### Memorandum



DATE May 13, 2019

TO Honorable Mayor and Council Members

# Moody's Investors Service includes Dallas Water Utilities Under Review for Downgrade Following Court Ruling in Puerto Rico - INFORMATION

Today, Moody's Investor Services (Moody's) has placed seven water and sewer utilities systems, including Dallas Water Utilities, and one special assessment district under review for downgrade. According to Moody's, this action is, "driven by the 3 or 4 notch positive rating differentials between the ratings [of the utility]...and the general obligation or issuer ratings of their associated "parent" local government." Currently, Moody's has assigned Dallas Water Utilities its 'Aa1' rating, three notches higher than the General Obligation rating at 'A1'. Moody's also states that the review will, "consider economic, governance, and financial interdependencies between the affected entities and their "parent" governments, and whether these interdependencies detract from credit quality."

The review will, "consider the implications of recent legal developments in the Puerto Rico (Ca negative) bankruptcy-like proceeding," following the US Court of Appeals for the First Circuit ruling in April. The ruling states that, "the Commonwealth is not required to pay 'special revenue' debt service on Puerto Rico Highways and Transportation Authority (PRHTA) bonds (C negative) during the pendency of the bankruptcy-like proceeding." Moody's contends that, "the uncertainty regarding the interpretation of 'special revenue' resulting from the federal appeals court ruling underscores the importance of the linkage between a local government's general credit quality and that of its enterprises. The ruling has implications even for those entities located outside the 1st Circuit or not currently eligible to file for bankruptcy." The State of Texas falls under the purview of the United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit.

This notice is not a credit rating decision, but a disclosure from Moody's that a review is taking place. Dallas Water Utilities maintains strong ratings with S&P Global Ratings ('AAA') and Fitch Ratings ('AA+'). The City of Dallas continues to be economically strong, fiscally stable, and a solid investment. I will continue to share with you any further updates or related credit changes.

### SUBJECT Moody's Investors Service includes Dallas Water Utilities Under Review for Downgrade Following Court Ruling in Puerto Rico- INFORMATION

Please let me know if you need additional information.

M. Clyabeth Reich
M. Elizabeth Reich
Chief Financial Officer

Attachment

T.C. Broadnax, City Manager
 Chris Caso, City Attorney (Interim)
 Mark Swann, City Auditor
 Bilierae Johnson, City Secretary
 Preston Robinson, Administrative Judge
 Kimberly Bizor Tolbert, Chief of Staff to the City Manager
 Majed A. Al-Ghafry, Assistant City Manager

Jon Fortune, Assistant City Manager Joey Zapata, Assistant City Manager Nadia Chandler Hardy, Assistant City Manager and Chief Resilience Officer Michael Mendoza, Chief of Economic Development and Neighborhood Services Laila Alequresh, Chief Innovation Officer Directors and Assistant Directors



## Rating Action: Moody's places 8 ratings under review for downgrade in wake of recent court ruling on special revenue pledges

13 May 2019

New York, May 13, 2019 -- Moody's Investors Service has placed the rating of 7 water/sewer utilities and 1 special assessment district under review for downgrade, affecting approximately \$13.8 billion in outstanding rated debt.

Please click on this link <a href="http://www.moodys.com/viewresearchdoc.aspx?docid=PBM\_PBM203359">http://www.moodys.com/viewresearchdoc.aspx?docid=PBM\_PBM203359</a> for the List of Affected Credit Ratings. This list is an integral part of this Press Release and identifies each affected issuer.

#### **RATINGS RATIONALE**

Today's action is driven by the 3 or 4 notch positive rating differentials between the ratings listed in the attachment above and the general obligation or issuer ratings of their associated "parent" local government. These large differentials potentially over-weight the standalone credit strength of the utility enterprise or special assessment district. The review affects both senior and subordinate lien debt (if any) under review, given the strong relationships among these different security pledges. The review will consider economic, governance, and financial interdependencies between the affected entities and their "parent" governments, and whether these interdependencies detract from credit quality.

Our review will consider the implications of recent legal developments in the Puerto Rico (Ca negative) bankruptcy-like proceeding. In April, the US Court of Appeals for the 1st Circuit ruled that the Commonwealth is not required to pay "special revenue" debt service on Puerto Rico Highway and Transportation Authority (PRHTA) bonds (C negative) during the pendency of the bankruptcy-like proceeding. While the ruling affects only those states and the Commonwealth that are within the 1st Circuit, this is the first time that an appellate-level court has addressed the issue of whether pledged special revenues must be paid to bondholders in a municipal bankruptcy or restructuring process. In other municipal bankruptcies, utility and other enterprise revenue bonds have offered high recoveries when associated with general government insolvencies, though they have not always been immune from impairment despite likely falling under the "special revenue" definition in the Bankruptcy Code.

