

April 3, 2017



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on April 3, 2017 with a briefing at 10:36 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:09 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Mike Birrer
Clint Bowers
Diane Bumpas
*Childers
Mattia Flabiano

Cris Jordan
Adam McGill
Evelyn Montgomery
Katherine Seale, Chair
*Diane Sherman

Robert Swann
Daron Tapscott
Sean Tate
Emily Williams

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **Paul Ridley**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: No one

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **Michael Amonett**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: No one

The following Position is vacant: District 3, and District 12

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty
Jennifer Anderson

Marsha Prior
Eric Hill
Liz Casso

Theresa Pham
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to move Consent Item C12 through C14 to the Discussion agenda.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Jordan
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion was made to move Discussion Item D8 to the Consent agenda.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Jordan
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C1 through C11 and C15 through C20 and D8 following staff recommendation.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take C12 through C14, D10, D1 through D3, D5 through D7, D9, D4 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Jordan
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

CONSENT ITEMS:

1. 728 SKILLMAN

Junius Heights Historic District
CE167-005(PT)
Pam Thompson

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$55,373.94 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

2. 217 S WINDOMERE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CE167-006(PT)
Pam Thompson

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$112,936 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

3. 214 N WILLOMET

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CE167-007(PT)
Pam Thompson

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$36,476 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

4. 4604 SYCAMORE STREET

Peak's Suburban Addition Historic District
CE167-008(PT)
Pam Thompson

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$37,703 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

5. 3201 WENDOVER

Bromberg House
CE167-009(PT)
Pam Thompson

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$38,893 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

6. 5429 KIWANIS RD

Sharrock/Niblo Historic District
CA167-319(LC)
Liz Casso

Install Recorded Texas Historic Landmark and National Register markers east of log cabin. **Approve** drawings dated 3/8/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria for signs in Section 11.1.b, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

7. 5823 COLUMBIA AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA167-325(MP)
Marsha Prior

Replace 5 wood windows with single hung 6/6 aluminum windows. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Approve** with the finding the completed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

8. 305 E 6TH ST

Lake Cliff Historic District
CA167-322(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Install 7' tall 12'x10' treehouse in rear yard. **Approve** drawings dated 3-14-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 9.4 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

9. 4936 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District

CA167-338(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Replace existing wood steps with brush finish concrete steps at front elevation of main structure – **Approve with conditions** - Approve elevation dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the steps are a brushed finished concrete and match the existing in dimensions and profile, with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(N) and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Extend existing 2' high concrete wall 10' along side to align with front of porch – **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the concrete matches the existing in material, profile, dimensions and color with the finding that while the proposed work is inconsistent with Preservation Criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(B) that states a fence must be constructed of metal or plastic-coated chain link, wrought iron, wood, or stucco, it meets the criteria in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B) for Landmark Commission approval of work that does not strictly comply because the proposed work is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.
3. Add 18" to height of existing concrete block wall facing Junius Street and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: AF 390 "Glacial Till" – **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the concrete block matches the existing in material, profile, dimensions and color with the finding that while the proposed work is inconsistent with Preservation Criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(B), that states a fence in the cornerside yard may not be directly in front of the cornerside façade, it meets the criteria in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B) for Landmark Commission approval of work that does not strictly comply because the proposed work is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.
4. Install 4' steel pedestrian gate and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: H.C. 134. "Tarry Town Green" - **Approve** drawings dated 03-16-17 with the finding that while the proposed work is inconsistent with Preservation Criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(B) which states a fence in the cornerside yard may not be directly in front of the cornerside yard, it meets the criteria in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B) for Landmark Commission approval of work that does not strictly comply because the proposed work is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.
5. Remove Volunteer Hackberry, Yaupon and Cedar trees from front yard – **Approve** proposed site plan dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Move existing Holly 15' to the east in front yard - **Approve** plans dated 03-16-17 with the finding it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
7. Replace non-original pierced concrete wall along N Carroll Avenue with 7' tall steel fence along 59' of side yard and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: HC 134 "Tarry Town Green" – **Approve** drawings dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the while the proposed work does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(B), that states a fence in the cornerside yard must be set back a minimum of two feet from a public sidewalk, it meets the criteria in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B) for Landmark Commission approval of work that does not strictly comply because the proposed work is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.
8. Replace 54' of brushed concrete sidewalk on N Collett frontage to match existing – **Approve** site plan dated 03-16-17 with the finding that it is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(I) and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

