasso and Pauline Medrano. This map also looked at the demographic changes throughout the city of Dallas. This plan creates five Hispanic districts, three African American districts, and two minority coalition districts.

Commissioner Garcia then provided analysis on the districts in cPlan16. District 1 has the most densely Latino neighborhood in the city, and they had to unpack District 1 to reduce the total Latino population from 84% to 74%. The Lake Cliff neighborhood is missing from District 1 due to a technical error, but the presenters plan on making a motion to put the Lake Cliff neighborhood back into District 1. On the whole, District 1 includes historic neighborhoods such as Davis, Jefferson and Illinois. District 2 is a majority Latino and African American district that now includes Love Field and maintains similar boundaries to its current form. Likewise, District 3 is similar to its current makeup. It is a minority opportunity district, with 59% of the total population Latino, 24% African American and 14% Anglo, and has many of the historic districts in North Oak Cliff such as Kessler Park, Stevens Park and Winnetka Heights. cPlan16 puts Arcadia Park and Red Bird airport back into District 3. District 4 demographics are 59% African American, 35% Latino and 4% White. It places Oak Cliff east of I-35 into one district. District 4 includes the areas of Veca, and it is adjacent to Joppa. It also includes Roosevelt High School and Town View High School and some other communities of interest such as Cedar Crest. District 5 is a new Pleasant Grove based district which has a Latino population of 71%, 20 % African American, and 8% Anglo. District 5 also includes the

neighborhood areas of Parkdale, Urbandale and Scyene-Piedmont. District 6 is 72% Latino, 32% African American and 10 % Anglo, and includes all of West Dallas. District 7 is a completely different district than the current district. cPlan16 makes it more compact, and it contains the heart of traditional South Dallas. 46% of District 7's voting age population is African American, and 40% is Latino. It removes areas on the west side of the Trinity River. District 7 unifies Buckner Terrace and the Bonton neighborhoods which are communities of interest. District 8 is a majority African American district that also includes the Kleberg Riley area. District 9 loses the Vickery Meadow neighborhood, which is unified and moved into District 13. District 9 also unites White Rock Lake and the Lake Highlands neighborhood which have similar economic backgrounds. District 10 will be a new majority minority district that is focused on Hamilton Park (a historic black neighborhood). Hamilton Park was built as a result of racism in the 1950's and 1960's, and was created as a middle class African American neighborhood that got isolated in the northern part of Dallas. This part of Dallas has had its demographics change, and now allow for a majority minority district.

k) cPlan16 Questions

- A question and answer session among the Commissioners followed.

l) cPlan16 Public Comment

- Asst. City Attorney Barbara McAninch read the rules for public speaking.
- Scott Wynne resides at 9529 Fieldcrest Dr. in District 10. Mr. Wynne is President of Lake Highland Area Improvement Association, and this is the umbrella organization that represents over 34 homeowner associations, crime watch groups, and neighborhood association groups throughout Lake Highlands. The Association represents the vast majority homeowners in Lake Highlands. Mr. Wynne is not here to speak for or against a plan, but strongly advocates keeping Lake Highlands together. He has lived in a number of places but has never seen or felt the sense of community like he does in Lake Highlands. Lake Highlands has a welcoming, small town feel. The Lake Highlands High School is fantastic, and they are all very proud of it, as well as the rest of the schools at every level. District 10 has strong community wide organizations such as Lake Highlands Exchange Club and Lake Highlands Junior Women's League that work hand in hand with the City. Lake Highlands has plenty of diversity and is already considered a minority opportunity district. Mr. Wynne pointed out that in the words of the Redistricting Commission, communities of interest shall be maintained in a single district. That is the idea that has been applied when drawing the lines around Lake Highland for the

past decades. It is the reason why they have managed to keep the community intact in terms of City Council representation. If Lake Highlands is not a community of interest, then he is not sure what is. If the Commission's own words are meaningful, then Lake Highlands should be at or near the top of the Commission's list. He noted that the emails displayed at the beginning of the meeting were a 4 or 5 inch stack. As the Manager had noted, all but 5 were from members of District 10. He thinks the commission would be wise to listen to that. A great city starts with great neighborhoods, and he urges the commission to keep Lake Highlands a strong vital part of the City of Dallas by keeping their representation on the City Council intact.

