

DATE April 21, 2022

CITY OF DALLAS

^{TO} Mark S. Swann, City Auditor

SUBJECT Revised Response to Audit of the Boards and Commissions (Revised Report Issued January 26, 2022)

On August 4, 2021, your office released an audit of the City's Boards and Commissions ("the audit"). Sixteen City departments and offices are responsible for coordinating more than 50 Boards and Commissions, including costs related to staff time and materials to prepare for and facilitate meetings. The City Auditor findings included:

- Responsibility for ensuring compliance with City requirements is fragmented and shared among multiple offices, departments, and positions.
- Processes could be improved to ensure compliance with City requirements; transparent documentation and communication of board and commission operations; and monitoring of the costs to operate boards and commissions.

On Monday, September 27, 2021, the Government Performance and Financial Management Committee ("the Committee") was briefed on the audit. The City Manager provided the attached response, dated October 22, 2021. The item remained on the Committee's agenda each month through March 2022, pending additional discussion among the City Manager, the City Secretary, and the City Attorney.

Following those discussions, the City Manager provides the below amendments to his initial response:

A.1. The City Manager agreed then and now with the City Auditor's report that there were opportunities to reduce the splintering of roles so that members of Boards and Commissions receive the support and clarity they need to be successful. The September 27, 2021 GPFM Committee discussion underscored what the City Auditor referred to as "fragmentation of roles and responsibilities." At the time, the City Manager's Office responded that the oversight and management of Boards and Commissions should be housed within one department, with appropriate staff to ensure efficiency and compliance.

To centralize these fragmented responsibilities; ensure robust support for Boards and Commissions and the department coordinators; and provide active engagement of the appointed members, the City Manager has allocated a dedicated staff position in the Mayor and City Council Office – the Boards and Commissions Senior Coordinator (Senior Coordinator).

DATE April 22, 2022

SUBJECT Revised Response to Audit of the Boards and Commissions (Revised Report Issued January 26, 2022)

The Senior Coordinator position will be housed in the Mayor and City Council Office, serving as a liaison and providing operational support to the many roles which support the members of Boards and Commissions, including but not limited to the City Manager's Office, the City Secretary's Office, the City Attorney's Office and the Boards and Commissions coordinators within respective departments. The Senior Coordinator will oversee all Boards and Commissions department coordinators with the goal of streamlining processes and collaborating with City staff. The Senior Coordinator position has been filled and the candidate will begin Monday, May 2, 2022.

The City Secretary's Office and the City Attorney's Office will continue their current compliance support for candidates nominated and considered for appointment.

B.1., C.1., E.2., and F1. A draft work plan was prepared by the City Manager in coordination with the City Secretary's Office and City Attorney's Office, to address the findings of the City Auditor. The work plan is a living document and will define operational deliverables and a path forward, including but not limited to, (E.1) establishing procedures to account for all costs to operate each board and commission and report the total cost by Board and Commission to the City Council on an annual basis; (C.1) working with the City Attorney's Office and the City Secretary's Office to ensure all Boards and Commissions are educated about members' defined roles and responsibilities either in their bylaws (Dallas City Code Chapters 2 and 8) or other authoritative document; (E.2) develop procedures to ensure all Board and Commission annual reports are posted to the City's website; and (F1) develop procedures to ensure compliance with requirements of City Code, Chapter 8, "Boards and Commissions": Sec. 8.4(a); Sec. 8-6(a),(b),(c),(d); Sec. 8-8(a), (b); and Sec. 8-20(a),(b),(c).

D1. The City Manager's Office maintains its position that it does not have a statutory role to ensure the racial and ethnic membership of Boards and Commissions reflect the racial and ethnic make-up of the city's population. The Senior Coordinator within the Mayor and City Council Office will make practicable efforts to work with members of the City Council to identify opportunities to consider appointees who reflect the racial and ethnic make-up of the city's population.

We appreciate the work of the City Auditor and are grateful for this opportunity to provide additional responses to the initial audit. Should you have any questions, please contact Carrie Rogers, Director of the Mayor and City Council Office, at 214.670.5682 or <u>carrie.rogers@dallascityhall.com</u>.

