# Memorandum



DATE April 19, 2019

TO Honorable Mayor and Council Members

## Fitch Ratings Affirmed 'AA' Rating and Stable Outlook for City of Dallas SUBJECT Outstanding General Obligation - INFORMATION

As previously communicated, I am pleased to report that on April 16, Fitch Ratings (Fitch) affirmed the City's 'AA' credit rating and stable outlook for General Obligation debt. Fitch states the affirmed rating and outlook for the General Obligation debt reflects the City's "strong revenue growth prospects, conservative budgeting practices, and solid reserve levels." Additionally, "reforms to both the city's civilian and public safety plans have had a positive effect on the city's long-term liability burden, and recent operating performance has been positive despite increased spending on both pensions and public safety salaries."

In the analysis, Fitch assigned 'aaa' grades to two Key Rating Drivers, Revenue Framework and Operating Performance, for "expectations for continued gains in taxable value and sales tax revenues due to ongoing economic expansion," and that the City's "gap-closing capabilities and healthy reserves position it to maintain financial resilience through a typical economic downturn." The report also highlights the City's history of positive budget management practices and pension reform.

With sustained growth in revenue and prudent management practices, the City of Dallas continues to be economically strong, fiscally stable, and a solid investment. As we continue to meet with rating agencies and prepare for upcoming bond issues, I look forward to sharing the successes the City has achieved.

Please let me know if you need additional information.

M. Elwabeth Reich M. Elizabeth Reich

Chief Financial Officer

Attachment

c: T.C. Broadnax, City Manager Chris Caso, City Attorney (Interim) Bilierae Johnson, City Secretary Preston Robinson, Administrative Judge Kimberly Bizor Tolbert, Chief of Staff to the City Manager Majed A. Al-Ghafry, Assistant City Manager Jon Fortune, Assistant City Manager Joey Zapata, Assistant City Manager Nadia Chandler Hardy, Assistant City Manager and Chief Resilience Officer Michael Mendoza, Chief of Economic Development and Neighborhood Services Laila Alequresh, Chief Innovation Officer Directors and Assistant Directors

# **Fitch**Ratings

# Fitch Rates Dallas, TX \$378MM GO Bonds 'AA'; Outlook Stable

Fitch Ratings-Austin-16 April 2019: Fitch Ratings has assigned an 'AA' rating to the following City of Dallas, TX obligations:

--\$228.6 million general obligation (GO) refunding and improvement bonds, series 2019A;

--\$149.3 million GO refunding bonds, series 2019B.

Both series of bonds are scheduled for a competitive sale on April 30. Series 2019A proceeds will finance infrastructure improvements and refund outstanding commercial paper; series 2019B proceeds will finance a legal settlement.

Fitch has also affirmed the following ratings:

--Issuer Default Rating (IDR) at 'AA'; --\$1.8 billion of outstanding limited tax debt at 'AA'.

The Rating Outlook is Stable.

SECURITY GO bonds are payable from the city's ad valorem tax levy, limited to \$2.50 per \$100 of taxable assessed valuation (TAV).

### ANALYTICAL CONCLUSION

The city's 'AA' IDR and limited tax bond rating reflect strong revenue growth prospects, conservative budgeting practices, and solid reserve levels. Reforms to both the city's civilian and public safety plans have had a positive effect on the city's long-term liability burden, and recent operating performance has been positive despite increased spending on both pensions and public safety salaries. Budgeting pressure is likely to continue as the city attempts to build up police staffing levels and continues with increasing pension contributions.

#### Economic Resource Base

Dallas is the anchor of the large and diverse Dallas-Fort Worth regional economy. The city is a center for technology, trade, finance and healthcare; it also ranks among the top visitor and leisure destinations in the state.

#### **KEY RATING DRIVERS**

#### Revenue Framework: 'aaa'

Strong revenue growth prospects are based on expectations for continued gains in taxable value and sales tax revenues due to ongoing economic expansion. The assessment also reflects the city's ample independent revenue raising capacity.

#### Expenditure Framework: 'a'

The city's pace of spending is expected to be generally in line with revenue growth given its mature residential base. Increased pension contributions will keep carrying costs at an elevated level; a rapid debt amortization rate also contributes to the elevated carrying costs.

#### Long-Term Liability Burden: 'aa'

The long-term liability burden currently represents a moderate 14% of personal income. Recent pension reforms to both the civilian and uniform plans have reduced the combined total liability by roughly 40%. These reforms, in conjunction with continued economic growth, are expected to keep the long-term liability burden within the current range.

