January 6, 2020



The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on January 6, 2020 with a briefing at 11:05 a.m. in room 5ES, the public hearing at 1:20 p.m. in the Council Chambers in room 5ES of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

\* Alternates

Sam Childers Krista De la Harpe Katherine Haskel Rosemary Hinojosa Evelyn Montgomery – Vice Chair Leigh Richter Diane Sherman Katy Slade Elizabeth Mast Courtney Spellicy \*Edward Stone Robert Swann Emily Williams – Chair \*Elaine Velvin Christopher Poteet

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: No one

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: No one

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:

**Donald Payton** 

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing:

**Donald Payton** 

The following Positions are vacant:

District 15

The following Staff was present:

Liz Casso Neva Dean Elaine Hill Anna Lamberti Holmes Renee Paramo Melissa Parent Marsha Prior Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

## Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

#### Public Testimony:

Approval of minutes – No Speakers

# Motion was made to rearrange the discussion docket and hear CR1, D3, D4, D6, D2, and the remaining items will be heard in their natural order.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Stone, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

## Motion was made to approve the consent docket following staff recommendations.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Stone, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

# **CONSENT ITEMS**

# 1. 6116 REIGER AVE

J.L. Long Middle School

CA190-138(LC)

## Liz Casso

Install new hardscaping at front elevation - Approve drawings dated 1/6/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 3.3 for new walkways and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# 2. 1933 ELM ST

Harwood Historic District CA190-132(LC)

Liz Casso

- 1. Install flat attached sign on east elevation Approve drawings dated 1/6/20 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 7.1 for signs and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- Install window signs on entry doors on east elevation Approve drawings dated 1/6/20 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 7.1 for signs and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# 3. 337 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA190-136(MLP) Melissa Parent

- 1. Replace all existing siding on main and accessory structures with new #117 wood siding Approve specifications dated 1/6/2020 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for façade materials in the preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(10)(A) and 51P-87.111(a)(10)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Construct pergola style carport in rear yard Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/6/2020 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory buildings in the preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(1) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- Construct addition on rear accessory structure Approve drawings and specifications dated 1/6/2020 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory buildings in the preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(1) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# **COURTESY REVIEW ITEMS**

Courtesy Review - Construct an approximately 240-foot-tall clock tower in Tract 3 - Approve conceptually, contingent on City Council approval of the amendment to the preservation criteria to allow a 240-foot-tall clock tower in tract 3, and with the condition that final plans, elevations, and details are submitted for final Landmark Commission approval.

Speakers: For:

Ed McGonigle Brett Ratliff

#### Harlan Crowe

Against: No One

#### **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### 1. 5309 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District CA190-133(MLP) Melissa Parent Install one new vinyl window on front facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No One

Against: No One

#### Motion

Install one new vinyl window on front facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) on the basis that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.

Maker:	Spellicy				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	14/1				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Stone, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	1	Hinojosa
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

## 2. 4724 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA190-130(MP) Marsha Prior

Marsha Prior

- 1. Construct carport in rear yard.
- 2. Resize and relocate window on left, corner side elevation.

Speakers: For:

Mark LeFaive

Against: No One

## Motion

1. Construct carport in rear yard – Deny without prejudice – Per request of the applicant.

2. Resize and relocate window on left, corner side elevation – Approve with conditions – Approve window as submitted. Header to be in line with existing header heights.

Maker:	Childers				
Second:	De la harpe				
Results:	13/1				
		Ayes:	-	13	Childers, De la harpe, Hinojosa, Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	1	Swann
		Absent:	-	2	Haskel, Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

\*Commissioner Katherine Haskel stepped out and did not hear or vote on this case.

## 3. 2616 STATE ST

State Thomas Historic District CA190-137(LC) Liz Casso Construct a 2.5-story residence with attached garage.

Speakers: For: Thomas Fancher

Against: No one

#### Motion #1

Construct a 2.5-story residence with attached garage – Approve with conditions – Approve with the condition that at least two French door openings on the front elevation be changed to double hung windows, that windows be added to the second floor above the bay window on the east elevation, that the width of the structure must comply with the preservation criteria, and that the applicant returns with a CA application for paint, roof color, landscaping, and fencing, with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria section 51P-225.109(a)(3) for architectural detail; 51P-225.109(a)(5), (6), and (7)(A)(i) for building eaves, placement and widths; section 51P-225.109(a)(10) for columns; section 51P-225.109(a)(11) for façade materials; section 51P-225.109(a)(12)(A)(i), (B), (D), and (F) for front entrances and porches; section 51P-225.109(a)(14)(A), (B), (C), and (E) for roof forms; section 51P-225.109(a)(16)(A)(i), (B), (F) for windows and doors; and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(G)(6)(c)(i).

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Richter				
Results:	2/13				FAILED
		Ayes:	-	2	Montgomery, Williams
		Against:	-	13	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Mast,

				Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Stone, Velvin
	Absent:	I	1	Payton
	Vacancies:	I	1	Dist. 15

#### **MOTION #2**

Construct a 2.5-story residence with attached garage – Deny without prejudice – The size of the proposed new construction design is not compatible with the historic district nor with the adjacent properties.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Childers				
Results:	14/1				
		Ayes:	-	14	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Stone, Velvin
		Against:	-	1	Williams
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

## 4. 2835 DATHE ST

Wheatley Place Historic District CA190-131(MP) Marsha Prior Construct porch on rear elevation. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Guadalupe Rodriguez

Against: No one

## Motion

Construct porch on rear elevation. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Deny without prejudice – The initiated work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A 4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because an incompatible addition would have an adverse impact on the historic overlay district.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	De la harpe				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade,

			Spellicy, Swann, Stone, Velvin, Williams
Against:	-	0	
Absent:	1	1	Payton
Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

## 5. 327 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA190-135(MLP)

Melissa Parent

Paint main structure. Brand: Behr. Body Color: 780F "Anonymous." Trim: "White." Accent: 770F "Dark Ash."

Speakers:

No one

No one

For:

Against:

Motion

Paint main structure. Brand: Behr. Body Color: 780F "Anonymous." Trim: "White." Accent: 770F "Dark Ash" – Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) on the basis that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.

Maker:	Childers				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Swann, Stone, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

# 6. 225 N ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA190-134(MLP) Melissa Parent Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body Color: SW9154 "Perle Noir." Trim: SW7005 "Pure White." Interior window sashes: SW2739 "Charcoal Blue."

Speakers:

Tony Brogan

Against: No one

For:

## Motion

Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body Color:

SW9154 "Perle Noir." Trim: SW7005 "Pure White." Interior window sashes: SW2739 "Charcoal Blue" – Approve – Approve with the condition the following colors be used: Body Color: (Not the brick) SW7668 "March Wind", Trim: SW7005 "Pure White" and Interior window sashes: SW2759 "Charcoal Blue".

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	De la harpe				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

## OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS

## Motion

Approval of Minutes - December 2, 2019

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Childers, De la harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Mast, Montgomery, Poteet, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Stone, Swann, Velvin, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 15

## ADJOURNMENT

Hearing was adjourned at 2:59 P.M.

Emily Williams, Chair