Putting service first,

Kimberly Bizor Tolbert Chief of Staff to the Manager

"Our Product is Service" Empathy | Ethics | Excellence | Equity

DATE April 22, 2022

SUBJECT Revised Response to Audit of the Boards and Commissions (Revised Report Issued January 26, 2022)

Encl: Boards and Commissions Draft Work Plan October 22, 2021 City Manager's Response to Audit of Boards and Commissions

c: T.C. Broadnax, City Manager Chris Caso, City Attorney Bilierae Johnson, City Secretary Directors and Assistant Directors Shanee Weston, Senior Coordinator, Boards and Commissions Department Coordinators, Boards and Commissions

Objective	Responsible Person	City Auditor Finding/ Recommendation	Observation	Rationale	Action Steps	2022 Deliverables
Create one focal point to serve as single resource and operational support for Boards and Commissions with Department Coordinators, and who will collaborate with the City Secretary's Office, who is responsible for compliance with ethics and code requirements; also collaborate with City Attorney's Office and City Manager's Office		X	Observation A: Responsibility for Compliance	The City Secretary, City Manager, City Council, department directors and Boards and Commissions coordinators all have responsibilities ensuring that Boards and Commissions comply with the City's Charter and Code requirements. The lack of one focal point for Boards and Commissions oversight, with the responsibility for ensuring compliance with the City's Charter and Code, is a contributing factor for many of the observations identified in this audit report, including: racial and ethnic diversity, annual reports, member qualification reviews, and on-time reporting of meeting documentation.	Post and hire Senior Board Coordinator with existing funds	New hire in place by 5/1
collaboration with the City Secretary's Office	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator and Department Board/Commission Coordinator working in collaboration with the City Secretary's Office and City Attorney's Office	X	Observation A: Responsibility for Compliance	training for Boards and Commissions members and coordinators	Work with City Secretary's Office to continue department-specific training schedule, procedures and affidavit to ensure compliance with mandatory training of Boards and Commissions members Create template reminder email for Department Coordinators to Boards and Commissions members re: gift and financial disclosure requirements	Training schedule, procedures and affidavit to ensure compliance with mandatory training of Boards and Commissions members
Receives requests from City Secretary and submits requests for indebtedness to the City (past due water accounts, outstanding library fines, parking citation, etc.	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator (Request to CFO)	N/A	N/A		Ensure communication is consistent with City Secretary's Office requests	Ensure communication is consistent with City Secretary's Office requests
Monitors costs to operate Boards and Commissions	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator	Х	Audit of City Boards and Commissions Observation B: Monitoring Operating Costs	Commissions and establishing new Boards and Commissions.	Request Board/Commission Pay Code in Workday; Establish procedures to account for all costs to operate each Boards and Commissions and report the total cost by Boards and Commissions to the City Council on an annual basis.	Report on Dept. staff time costs to support B&Cs
Ensures Boards and Commissions have members' roles and responsibilities defined in bylaws or another authoritative document	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator	Х	Observation C: Defining Members' Roles and Responsibilities	considered when assessing the performance of each Boards and Commissions and establishing new Boards and Commissions.	Educate all Boards and Commissions about the defined roles and responsibilities of members either in their bylaws (city codes) or another authoritative document. Forty- two out of 52 have member roles and responsibilities defined. Review the 10 not in comliance and revise. Create Roles and Responsibilities outline to define boards and commissions and authorized actions; work with City Attorney	Develop bylaws or authoritative document with defined roles and responsibilities of members