#### Operating Performance: 'aaa'

The city of Dallas' gap-closing capabilities and healthy reserves position it to maintain financial resilience through a typical economic downturn. Elevated debt and retiree benefit outlays will maintain a certain amount of pressure on the city's budget management practices.

### RATING SENSITIVITIES

Maintenance of Operating Flexibility: Recent strong revenue performance has enabled management to both successfully absorb larger annual pension contributions and boost public safety salaries without affecting overall general fund performance. Any economic weakness would likely shrink revenue gains and could amplify budgetary pressures. Conversely, continued positive operating performance and successful absorption of additional public safety spending could lead to positive rating action.

### **CREDIT PROFILE**

Dallas is located in north central Texas and with a population of 1.34 million ranks among the top 10 U.S. cities by population. The city serves as corporate headquarters for AT&T, Southwest Airlines, Texas Instruments, 7-Eleven, Inc., HollyFrontier Corp., Pizza Hut, Inc. and other large corporate concerns. Nokia, Vistaprint, Amazon Services and Home Depot lead the list of recent or planned relocations and expansions. Large employers in the education, government and health services sectors lend stability to the city's employment base.

The city's role as a wholesale and retail trade center is enabled by a strong transportation network of airports, rail and interstate highways. Dallas Area Rapid Transit (DART) provides major employers easy access to a highly skilled work force to support growing technology, finance, business and medical service sectors. Driven by professional service, construction, mining and trade sector growth, the city's employment base continues to expand. Top taxpayers represent utility, air transportation, developers, real estate, manufacturing and retail industries, and the tax base has no significant concentration.

#### **Revenue Framework**

General fund operations are supported by a diverse mix of revenues led by ad valorem tax revenues (49% of the fiscal 2018 total), sales tax revenues (25%), and franchise fees (12%). General fund revenue growth has accelerated the past several years after sluggish post-recession gains; annual increases have averaged more than 5% over the past five years.

Near term revenue growth prospects are strong based on the overall strength of the local and regional economies, including expansion in the trade/transportation, professional business services and leisure/hospitality sectors. New development continues, as indicated by ongoing growth in the city's residential and commercial building permit activity, including \$2.4 billion in new permit activity in fiscal 2018. This activity is also reflected in recent tax base gains. Annual TAV gains have averaged nearly 9% the past four years, including a 10% increase in fiscal 2019 to \$130.1 billion. The city expects another 6% gain in TAV for fiscal 2020.

The city's fiscal 2019 total tax rate of \$0.7767 per \$100 of TAV has been reduced for three consecutive years and provides ample legal revenueraising capacity below the constitutional and city charter caps of \$2.50. If a proposed tax rate results in an 8% or higher year-over-year levy increase (based on the prior year's values), the rate increase may be subject to election if petitioned by voters.

#### Expenditure Framework

As is typical with U.S. cities, public safety is Dallas' largest operating spending category (60% of fiscal 2018 general fund outlays), followed by general government and culture and recreation (both at 12%). General fund spending growth has generally kept pace with revenue gains in recent years.

Fitch expects the pace of spending growth to generally track what is projected to be a positive trajectory in revenues, as future service demands from a relatively mature residential base and increasing public safety and pension outlays should align with increasing operating receipts over the near to medium term.

The recent pension reforms have reduced required contribution amounts but the city's annual carrying costs (debt service, actuarially determined pension contributions, actual other post-employment benefit [OPEB] outlays) remain elevated -- 27% of fiscal 2018 governmental spending. Fitch expects actual carrying costs to remain high, the result of both increased pension contributions to the police and fire plan and debt service associated with a \$1.05 billion GO bond authorization approved by voters in 2017. Fitch's supplemental pension metric, which estimates the annual pension cost based on a level dollar payment for 20 years with a 5% interest rate, indicates that carrying costs are vulnerable to future increases.

The new bond program is heavily weighted toward streets (53%) and parks and recreation (26%). The current carrying costs also reflect a rapid 70% debt amortization rate over the next 10 years, which will lessen somewhat the burden associated with new debt. The city's ability to control headcount and salary costs is strong, providing operational flexibility.