9. Remove brushed finish concrete flooring in corner side yard and replace with 2'x3' limestone block – **Approve** site plan dated 03-16-2017 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
10. Construct new side porch on east side facade, including the removal of existing brick railing between piers, repour concrete porch floor 7" higher than existing, construction of a wood pergola and the reconstruction of the two urns – **Approve with conditions** - Approve drawings dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the porch floor and steps are a brushed concrete finish, with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
11. Extend existing 5" retaining wall in rear cornerside yard 4' toward back of lot – **Approve** proposed site plan dated 03-16-17 with the finding that it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
12. Construct pergola on rear elevation of main structure and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: AF 390 "Glacial Till" – **Approve** drawings dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
13. Replace existing non-historic screen with shuttered panel on west side of rear elevation – **Approve** elevations dated 03-16-17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
14. Install landscaping and hardscaping in side and rear yards – **Approve** site plan dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

10. 5006 REIGER AVE

Munger Place Historic District
CA167-337(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Remove two trees in rear yard **Approve** site plan dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install in-ground swimming pool in rear yard **Approve** plan dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 621 N CARROLL AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-336(EH)
Eric Hill

Replace skirting on main structure – **Approve with conditions** - Approve specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that only the bottom two laps use a smooth Hardie board material and the remainder is wood siding matching existing in dimensions, profile and color, with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

12. 4300 JUNIUS ST (Moved to Discussion)

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-333(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Install 4 vents on both side elevations of main structure and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: PM-3 "Decorator's White."
2. Install landscaping stone around perimeter of main structure.
3. Install 9 A/C units on side and rear of main structure.
4. Reconfigure curb-cut on N. Peak street frontage.
5. Install telecommunications box in side-yard fence.

Speakers: For: David Malekan
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install 4 vents on both side elevations of main structure and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: PM-3 "Decorator's White" – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the vents are installed centered and installed into the mortar and that they are painted to match the main structure with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install landscaping stone around perimeter of main structure – Approve with conditions - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that proper edging is installed and **with the condition that landscaping stone is 2 inches or less in diameter and not road top or slab base** with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.6 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install 9 A/C units on side and rear of main structure – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the A/C units are fully screened from the street with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.7 and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Reconfigure curb-cut on N. Peak street frontage – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the applicant receives all other required permits from the City for altering the curb-cuts with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install telecommunications box in side-yard fence - **Approve** drawings dated 03-16-17 with the finding that it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Williams
Second: Flabiano
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

13. 4304 JUNIUS ST (Moved to Discussion)

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-334(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Install 4 vents on both side elevations of main structure and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: PM-3 "Decorator's White."
2. Install landscaping stone around perimeter of main structure.
3. Install 9 A/C units on side and rear elevations of main structure.

Speakers: For: David Malekan
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install 4 vents on both side elevations of main structure and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: PM-3 "Decorator's White" – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the vents are installed centered and installed into the mortar and that they are painted to match the main structure with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install landscaping stone around perimeter of main structure – Approve with conditions - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that proper edging is installed and **with the condition that landscaping stone is 2 inches or less in diameter and not road top or slab base** with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.6 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install 9 A/C units on side and rear elevations of main structure – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the A/C units are fully screened from the street with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.7 and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Williams
Second: Flabiano
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

14. 4310 JUNIUS ST (Moved to Discussion)

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-335(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Rebuild wood porches on rear of main structure.
2. Replace 4 vents on both side elevations of main structure and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: PM-3 "Decorator's White."
3. Install landscaping stone around perimeter of main structure.
4. Install 9 A/C units on side and rear elevations of main structure.

Speakers: For: David Malekan
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Rebuild wood porches on rear of main structure – **Approve with conditions** - Approve specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the porches exactly match the existing in materials, dimensions, profile, and color with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.3 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace 4 vents on both side elevations of main structure and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: PM-3 "Decorator's White" – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the vents are installed centered and installed into the mortar and that

they are painted to match the main structure with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. Install landscaping stone around perimeter of main structure – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that proper edging is installed and **with the condition that landscaping stone is 2 inches or less in diameter and not road top or slab base**. The proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.6 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install 9 A/C units on side and rear elevations of main structure – **Approve with conditions** - Approve site plan and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the condition that the A/C units are fully screened from the street with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.7 and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Williams
Second: Flabiano
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