Distributes Boards and Commissions annual reports to Mayor and City Council and City Secretary; post annual reports, bylaws online in coordination with Department Board/Commission Coordinator and City Secretary's Office	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator	Х	Observation A: Responsibility for Compliance Observation E: Annual Reports	The lack of one focal point for Boards and Commissions oversight, with the responsibility for ensuring compliance with the City's Charter and Code, is a contributing factor for many of the observations identified in this audit report, including: racial and ethnic diversity, annual reports, member qualification reviews, and on-time reporting of meeting documentation	Develop template email and schedule to distribute annual reports and post online	Template email and schedule to distribute annual reports and post online
Develop Comprehensive Communications Plan	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator	N/A	N/A	To promote communication and engagement across all Boards and Commissions and in collaboration with the City Secreatry's Office and City Manager's Office, working with Department Coordinators		Communications and Outreach Plan for and to members of Boards and Commissions
Prepares documentation of and communication re: Boards and Commissions operations (e.g. events, meetings) in collaboration with Department Coordinators	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator	Х	Observation A: Responsibility for Compliance	There is not one focal point with responsibility to ensure Boards and Commissions comply the City's Charter and Code. The City Secretary, City Manager, City Council, department directors and Boards and Commissions coordinators all have responsibilities ensuring that Boards and Commissions comply with the City's Charter and Code requirements.	routine updates to Boards and Commissions Department Coordinators	2022-2023 Work Plan; develop template communication to new Boards and Commissions members from Department Board/Commission Coordinator
Maintains Boards and Commissions coordinator list and notifies City Secretary of coordinator changes	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator	N/A	N/A	To ensure effective communication		Current boards and commissions coordinator list
Maintain records, in collaboration with the Department Board/Commission Coordinators, City Secretary's Office and City Attorney's Office, to aid in response to future audits	MCC Senior Board/Commission Coordinator AND Department Board/Commission Coordinator	N/A	N/A	To ensure transparency and thorough documentation	Establish procedures for recordkeeping working with Records Retention Coordinator	Procedures for recordkeeping

Receives and processes applications for				The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
completeness				Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating		
	City Secretary	N/A	N/A	with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
				documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
Verifies a nominee has no pending ethics				disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website) The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
complaint, is a registered voter, is not a treasurer				Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
for any candidate, officeholder, Special Purpose				with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
Action Committee, or General Purpose				documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
Committee and has a credible record of				disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website)		
attendance in prior board service						
	City Secretary	N/A	N/A			
Ensures appointees meet qualification						
requirements (formerly responsibility of CMO,						
includes checking for indebtedness to the city)						
History - Conducts the criminal history check						
Places appointment/nomination items on Council				The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
Agenda for action				Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating		
5	City Secretary	N/A	N/A	with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
				documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
				disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website)		
Notifies appointee of appointment				The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
			Observation G:	Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating		
	City Secretary	Х	Acceptance of	with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
			Appointment	documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
Ensures compliance with City requirements			Observations A.	disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website) The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
. , , .			Observation A:	Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating		
	City Secretary	х	Responsibility for Compliance	with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
	City Secretary	~	Observation D: Racial	documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
			and Ethnic Diversity	disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website)		
Ensure appointees receive requisite compliance				The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
training (TOMA, ORRs, Ethics) working with			Observation A:	Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating		
Senior Coordinator for Boards and Commissions	City Secretary	Х	Responsibility for	with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
and Department Coordinators			Compliance	documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
Posts Boards and Commissions meeting agendas				disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website) The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
and minutes online			Observation I:	Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating		i of eity secretary response
	City Secretary	Х	Compliance	with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
			Requirements	documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
				disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website)		
Provides reports to Mayor and City Council				The City Secretary oversees the process of receiving nominations for all	For City Secretary response	For City Secretary response
Office for new, expiring and vacant appointments			Observation H:	Boards and Commissions, conducting background checks, coordinating		
	City Secretary	Х	Vacancies	with other departments which work directly with each board, and		
			vacancies	documenting compliance with state law and City Code, such as financial		
				disclosure and ethics rules. (CSO website)		