- Luke Davis resides at 9039 Maguire's Bridge in District 10, and has lived there for 28 years. He is a member of the Skillman TIF, and since May 2000 has been on the Richardson ISD Board of Trustees. He asked that Lake Highlands not be divided. A division would be detrimental to the people of Lake Highlands, the City of Dallas, and RISD. cPlan16 shows District 10 to be significantly less compact than the current District 10. There is no community of interest more distinct to RISD than the Lake Highlands community. The plans that divide Lake Highlands will also divide schools.
- Randal Bryant resides at 1211 Willow Glen in District 5 and spoke in support of cPlan16. He is a soon to be graduate of Northlake College and Director of Operations for Canton and Associates. He stated that contrary to dogmatic, bias, falsifying, and slanderous statements made by one who has never worked with him, for the record he is not nor has he ever been a political consultant. He stated that his capacity was being a supervisor on phone banks and GOTV programs, and was not sure who would hire a 24 year old to be a political consultant. cPlan16 is one of only two completely submitted maps that created a reasonable opportunity for African American to retain four seats. Given Dallas' current demographics of 42% Hispanic, 29% Anglo and 25% Black, he doesn't see why the commission should consider anything less than 4 African American seats. He stated that the combination of West Dallas and Kessler Park are not communities of interest. There are charities in Kessler Park that do work in West Dallas but they are not in any way communities of interest. He stated that all complete maps submitted have recreated the southern portion of Dallas. Some neighborhoods will be unified, while other neighborhoods may stay intact although combined with new neighborhoods. A personal example is that Mr. Bryant lives in the Twin Oaks neighborhood. It is across from the Glen Oaks neighborhood. The neighborhood is currently in two districts, while cPlan16 unifies them. He hopes that race, gender, or sexual orientation will never keep a community group or charitable

organization from starting or continuing the good works that they do, nor should the district lines serve as an imaginary line. Mr. Bryant thanked Commissioners Garcia, Love, and Ratcliff for listening to public comments and the efforts it took to create this map.

- Marvin Crenshaw resides at 5134 Malcolm X Blvd. in District 7. He asked “If your house is flooded and you needed a plumber, you would go find one right?” Just like in Lake Highlands with all this multiculturalism and people who can serve that are African American, you have to go find one. You have to make an effort to find an African American representative for the Lake Highlands area. He supports cPlan16 if the corrections are made to increase District 7 to 50% African American so there are 3 majority African American districts and if Ms. Hasan’s questions are addressed. Because of the fact no one wants South Dallas, we are stuck where we are at this present time. Mr. Crenshaw also supports the map because during the lawsuit filed by Mr. Lipscomb, Mr. Lipscomb would also say always respect Poncho Medrano because he stayed with us all the way, as with Mr. Henry Martinez from the Ledbetter Neighborhood Association.
- Beverly Mondoza resides at 520 E Fifth St. in District 1, and has lived there for 16 years. Ms. Mondoza wanted to speak on both cPlan16 and cPlan04. She stated that both maps break up the North Oak Cliff Gateway. Traffic and planning patterns in the North Oak Cliff Gateway show their common interests. They have Rosemont Early Childhood PTA which is currently active and is made up of 350 families. She stated that both of the maps look like they are trying to protect incumbents. The North Oak Cliff Gateway has more in common with the Central Business District than to the neighborhoods south of them. She urged the Commission to take a look at the map Commissioner Sherman held up of the historic Oak Cliff area, because this map represents boundaries she likes.
- Council member Dwaine Caraway from District 4 spoke on cPlan16. He thanked all of the commissioners who submitted maps. He noted that the city is going through a process where things are going to be changed. When we get to the City Council level we will be doing this very same process again, and thus the council members are depending on the commission to do things right. Mr. Caraway said that he is going to give up Buckner Terrace to another district, but he is going to fight to make sure that the new map is an improvement over the districts that were gerrymandered the last time. He also noted that South Dallas is South Dallas, and Oak Cliff does not want to join and go across the river anymore to South Dallas.