15. 4604 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-331(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Replace 25% of siding on front and rear facades and 100% of siding on side facades of main structure with #105 pine siding – **Approve with conditions** - Approve proposed work with the condition that the replacement siding exactly matches the original in material, dimensions and profile, with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with Preservation Criteria Section 3.2 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install two laps of Hardie board on bottom section of skirting on main structure. **Approve** proposed work and specifications dated 03-16-17 with the finding that while the proposed work is not consistent with the preservation criteria which states that reconstruction renovation or repair of opaque elements of the protected facades must employ materials similar to the original materials, it meets the criteria in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B) for Landmark Commission Approval of work that does not strictly comply because the proposed work is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or integrity of the historic overlay district.
3. Stain wood board-on-board fence in rear yard. Brand: Minwax. Color: Red Mahogany 225 – **Approve** - Approve stain specification dated 03-16-17 with the finding that it meets the standard of City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

16. 6326 BRYAN PKWY

Swiss Avenue Historic District
CA167-339(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Remove 5 trees from front, side and rear yards – **Approve** image and site plan dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Construct 8'x10' pavilion in rear yard – **Approve** drawings dated 03-16-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

17. 603 MUNGER AVE

West End Historic District
CA167-320(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Install two painted signs on center water tank. – **Approve** – Approve drawings dated 3/14/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 that states proposed signs must be consistent with regulations in Division 51A7.1000, Section 51A-7.1005(g) for painted applied signs on Type B facades, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install painted sign on east elevation. **Approve with condition** – Approve drawings dated 3/14/17 with the condition that the copyright “R” may not be included in the signage design, and with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 that states proposed signs must be consistent with regulations in Division 51A7.1000, Section 51A-7.1005(f) for painted applied signs on Type A facades, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install two linear upright light fixtures under proposed east elevation painted sign. **Approve** drawings dated 3/14/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 that states proposed signs must be consistent with regulations in Division 51A7.1000, Section 51A-7.1005(f) for painted applied signs on Type A facades, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

18. 326 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-341(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Install screened-in porch and deck on rear of the main structure. **Approve** plans and specifications dated 3-14-17 with the finding that the proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Install second story on existing accessory structure. **Approve** plans and specifications dated 3-14-17 with the finding that the proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

19. 307 N WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-327(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Replace door on second floor of the accessory structure and paint using Behr PPU1-8 "Pompeian Red." **Approve** image dated 3-13-17 with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

20. 411 S WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-342(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Construct two-story accessory structure in rear yard. **Approve** plans and specifications dated 3-14-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(1) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 5444 GASTON AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA167-326(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Add parking spaces in front of main structure.
2. Replace portion of rear and side yard fence with wood fencing.
3. Install trees and shrubs in front of main structure.

Speakers: For: Jeanine and Fred Bailey
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Add parking spaces in front of main structure – **Deny without prejudice with the finding of fact that parking in the front yard is not compatible with an historic district and it violates the character defining feature of a grassy lawn.**
2. Replace portion of rear and side yard fence with wood fencing – **Approve survey plat and photos dated 3/15/17 with the finding the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).**
3. Install trees and shrubs in front of main structure – **Deny without prejudice – Due to plant material not appropriate to the district and additional consideration must be given to PD 99 requirement with the finding of fact that parking in front yard will have an adverse effect on district and on future preservation efforts. Specifically, a significant Bertram Hill structure will be adversely affected. The proposal is not compatible with Historic Overlay District.**

Maker: Tapscott
Second: *Sherman
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

2. 714 HUNTLEY ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA167-328(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Add second story addition to rear of house.
2. Add 2-in x 4-in porch rails.

Speakers: For: Donnie Mixon
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Add second story addition to rear of house – Approve with conditions – that the 5 foot side yard setback be maintained and not reduced; that the roof plan is accurate showing a roof hip per the applicant’s testimony; and that the upper roof gable incorporate a 1 foot offset to break the gable roof line similar to the front gable of the house
2. Add 2-in x 4-in porch rails – Approve. Suggest 2x4 as top rail; not to go in height above the bottom of windows.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

***Motion was made to reconsider the previous motion made.**

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Flabiano
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion:

1. Add second story addition to rear of house – Approve with conditions – that the 5 foot side yard setback be maintained and not reduced; that the roof plan is accurate showing a roof hip per the applicant’s testimony; and that the upper roof gable incorporate a 1 foot offset to break the gable roof line similar to the front gable of the house
2. Add 2-in x 4-in porch rails – Approve 2x6 as top rail; not to go in height above the bottom of windows.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/1

Ayes: - 13 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, Swann,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 1 *Sherman
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

3. 5728 JUNIUS ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA167-340(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Replace chain link driveway gate at front of left side yard with 8ft wood automatic gate.
2. Extend 8ft wood fence on left side yard to within the front 50%.
3. Extend wood fence on right side yard to within the front 50%.