Ensure appointees receive requisite training			Observation A:	Improve and expand department-specific compliance and operational	Create onboarding checklist for training	Onboarding/offboarding checklist
throughout term (Board/Commission-specific	Department Board/Commission	Х	Responsibility for		•	and training schedule
	Coordinator	~		0		and training schedule
training, ongoing mandatory training) Completes and submits detailed meeting minutes			Compliance Observation F:	Ensure Boards and Commissions material is assessable and correct	training objectives. Develop template for minutes by all Boards	Finaliza minutos and distributa to
	Department Board/Commission	Х	Meeting			
to City Secretary	Coordinator	Λ	Documentation			City Secretary's Office
Tracks Boards and Commissions members				Responsibility for ensuring Boards and Commissions are in compliance	Develop template for attendance	Finalize attendance and distribute
	Department Board/Commission		Observation F:	with the City's Charter and Code has been decentralized. Centralizing this		to City Secretary's Office
MCC Board/Commission Senior Coordinator	Coordinator	Х	Meeting	function and developing a standard procedure for appointee	management	to eity secretary's office
Nee Board, commission senior coordinator			Documentation	qualifications will ensure more effective application of the charter.		
Prepares and monitors Boards and Commissions					Establish procedures to account for all costs	Finalize budget and expenses each
budget(s) submits to MCC Board/Commission			Observation B:		to operate each Boards and Commissions	month; review by MCC Budget
Senior Coordinator	Department Board/Commission	х				Manager
	Coordinator		Costs		Commissions to the City Council on an	
					annual basis.	
Schedules boards and commission meetings,				To ensure public access and transparency		Develop schedule for all Boards
creates calendar event in Boards and	Department Board/Commission	N1/A			Commission materials, ensure coordinators	and Commissions
Commissions Calendar and City Calendar, related	Coordinator	N/A	N/A		are trained and aware of TOMA	
operations to support meetings					requirements	
				Approximately 500 people serve on 52 Boards and Commissions	Mayor and City Council staff prepare and	Nomination materials prepared by
				established by City Council, providing direction and recommendations for	submit nominations materials, work with	MCC staff
			N/A	City operations, such as economic development, parks, libraries, arts,	City Secretary's Boards and Commissions	
Appoints Boards and Commissions members	Mayor and City Council	N/A		police oversight, and planning. The operating requirements for Boards	Coordinator to address any items requiring	
				and Commissions membership, activities, and operations are primarily	clarity	
				established by the City's Charter and Code but may also be established		
				by State laws.		
					Develop procedures to ensure the racial	Procedures to ensure the racial
Works with City Attorney and City Secretary to				compliance with the City's Charter and Code and achieving the objectives		and ethnic membership of Boards
					Commissions reflect the racial and ethnic	and Commissions reflect the racial
ensure Boards and Commissions are in compliance with the City's Charter and Code	Mayor and City Council	Х				and ethnic make-up of the City's
			and Ethnic Diversity			population, as nearly as may be
covering racial and ethnic diversity						
						practicable.

Oversight of Boards and Commissions member activity/decorum	Chair - Board/Commission	N/A	N/A	Ensures compliance with City's Ethics Code and Core Values	Provide training for presiding officers regarding Code of Ethics and role to ensure member conduct and decorum	Training schedule, procedures and affidavit to ensure compliance with mandatory training of Boards
Adoption of and accordance to bylaws	Board/Commission	N/A	N/A	Ensures compliance with City's Ethics Code and Core Values	Working with City Attorney's Office to develop bylaws for consideration by Boards and Commissions	Develop bylaws template
Reviews conflicts of interest	City Attorney	N/A	N/A	Protects the City from malicious behaviors, decisions, and relationships	Provide training for Boards and Commissions regarding City's Code of Ethics	Training schedule, procedures and affidavit to ensure compliance with mandatory training of Boards and Commissions members
Prepares bylaws	City Attorney	N/A	N/A	Promotes consistency between Boards and Commissions	Work with other boards and commissions to educate them about existing bylaws (generally Dallas City Code Chapters 2 and 8). Work with instrumentalities that may require bylaws.	board and commission members