#### Long-Term Liability Burden

Dallas' long-term liability burden is moderate at 13.6% of personal income, with roughly 45% of the Dec. 31, 2017 total attributable to unfunded pension liabilities; the liability calculation is adjusted by Fitch to assume a more conservative 6% investment return. The burden is down from roughly

4/16/2019

#### [ Press Release ] Fitch Rates Dallas, TX \$378MM GO Bonds 'AA'; Outlook Stable

19% of personal income recently as a result of the various pension reforms. The city currently has roughly \$2.2 billion in GO debt outstanding (including these offerings), about 20% of the total long-term liability burden. Overlapping debt of \$3.7 billion comprises the remainder of the liability (35% of the total).

Dallas participates in three single employer defined benefit pension plans. The ERF covers non-uniformed employees. The DPFP (combined plan) and the smaller Supplemental Police and Fire Pension Plan of the city of Dallas (supplemental plan) cover police and firefighters.

Under GASB Statement 68, the ERF plan at Dec. 31, 2017 reported a net pension liability (NPL) of roughly \$766 million, with fiduciary assets covering 83% of total pension liabilities at the plan's 7.75% investment return assumption. Changes to the benefit plan were approved by the ERF board, city council and voters in 2016. They apply to employees hired on or after Jan. 1, 2017 and include an increase in the normal retirement age from 60 to 65, an increase in service retirement from 30 to 40 years, elimination of the health benefit supplement, and a reduction in the benefit multiplier from 2.75% to 2.5%. These changes are expected to boost to the long-term viability of the plan.

In response to a steady weakening of the DPFP plan--attributable primarily to issues associated with the deferred retirement option program (DROP) feature--the Texas Legislature in its 2017 regular session approved legislation that made a number of noteworthy changes to the DPFP plan. The modifications included increases in retirement ages for the various tiers of employees, a reduction in the benefit multiplier for most employees and elimination of the current COLA benefit. The legislation also made changes to the troubled DROP, including a 10-year limitation on participation, elimination of interest on DROP accounts after Sept. 1, 2017, and modifications to DROP account distribution options. The legislation also called for increased plan contributions from both the city and employees. These reforms should stabilize the city's obligations to the plan and reduce the risks presented by the DROP feature of the retirement plan, and should enhance the plan's long-term viability.

Under GASB Statement 68, the DPFP plan reported an NPL for the combined and supplemental plans of \$2.4 billion and \$16 million, respectively as of Dec. 31, 2017. The \$2.4 billion combined plan NPL is down from \$6.3 billion in the prior reporting period. Fiduciary assets of the combined plan covered 47% of liabilities based on a 7.25% rate of return assumption. Fiduciary assets covered 53% of the liabilities of the supplemental plan. The Dec. 31, 2017 NPL for all three plans totaled \$3.18 billion, with assets covering 64% of liabilities. The NPL increases to \$4.77 billion and the ratio of assets to liabilities declines to 55% when a 6% investment return assumption is used.

The city has addressed another sizeable potential financial liability, namely several back pay disputes with city public safety employees. The city settled four suits (the Collin County lawsuits) in 2017 for \$61.7 million, and funding was provided through a 2018 GO bond financing. Negotiations on the remaining two class-action back-pay lawsuits (the Rockwall County suits) concluded successfully in 2018, and the city council authorized a \$173 million settlement. The settlement figures, while not immaterial, are substantially less than the potential figures originally cited. The series 2019B GO refunding bonds will finance the Rockwall County suits' settlement.

## **Operating Performance**

Fitch expects Dallas to demonstrate strong financial resilience during economic downturns, as demonstrated by a history of the highest gap-closing capacity and sizable reserves. Audited fiscal 2018 general fund results included a net surplus after transfers of \$21 million and unrestricted reserves of nearly \$235 million (18% of spending), as both revenues and expenditures outperformed budget.

4/16/2019

#### [ Press Release ] Fitch Rates Dallas, TX \$378MM GO Bonds 'AA'; Outlook Stable

The city has demonstrated positive budget management practices historically, and the positive fiscal 2018 results (that included sharply higher pension contribution amounts) continued that trend and enabled the city to maintain a strong financial cushion. However, the increased annual pension contributions will maintain a degree of pressure on the city's budget management practices for the foreseeable future.

The fiscal 2018 budget was year one of a biennial budget process adopted by the city for the first time. The fiscal 2019 adopted general fund budget was balanced and included a 6.5% spending increase to \$1.366 billion -- due in part to increased public safety spending (both salaries and pensions). The fiscal 2019 DPFP contribution from the city is scheduled at roughly \$157 million and includes a \$13 million supplemental contribution that is scheduled to occur annually until 2024.