a) cPlan13 Submission Summary

- Demographer Lindsay Kramer provided a summary of cPlan13. The total population deviation is 2.97%. The highest population was in District 13 with a deviation of 2.88%, and the smallest population is in District 10 with a deviation of -0.09%. District 10 is a minority coalition district based on voting age population. The compactness scores did increase for all districts, except for District 12.

b) cPlan13 Submission Presentation (Testimony)

- Commissioner Elizabeth Jones presented cPlan13. cPlan13 was completed in collaboration with the commissioners from Districts 10, 11, and 12. Also, over the course of creating this map she consulted with Districts 6 and 14. The point of this partial map is to show how you can solve the problem with the population growth in District 12. This population growth creates a waterfall effect, as the excess population of District 12 needs to be balanced out between the surrounding districts. Districts 10, 11, 12, and 13 are already compact, well represented and most importantly, diverse. District 12 has an excess population of 9,000 that has to go to District 11, and Commissioner Wood has already made the amendment to that change. As a result, one only has to make two changes to District 11 to balance everything. A huge area east of North Central Expressway and Interstate 635 that is in District 11 was removed and placed in District 10 to balance the populations of each district. District 13 has to pick up almost 5,000 in its current state. Adding the remainder of Vickery Meadow from District 9 and some broken neighborhoods on the far west and south edges of District 13 helps the district meet its population requirements. Also, Midway Hollow is placed in District 6.

c) cPlan13 Questions

- A question and answer session on cPlan13 among the Commissioners followed.

d) cPlan13 Public Comment

- None

5. Commission Discussion and Consideration

- a) cPlan04 postponed until the August 9, 2011 meeting when all plans in inventory will be considered.
- b) cPlan16 postponed until the August 9, 2011 meeting when all plans in inventory will be considered.

6. Commission Discussion and Vote on Previous Commission Directed Modified Plans

None

7. Commission Review and Discussion of All Plans Remaining In Inventory

- a) wPlan01 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- b) wPlan03 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- c) wPlan04 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- d) wPlan12 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- e) wPlan16 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- f) wPlan22 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- g) wPlan24a postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- h) wPlan24b postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- i) wPlan45 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- j) wPlan55a postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- k) pPlan05 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- l) pPlan14 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- m) cPlan04 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- n) cPlan05 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
- o) cPlan16 postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.

8. Commission Consideration to Move Plans Forward
  - Postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
  
9. Commission Discussion and Consideration on Give Directions to Staff on Modifying Plans Moved Forward
  - Postponed until August 9, 2011 meeting.
  
10. Public Speakers
  - Shirley Stark resides at 2612 Max Gold Blatt in District 4 and commented on cPlan16. She noted that unlike the cPlan16 map, Pleasant Grove begins at Bruton Road and goes south. She does not believe the plans presented tonight represent that. Anything south of Bruton Road is in Pleasant Grove. She applauded Councilman Caraway because we need to be willing as people to give and take. Hopefully we can be a little more cohesive and a better map may result.
  - Sandra Crenshaw resides at 1431 Quartet in District 8. She will email her amended map to the commissioners. The area that represents District 5 is very important to the City of Dallas. District 5 has lost population and most of that population loss has been from the educated African Americans who have moved to the southern suburbs. Ms. Crenshaw's map calls for 5 districts in Oak Cliff. Ms. Crenshaw is deeply concerned with the hysteria that is created by the misguided assertions that any political jurisdiction must apportion its districts according to its racial ethnic population. Just because the City of Dallas is 45% Hispanic, the city is not obligated by law to draw 5 Hispanic districts. In the federal register dated February 9, 2001 the Attorney General from the Justice Department does not rely on any predetermined or fixed demographic percentages at any point in their assessments. The name of this game is to review the minority or disadvantage population and determine if they have the opportunity to elect the person of their choice. As a result the city is not supposed to have




Hispanic districts and Black districts, but rather districts that are based on communities of interest. That means recreation center, libraries, airports our creeks and the Trinity River. Not our school districts. The burden to determine whether or not this commission is using the appropriate criteria to redistrict will be on the city.

11. Additional Questions/Final Remarks

- None

12. Adjournment

- At 9:47 pm the meeting was adjourned.



CHAIR

  
COMMISSION ADMINISTRATOR

\*\*\*\*\*

**Note:** For detailed information on meeting refer to the video tape of the meeting posted on the Redistricting website.