Coordinator Name	Board Type	Board & Commission	Phone
Jillian Appelbaum	Advisory	Animal Advisory Commission (ASC)	214-670-8898
Brittany Donehoo	Quasi-Judicial	Building Inspection Advisory, Examining & Appeals Boards (BIA)	214-948-4347
Latonia Jackson	Quasi-Judicial	Board of Adjustment (BOA)	214-670-4545
Anne Marie Gan	Advisory	Arts and Culture Advisory Commission (CAC)	214-671-7023
Anne Marie Gan	Advisory	Arts and Culture Advisory Commission (Adjunct Members)	214-671-7023
Shanee Weston	Advisory	Community Development Commission (CDC)	214-670-4600
Renita Griggs	Advisory	Citizen Homeless Commission (CHC)	214-671-2824
Yolanda Pesina	Quasi-Judicial	City Plan and Zoning Commission (CPC)	214-670-3086
Taylor Woods	Advisory	Community Police Oversight Board (CPO)	214-670-3882
Ana Monzon	Quasi-Judicial	Civil Service Board (CSB)	214-670-3748
Ana Monzon	Quasi-Judicial	Civil Service Board Adjunct Members (CSX)	214-670-3748
Robin Bentley	*Other	Cypress Waters Municipal Management District	214-671-9942
Renita Griggs	*Instrumentality	Dallas Area Partnership to End and Prevent Homelessness Local Government Corporation (DAP)	214-671-2824
Nancy Johnson	*Quasi-Judicial	Dallas Area Rapid Transit Board	214-749-3347
Kenneth Nolan	*Quasi-Judicial	Dallas Central Appraisal District (DCA)	214-631-0910
Donna Schnell	*Quasi-Judicial	Dallas Fort Worth International Airport Board	972-973-5752
Delbra Henderson	*Instrumentality	DHA – Dallas Housing Authority Board – Housing Solutions for North Texas	214-951-8301
Kyle Hines	Instrumentality	Dallas Public Facility Corporation	214-670-4942
Melissa Romero	Instrumentality	Dallas Police and Fire Pension System Board of Trustees	214-382-4419
Dawna Brown	Quasi-Judicial	Ethics Advisory Commission (EAC)	214-670-3741
Kay Watson	Quasi-Judicial	Employees' Retirement Fund Board of Trustees	214-580-7712
Erin Diehl	Advisory	Environmental Commission	214-671-8522

Christopher Martinez	Quasi-Judicial	Fire Code Advisory and Appeals Board (FCB)	214-670-4629
Kyle Hines	*Instrumentality	Housing Finance Corporation Board (HFC)	214-670-5110
Taylor Moody	Advisory	Judicial Nominating Commission (JNC)	214-670-5735
Elaine Hill	Quasi-Judicial	Landmark Commission (LNC)	214-670-4206
Elaine Hill	Quasi-Judicial	Landmark Commission Alternate Members (LNX)	214-670-4206
Felicia Edwards	Advisory	Municipal Library Board (MLB)	214-671-9231
Jamal Slaughter	Advisory	Martin Luther King Jr Community Center Board	214-671-5117
Anne Lockyer	*Instrumentality	North Texas Education Finance Corporation (NFC)	214-671-9070
Robin Bentley *update title change – director	*Other	North Oak Cliff Municipal Management District (NOC)	214-670-1691
Anthony 'Tony' Becker	Quasi-Judicial	Park and Recreation Board	214-670-4078
Dawna Brown	Quasi-Judicial	Permit and License Appeal Board (PLA)	214-670-3741
C.C. Gonzalez-Kurz	Other	Redistricting Commission (RDC)	214-422-2547
Sue Hounsel	Advisory	(RZ03) Reinvestment Zone Three Board (Oak Cliff Gateway)	214-939-2848
Tamara Leak	Advisory	(RZ04) Reinvestment Zone Four Board (Cedars Area)	214-671-8043
Dorcy Clark	Advisory	(RZ05) Reinvestment Zone Five Board (City Center)	214-670-1221
Dorcy Clark	Advisory	(RZ06) Reinvestment Zone Six Board (Farmers Market)	214-670-1221
Tamara Leak	Advisory	(RZ07) Reinvestment Zone Seven Board (Sports Arena)	214-671-8043
Sue Hounsel	Advisory	(RZ08) Reinvestment Zone Eight Board (Design District)	214-939-2848
Dorcy Clark	Advisory	(RZ09) Reinvestment Zone Nine Board (Vickery Meadow)	214-670-1221
Tamara Leak	Advisory	(RZ10) Reinvestment Zone Ten Board (Southwestern Medical)	214-670-8043
Maxime Faye	Advisory	(RZ11) Reinvestment Zone Eleven Board (Vickery Meadow)	214-671-1858
Dorcy Clark	Advisory	(RZ12) Reinvestment Zone Twelve Board (Deep Ellum)	214-670-1221
Sue Hounsel	Advisory	(RZ13) Reinvestment Zone Thirteen Board (Grand Park South)	214-939-2848
Dorcy Clark	Advisory	(RZ14) Reinvestment Zone Fourteen Board (Skillman Corridor)	214-670-1221