Dallas continues to contend with attracting and retaining police officers. The fiscal 2019 budget includes funding for 3,050 officers, down from 3,613 budgeted positions in fiscal 2017. Management is hopeful the recent salary adjustments (increase in starting pay, salary increase for current officers, additional salary step) will stem the recent attrition, which likely reflects both rank and file departures during the pension crisis and police recruiting challenges nationwide. The current projection for fiscal 2019 general fund results suggest another operating surplus of nearly \$13 million, the result reportedly of both revenues and spending again outperforming budget. Sales taxes are projected to total more than \$315 million, a more than 3% increase from the prior year and \$3.6 million above budget.

Contact:

Primary Analyst Steve Murray Senior Director +1-512-215-3729 Fitch Ratings, Inc. 111 Congress Avenue Austin, TX 78701

Secondary Analyst Emmanuelle Lawrence Director +1-512-215-3740

Committee Chairperson Michael Rinaldi Senior Director +1-212-908-0833

In addition to the sources of information identified in Fitch's applicable criteria specified below, this action was informed by information from Lumesis.

Media Relations: Sandro Scenga, New York, Tel: +1 212 908 0278, Email: sandro.scenga@thefitchgroup.com

Additional information is available on www.fitchratings.com Applicable Criteria U.S. Public Finance Tax-Supported Rating Criteria (pub. 03 Apr 2018)

Additional Disclosures Dodd-Frank Rating Information Disclosure Form Solicitation Status Endorsement Policy

ALL FITCH CREDIT RATINGS ARE SUBJECT TO CERTAIN LIMITATIONS AND DISCLAIMERS. PLEASE READ THESE LIMITATIONS AND DISCLAIMERS BY FOLLOWING THIS LINK: HTTPS://WWW.FITCHRATINGS.COM/UNDERSTANDINGCREDITRATINGS. IN ADDITION, RATING DEFINITIONS AND THE TERMS OF USE OF SUCH RATINGS ARE AVAILABLE ON THE AGENCY'S PUBLIC WEB SITE AT WWW.FITCHRATINGS.COM. PUBLISHED RATINGS, CRITERIA, AND METHODOLOGIES ARE AVAILABLE FROM THIS SITE AT ALL TIMES. FITCH'S CODE OF CONDUCT, CONFIDENTIALITY, CONFLICTS OF INTEREST, AFFILIATE FIREWALL, COMPLIANCE, AND OTHER RELEVANT POLICIES AND PROCEDURES ARE ALSO AVAILABLE FROM THE CODE OF CONDUCT SECTION OF THIS SITE. DIRECTORS AND SHAREHOLDERS RELEVANT INTERESTS ARE AVAILABLE AT HTTPS://WWW.FITCHRATINGS.COM/SITE/REGULATORY. FITCH MAY HAVE PROVIDED ANOTHER PERMISSIBLE SERVICE TO THE RATED ENTITY OR ITS RELATED THIRD PARTIES. DETAILS OF THIS SERVICE FOR RATINGS FOR WHICH THE LEAD ANALYST IS BASED IN AN EU-REGISTERED ENTITY CAN BE FOUND ON THE ENTITY SUMMARY PAGE FOR THIS ISSUER ON THE FITCH WEBSITE.

Copyright © 2019 by Fitch Ratings, Inc., Fitch Ratings Ltd. and its subsidiaries. 33 Whitehall Street, NY, NY 10004. Telephone: 1-800-753-4824, (212) 908-0500. Fax: (212) 480-4435. Reproduction or retransmission in whole or in part is prohibited except by permission. All rights reserved. In issuing and maintaining its ratings and in making other reports (including forecast information), Fitch relies on factual information it receives from issuers and underwriters and from other sources Fitch believes to be credible. Fitch conducts a reasonable investigation of the factual information relied upon by it in accordance with its ratings methodology, and obtains reasonable verification of that information from independent sources, to the extent such sources are available for a given security or in a given jurisdiction. The manner of Fitch's factual investigation and the scope of the third-party verification it obtains will vary depending on the nature of the rated security and its issuer, the requirements and practices in the jurisdiction in which the rated security is offered and sold and/or the issuer is located, the availability and nature of relevant public information, access to the management of the issuer and its advisers, the availability of pre-existing third-party verifications such as audit reports, agreed-upon procedures letters, appraisals, actuarial reports, engineering reports, legal opinions and other reports provided by third parties, the availability of independent and competent third- party verification sources with respect to the particular security or in the particular jurisdiction of the issuer, and a variety of other factors. Users of Fitch's ratings and reports should understand that neither an enhanced factual investigation nor any third-party verification can ensure that all of the information Fitch relies on in connection with a rating or a report will be accurate and complete. Ultimately, the issuer and its advisers are responsible for the accuracy of the information they provide to Fitch