The uncertainty regarding the interpretation of "special revenue" resulting from the federal appeals court ruling underscores the importance of the linkage between a local government's general credit quality and that of its enterprises. The ruling has implications even for those entities located outside the 1st Circuit or not currently eligible to file for bankruptcy.

The "parent" local governments associated with the affected entities, as well as their current general obligation (or issuer) ratings and outlooks, are as follows:

3 notch difference:

For City of Chicago, IL, Water Enterprise (senior rating, Baa1), City of Chicago, IL (Ba1 stable)

For City of Cleveland, OH, Water Enterprise (senior rating, Aa1), City of Cleveland, OH (A1 stable)

For City of Dallas, TX, Waterworks and Sewer Enterprise (Aa1), City of Dallas, TX (A1 stable)

For Granite City Wastewater Treatment Plant, IL (A1), City of Granite City, IL (Baa1 stable)

For Lynn Water and Sewer Commission, MA (A1), City of Lynn, MA (Baa1 negative)

For City of Sheffield, AL, Electric Enterprise (Aa3), City of Sheffield, AL (A3)

For Center City District (Philadelphia) PA (Aa2), City of Philadelphia, PA (A2 stable)

4 notch difference:

For Monroe County Water Authority, NY (Aa2), Monroe County, NY (A3 positive)

### **METHODOLOGY**

The principal methodology used in the issuer rating was US Public Finance Special Tax Methodology published in July 2017. The principal methodology used in the revenue ratings was US Municipal Utility Revenue Debt published in October 2017. Please see the Rating Methodologies page on www.moodys.com for a copy of these methodologies.

### REGULATORY DISCLOSURES

For ratings issued on a program, series or category/class of debt, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to each rating of a subsequently issued bond or note of the same series or category/class of debt or pursuant to a program for which the ratings are derived exclusively from existing ratings in accordance with Moody's rating practices. For ratings issued on a support provider, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the credit rating action on the support provider and in relation to each particular credit rating action for securities that derive their credit ratings from the support provider's credit rating. For provisional ratings, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the provisional rating assigned, and in relation to a definitive rating that may be assigned subsequent to the final issuance of the debt, in each case where the transaction structure and terms have not changed prior to the assignment of the definitive rating in a manner that would have affected the rating. For further information please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page for the respective issuer on www.moodys.com.

Regulatory disclosures contained in this press release apply to the credit rating and, if applicable, the related rating outlook or rating review.

Please see www.moodys.com for any updates on changes to the lead rating analyst and to the Moody's legal entity that has issued the rating.

Please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page on www.moodys.com for additional regulatory disclosures for each credit rating.

Gregory Lipitz
Lead Analyst
Regional PFG Northeast
Moody's Investors Service, Inc.
7 World Trade Center
250 Greenwich Street
New York 10007
US
JOURNALISTS: 1 212 553 0376

Client Service: 1 212 553 1653

Naomi Richman Additional Contact PF General Administration JOURNALISTS: 1 212 553 0376 Client Service: 1 212 553 1653

Releasing Office: Moody's Investors Service, Inc. 250 Greenwich Street New York, NY 10007 U.S.A

JOURNALISTS: 1 212 553 0376 Client Service: 1 212 553 1653



CREDIT RATINGS ISSUED BY MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE, INC. AND ITS RATINGS AFFILIATES ("MIS") ARE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES, AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY INCLUDE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES. MOODY'S DEFINES CREDIT RISK AS THE RISK THAT AN ENTITY MAY NOT MEET ITS CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS AS THEY COME DUE AND ANY ESTIMATED FINANCIAL LOSS IN THE EVENT OF DEFAULT OR IMPAIRMENT. SEE MOODY'S RATING SYMBOLS AND DEFINITIONS PUBLICATION FOR INFORMATION ON THE TYPES OF CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS ADDRESSED BY MOODY'S RATINGS. CREDIT RATINGS DO NOT ADDRESS ANY OTHER RISK, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: LIQUIDITY RISK. MARKET VALUE RISK, OR PRICE VOLATILITY. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S OPINIONS INCLUDED IN MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT STATEMENTS OF CURRENT OR HISTORICAL FACT. MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY ALSO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE MODEL-BASED ESTIMATES OF CREDIT RISK AND RELATED OPINIONS OR COMMENTARY PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ANALYTICS. INC. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS DO NOT CONSTITUTE OR PROVIDE INVESTMENT OR FINANCIAL ADVICE, AND CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT AND DO NOT PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO PURCHASE, SELL, OR HOLD PARTICULAR SECURITIES. NEITHER CREDIT RATINGS NOR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS COMMENT ON THE SUITABILITY OF AN INVESTMENT FOR ANY PARTICULAR INVESTOR, MOODY'S ISSUES ITS CREDIT RATINGS AND PUBLISHES MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS WITH THE EXPECTATION AND UNDERSTANDING THAT EACH INVESTOR WILL, WITH DUE CARE, MAKE ITS OWN STUDY AND EVALUATION OF EACH SECURITY THAT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PURCHASE, HOLDING, OR SALE.

MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY RETAIL INVESTORS AND IT WOULD BE RECKLESS AND INAPPROPRIATE FOR RETAIL INVESTORS TO USE MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS OR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS WHEN MAKING AN INVESTMENT DECISION. IF IN DOUBT YOU SHOULD CONTACT YOUR FINANCIAL OR OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISER.

ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN IS PROTECTED BY LAW, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, COPYRIGHT LAW, AND NONE OF SUCH INFORMATION MAY BE COPIED OR OTHERWISE REPRODUCED, REPACKAGED, FURTHER TRANSMITTED, TRANSFERRED, DISSEMINATED, REDISTRIBUTED OR RESOLD, OR STORED FOR SUBSEQUENT USE FOR ANY SUCH PURPOSE, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, IN ANY FORM OR MANNER OR BY ANY MEANS WHATSOEVER, BY ANY PERSON WITHOUT MOODY'S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT.

CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY ANY PERSON AS A BENCHMARK AS THAT TERM IS DEFINED FOR REGULATORY PURPOSES AND MUST NOT BE USED IN ANY WAY THAT COULD RESULT IN THEM BEING CONSIDERED A BENCHMARK.

All information contained herein is obtained by MOODY'S from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human or mechanical error as well as other factors, however, all information contained herein is provided "AS IS" without warranty of any kind. MOODY'S adopts all necessary measures so that the information it uses in assigning a credit rating is of sufficient quality and from sources MOODY'S considers to be reliable including, when appropriate, independent third-party sources. However, MOODY'S is not an auditor and cannot in every instance independently verify or validate information received in the rating process or in preparing the Moody's publications.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability to any person or entity for any indirect, special, consequential, or incidental losses or damages whatsoever arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information, even if MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers is advised in advance of the possibility of such losses or damages, including but not limited to: (a) any loss of present or prospective profits or (b) any loss or damage arising where the relevant financial instrument is not the subject of a particular credit rating assigned by MOODY'S.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability for any direct or compensatory losses or damages caused to any person or entity, including but not limited to by any negligence (but excluding fraud, willful misconduct or any other type of liability that, for the avoidance of doubt, by law cannot be excluded) on the part of, or any contingency within or beyond the control of, MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers, arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information.

NO WARRANTY, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, AS TO THE ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR ANY PARTICULAR PURPOSE OF ANY CREDIT RATING OR OTHER OPINION OR INFORMATION IS GIVEN OR MADE BY MOODY'S IN ANY FORM OR MANNER WHATSOEVER.

Moody's Investors Service, Inc., a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Corporation ("MCO"), hereby discloses that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by Moody's Investors Service, Inc. have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to Moody's Investors Service, Inc. for ratings opinions and services rendered by it fees ranging from \$1,000 to approximately \$2,700,000. MCO and MIS also maintain policies and procedures to address the independence of MIS's ratings and rating processes. Information regarding certain affiliations that may exist between directors of MCO and rated entities, and between entities who hold ratings from MIS and have also publicly reported to the SEC an ownership interest in MCO of more than 5%, is posted annually at <a href="https://www.moodys.com">www.moodys.com</a> under the heading "Investor Relations — Corporate Governance — Director and Shareholder Affiliation Policy."

Additional terms for Australia only: Any publication into Australia of this document is pursuant to the Australian Financial Services License of MOODY'S affiliate, Moody's Investors Service Pty Limited ABN 61 003 399 657AFSL 336969 and/or Moody's Analytics Australia Pty Ltd ABN 94 105 136 972 AFSL 383569 (as applicable). This document is intended to be provided only to "wholesale clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. By continuing to access this document from within Australia, you represent to MOODY'S that you are, or are accessing the document as a representative of, a "wholesale client" and that neither you nor the entity you represent will directly or indirectly disseminate this document or its contents to "retail clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. MOODY'S credit rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a debt obligation of the issuer, not on the equity securities of the issuer or any form of security that is available to retail investors.

Additional terms for Japan only: Moody's Japan K.K. ("MJKK") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Group Japan G.K., which is wholly-owned by Moody's Overseas Holdings Inc., a wholly-owned subsidiary of MCO. Moody's SF Japan K.K. ("MSFJ") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MJKK. MSFJ is not a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization ("NRSRO"). Therefore, credit ratings assigned by MSFJ are Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings. Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings are assigned by an entity that is not a NRSRO and, consequently, the rated obligation will not qualify for certain types of treatment under U.S. laws. MJKK and MSFJ are credit rating agencies registered with the Japan Financial Services Agency and their registration numbers are FSA Commissioner (Ratings) No. 2 and 3 respectively.

MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) hereby disclose that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) for ratings opinions and services rendered by it fees ranging from JPY125,000 to approximately JPY250,000,000.

MJKK and MSFJ also maintain policies and procedures to address Japanese regulatory requirements.