Dorcy Clark	Advisory	(RZ15) Reinvestment Zone Fifteen Board (Fort Worth Avenue)	214-670-1221
Wayne Emerson	Advisory	(RZ16) Reinvestment Zone Sixteen Board (Davis Garden)	214-671-8049
Sue Hounsel	Advisory	(RZ17) Reinvestment Zone Seventeen Board (TOD)	214-939-2848
Tamara Leak	Advisory	(RZ18) Reinvestment Zone Eighteen Board (Maple/Mockingbird)	214-670-8043
Tamara Leak	Advisory	(RZ19) Reinvestment Zone Nineteen Board (Cypress Waters)	214-670-8043
Kevin Spath	Advisory	(RZ20) Reinvestment Zone Twenty Board (Mall Area Redevelopment)	214-670-1691
Sue Hounsel	Advisory	(RZ21) Reinvestment Zone Twenty-one Board (University)	214-939-2848
Ana Camacho	Advisory	Senior Affairs Commission	214-670-4218
Heather Lepeska	Advisory	South Dallas/Fair Park Opportunity Fund Board (SDF)	214-670-1222
Estela Ornelas	*Instrumentality	Trinity River Corridor Local Government Corporation (TRL)	214-671-9554
Robin Bentley	*Other	Trinity River West Municipal Management District (TRW)	214-671-9942
Hiwote Tadesse	Advisory	Veteran Affairs Commission (VAC)	214-670-7311
Taylor Moody	Advisory	Youth Commission (YOC)	214-670-5735
Arturo Del Castillo	Advisory	ZOAC & Urban Design	214-670-3718
Brian Price	Advisory	City Plan Commission Comprehensive Land Use Committee	(214)-670-4529
Tristan Hallman	Advisory	Mayor's Task Force on Safe Communities	
Tristan Hallman	Advisory	Mayor's Task Force on Innovation and Entrepreneurship	
Tristan Hallman	Advisory	Mayor's Domestic Violence and Human Trafficking Advisory Council	
Tristan Hallman	Advisory	Mayor's International Advisory Council	
Tristan Hallman	Advisory	Mayor's Study Group on Dallas Police and Fire Pension System	
Tristan Hallman	Advisory	Mayor's Task Force on Safe Communities	
Tristan Hallman	Advisory	Mayor's Ethics Reform Task Force	
	Advisory	Short-Term Rentals	
	Advisory	Sexually Oriented Businesses (SOBs)(DPD)	

Advisory	Housing Policy Task Force	
Advisory	Bike Task Force	

Memorandum



DATE October 22, 2021

CITY OF DALLAS

 Honorable Chair and Members of the Government Performance and Financial Management Committee

SUBJECT Responses to Questions- September 27, 2021 GPFM Council Committee Meeting

On Monday, September 27, the Government Performance and Financial Management (GPFM) Committee was briefed on the recent City Auditor's Boards and Commissions (B&C) Audit, dated August 4, 2021. This memorandum will respond to the various comments shared by the Committee during the briefing.