#### [ Press Release ] Fitch Rates Dallas, TX \$378MM GO Bonds 'AA'; Outlook Stable

issuing its ratings and its reports, Fitch must rely on the work of experts, including independent auditors with respect to financial statements and attorneys with respect to legal and tax matters. Further, ratings and forecasts of financial and other information are inherently forward-looking and embody assumptions and predictions about future events that by their nature cannot be verified as facts. As a result, despite any verification of current facts, ratings and forecasts can be affected by future events or conditions that were not anticipated at the time a rating or forecast was issued or affirmed.

The information in this report is provided "as is" without any representation or warranty of any kind, and Fitch does not represent or warrant that the report or any of its contents will meet any of the requirements of a recipient of the report. A Fitch rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a security. This opinion and reports made by Fitch are based on established criteria and methodologies that Fitch is continuously evaluating and updating. Therefore, ratings and reports are the collective work product of Fitch and no individual, or group of individuals, is solely responsible for a rating or a report. The rating does not address the risk of loss due to risks other than credit risk, unless such risk is specifically mentioned. Fitch is not engaged in the offer or sale of any security. All Fitch reports have shared authorship. Individuals identified in a Fitch report were involved in, but are not solely responsible for, the opinions stated therein. The individuals are named for contact purposes only. A report providing a Fitch rating is neither a prospectus nor a substitute for the information assembled, verified and presented to investors by the issuer and its agents in connection with the sale of the securities. Ratings may be changed or withdrawn at any time for any reason in the sole discretion of Fitch. Fitch does not provide investment advice of any sort. Ratings are not a recommendation to buy, sell, or hold any security. Ratings do not comment on the adequacy of market price, the suitability of any security for a particular investor, or the tax-exempt nature or taxability of payments made in respect to any security. Fitch receives fees from issuers, insurers, guarantors, other obligors, and underwriters for rating securities. Such fees generally vary from US\$1,000 to US\$750,000 (or the applicable currency equivalent) per issue. In certain cases, Fitch will rate all or a number of issues issued by a particular issuer, or insured or guaranteed by a particular insurer or guarantor, for a single annual fee. Such fees are expected to vary from US\$10,000 to US\$1,500,000 (or the applicable currency equivalent). The assignment, publication, or dissemination of a rating by Fitch shall not constitute a consent by Fitch to use its name as an expert in connection with any registration statement filed under the United States securities laws, the Financial Services and Markets Act of 2000 of the United Kingdom, or the securities laws of any particular jurisdiction. Due to the relative efficiency of electronic publishing and distribution. Fitch research may be available to electronic subscribers up to three days earlier than to print subscribers.

For Australia, New Zealand, Taiwan and South Korea only: Fitch Australia Pty Ltd holds an Australian financial services license (AFS license no. 337123) which authorizes it to provide credit ratings to wholesale clients only. Credit ratings information published by Fitch is not intended to be used by persons who are retail clients within the meaning of the Corporations Act 2001

Fitch Ratings, Inc. is registered with the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission as a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization (the "NRSRO"). While certain of the NRSRO's credit rating subsidiaries are listed on Item 3 of Form NRSRO and as such are authorized to issue credit ratings on behalf of the NRSRO (see https://www.fitchratings.com/site/regulatory), other credit rating subsidiaries are not listed on Form NRSRO (the "non-NRSROs") and therefore credit ratings issued by those subsidiaries are not issued on behalf of the NRSRO. However, non-NRSRO personnel may participate in determining credit ratings issued by or on behalf of the NRSRO.

# SOLICITATION STATUS

The ratings above were solicited and assigned or maintained at the request of the rated entity/issuer or a related third party. Any exceptions follow below.

4/16/2019

# **Endorsement Policy**

Fitch's approach to ratings endorsement so that ratings produced outside the EU may be used by regulated entities within the EU for regulatory purposes, pursuant to the terms of the EU Regulation with respect to credit rating agencies, can be found on the EU Regulatory Disclosures page. The endorsement status of all International ratings is provided within the entity summary page for each rated entity and in the transaction detail pages for all structured finance transactions on the Fitch website. These disclosures are updated on a daily basis.

# Fitch Updates Terms of Use & Privacy Policy

We have updated our Terms of Use and Privacy Policies which cover all of Fitch Group's websites. Learn more.