We agree with the City Auditor's findings that there are opportunities to reduce the splintering of roles so that members of the boards and commissions receive the support and clarity they need to be successful. The September 27, 2021, GPFM Committee discussion underscored what the City Auditor referred to as "fragmentation of roles and responsibilities."

- City Secretary Receives and processes applications for completeness, places items on Council Agenda for action, notifies appointee of appointment, emails a link to compliance training: Ethics and Open Meetings Act trainings
- City Manager Ensures appointees meet qualification requirements; receives annual reports and distributes to the Mayor and City Council Office
- City Attorney Reviews conflicts of interest, prepares bylaws
- Mayor and City Council Appoints boards and commissions members
- Boards and Commissions Approves mission, bylaws and annual reports
- Board Coordinators Within appropriate department, schedules meetings, manages budget, provides board/commission-specific additional orientation/training, may vary across boards and commissions, posts annual reports, bylaws and minutes

The oversight and management of boards and commissions should be housed within one of the following three departments: (1) City Manager's Office; (2) the City Secretary's Office or (3) the Mayor and City Council Office, with appropriate staff to ensure efficiency and compliance. The role of reviewing conflicts of interest and bylaws support would remain with the City Attorney. The single oversight department would oversee the following: application processing, qualifications compliance, budget management, board coordinators, annual report, mission, bylaws and minutes posting, and orientation/training oversight. Training should be robust, and members should be tested on their knowledge of the appropriate ethics codes and compliance. The new structure would look like this:

- Single Department (CMO, CSO or MCC)
 - Receives and processes applications for completeness, places items on Council Agenda for action, notifies appointee of appointment, emails a link

DATE

October 22, 2021 Responses to Questions– September 27, 2021 GPFM Council SUBJECT **Committee Meeting**

to compliance training: Ethics and Open Meetings Act trainings, ensures appointees meet qualification requirements; receives annual reports and distributes to Mayor and City Council Office

Board Coordinators - Within appropriate department and reporting to a single department, schedules meetings, budget management, provides board/commission-specific additional orientation/training, may vary across boards and commissions, posts annual reports, bylaws and minutes

- Boards and Commissions Approves mission, bylaws and annual reports 0
- City Attorney Reviews conflicts of interest, prepares bylaws
- Mayor and City Council Appoints boards and commissions members

The Mayor and City Council make appointments to the boards and commissions. The City Auditor recommended the Director of the Mayor and City Council Office develop procedures to ensure the racial and ethnic membership of boards and commissions reflect the racial and ethnic make-up of the City's population, as nearly as possible. The Mayor and City Council Office Director does not have a statutory role in the City Charter for Boards and Commissions, and further, 15A Reporting of Gifts and Donation compliance reporting. Staff will defer to the City Council regarding any revisions in the Charter as to how the reporting of gifts and donation process is handled. Please keep in mind that without this role, we are unclear how effective it would be for this role to develop such procedures given the nature of these appointments.

We appreciate the work of the City Auditor and again agree that there are numerous opportunities to reduce fragmentation of roles in order to limit confusion and provide greater support and clarity of roles to the members of the boards and commissions. Included with this memorandum is an appendix section that addresses the questions that were raised at the previous meeting. Staff looks forward to additional feedback during the GPFM Committee meeting on Monday, October 25

Should you have any questions or concerns, please contact me.

Putting Service First,

Kimberly Bizor Tolbert Chief of Staff to the Manager

T.C. Broadnax, City Manager Chris Caso, City Attorney Mark Swann, City Auditor Bilierae Johnson, City Secretary Preston Robinson, Administrative Judge Majed A. Al-Ghafry, Assistant City Manager

c:

Jon Fortune, Assistant City Manager Joey Zapata, Assistant City Manager Dr. Eric A. Johnson, Chief of Economic Development and Neighborhood Services M. Elizabeth Reich, Chief Financial Officer M. Elizabeth (Liz) Cedillo-Pereira, Chief of Equity and Inclusion **Directors and Assistant Directors**

"Our Product is Service" Empathy | Ethics | Excellence | Equity

DATE October 22, 2021 SUBJECT October 22, 2021 Responses to Questions– September 27, 2021 GPFM Council Committee Meeting

<u>Appendix</u>

1. What department monitors if boards and commissions are staying within their purview?

The Mayor and City Council make appointments to 52 boards and commissions that provide direction and recommendations for City operations. The chair of each board or commission should be preceding over all meetings and ensuring all members follow the <u>Dallas City Code Chapter 8</u>. In addition, attorneys are present in each meeting and ensure B&C are adhering to the posted agenda items. The City Manager's Office will work in coordination with the councilmember who appointed the chair to ensure compliance from members or address any member that is not following proper procedures that may result in forfeiture of position.

2. The audit specified the following boards and commissions as not having bylaws: Animal Advisory Commission, Citizen Homelessness Commission, Martin Luther King Jr. Community Center Board, South Dallas/Fair Park Opportunity Fund Board and Youth Commission. Since the meeting, here are our findings:

By-laws are not required per the charter and do not define the effectiveness of a B&C. As they offer an extra layer of accountability, each coordinator has responded that they will discuss with the chair of their assigned board or commission. Chapter 8 establishes a purpose approved by our policymaking body including duties and privileges of members, attendance, meeting times, quorum, etc.

- Animal Advisory Commission: Bylaws were adopted by the state on August 4, 2016. All animal commissions follow these, they are not separated by city. They also use Chapter 8 as guidance.
- Citizen Homelessness Commission: Chair King will work to develop by-laws with board.
- Martin Luther King Jr. Community Center Board
 - Currently, this board uses Chapter 8 as a guide to the functionality of the Advisory Board and to ensure they are adhering to protocols set forth in the City Charter. The Advisory Board has a mission. They will add a discussion and voting item to the October meeting agenda for the creation of the Vision and By-Laws.
- South Dallas/Fair Park Opportunity Fund Board
 - The SDFPOF was approved by ordinance, which describes board composition, and follows a program statement (approved by City Council) that defines what and where the board can fund projects and programs. (Link to program statement is here, which also has the ordinance reference

DATE October 22, 2021 Responses to Questions- S

SUBJECT

Responses to Questions– September 27, 2021 GPFM Council Committee Meeting

http://www.dallasecodev.org/DocumentCenter/View/2286/Southern-DallasFair-Park-Opportunity-Fund-Program-Statement-62718-PDF)

- Youth Commission
 - Mission is posted on the B&C website. In addition, events, updates, and past meeting materials of the commissioners are available through their citywide publication: <u>https://www.dallasyouthcommission.com/</u>.

3. The audit specified the following boards and commissions as not having completed a survey: Community Police Oversight Board, Dallas Central Appraisal District Board, Fire Code Advisory and Appeals Board, Housing Finance Corporation Board and Municipal Library Board. Here are the findings:

The auditor's office was using an August 28, 2020 City of Dallas Board and Commission Members Report to send emails to the responsible coordinators for each board or commission. Therefore, some current coordinators did not receive a request for the survey until our office inquired. That included: Municipal Library Board, and the Fire Code Advisory and Appeals Board was sent to an incorrect email.

The City Manager's Office updates the current coordinator list and provides to the City Secretary's Office, that list is posted <u>here</u>.

Housing Finance Corporation and the Community Police Oversight Board did not submit the original requests due to staff transition. Since the coordinators were contacted by my office, all surveys have since been submitted.

- Community Police Oversight Board: 10/8/2021
- Dallas Central Appraisal District Board:
 - The Dallas Central Appraisal District is not a board or commission of the City of Dallas. They are a political subdivision of the State of Texas created by the Texas Legislature in 1979. As such, they will not be completing a survey. The auditor's office received this response in September 2020.
- Fire Code Advisory and Appeals Board: submitted 10/7/2021
- Housing Finance Corporation Board: submitted 9/29/2021
- Municipal Library Board: 9/29/2021