Speakers: For: Bernard Ford
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace chain link driveway gate at front of left side yard with 8ft wood automatic gate – Approve with conditions – that the wood gate be moved back to within 1 foot of the bathroom window with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.6(a)(2) and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Extend 8ft wood fence on left side yard to within the front 50% – Approve with the condition that the new fence extends to the new gate approved in item #1.
3. Extend wood fence on right side yard to within the front 50% – Approve with the condition that the wood fence be placed within 1 foot of the AC unit with the finding of fact that the applicant has sited security of the window location, daycare center next door and the security of the mechanical units.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Williams
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

4. 5419 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA167-324(MP)
Marsha Prior

Replace wood columns and railing on front porch with square columns, add trim, and paint. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

Replace wood columns and railing on front porch with square columns, add trim, and paint. Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it would have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure with the finding it is inconsistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation No. 3 that states changes that create a false sense of historical development shall not be undertaken.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: McGill
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

5. 524 E 6TH ST

Lake Cliff Historic District
CA167-323(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Expand driveway into front yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Maria Castillo
Against: No one

Motion:

Expand driveway into front yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve with the condition that the applicant either remove 2 feet strip of concrete from driveway to front of house just behind the sidewalk or place a raised plant bed 2 feet from driveway to the front of the house from the back of the sidewalk with the finding of fact that the previous CA from 7 years ago approved by the city did not fully define the extent of concrete work from driveway to front yard.**

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Jordan
Results: 11/3

Ayes: - 11 Birrer, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan,
McGill, Montgomery, Seale, Swann, Tapscott,
Williams
Against: - 3 *Sherman, Bowers, Tate
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

6. 4523 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic
District
CA167-332(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Replace 100% of wood siding on the main structure with Hardie board. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Replace 13 windows on main structure with vinyl 12/12 windows. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Replace front porch rail on main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. Replace porch columns on main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Altin Kore
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace 100% of wood siding on the main structure with Hardie board. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.2 that states the reconstruction, renovation or repair of opaque elements of the

protected facades must employ materials similar to the original materials in texture, color, pattern, grain, and module size as much as practical.

2. Replace 13 windows on main structure with vinyl 12/12 windows. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.10 that states Where replacement of an original door or window is necessary, replacement doors and windows must express mullion size, light configuration, and material to match the original doors and windows.
3. Replace front porch rail on main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.20 that states all original columns, railings, and other trim and detailing that are part of the porch of balcony configuration must be preserved.
4. Replace porch columns on main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.20 that states all original columns, railings, and other trim and detailing that are part of the porch of balcony configuration must be preserved.

Maker: Williams
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

7. 215 S CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-343(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Remove door and sidelights on south side of the main structure and install 117 siding to match existing siding. Work completed by previous owner without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Rob Puckett, Blake Aaron
Against: No one

Motion:

Remove door and sidelights on south side of the main structure and install 117 siding to match existing siding. Work completed by previous owner without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve with the finding of fact that the board expense identify the addition and previous opening.**

Maker: Jordan
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/1

Ayes: - 13 Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan,
McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Swann,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 1 Birrer
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

8. 336 S EDGEFIELD AVE (Moved to Consent)

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-345(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Replace 7 wood windows with wood windows to match existing. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – **Approve with Conditions** – Approve specifications dated 3-14-17 with the condition that the sizes of the window openings are not changed or resized with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace south side door. **Approve** specifications and elevation drawing dated 3-14-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install lighting on front porch. **Approve** specifications dated 3-14-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(4) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

9. 200 N WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-344(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Remove door on south side of main structure and replace with either siding to match existing or leaded glass window to match existing windows.

Speakers: For: Jeff Blackwell
Against: No one

Motion:

Remove door on south side of main structure and replace with either siding to match existing or leaded glass window to match existing windows. **Approve with the condition that no window unit be installed and siding to be laced into existing with finding of fact that the applicant did demonstrate that the opening is not original.**

Maker: Tapscott
Second: *Sherman
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

10. Z167-130(LC)

1201 Main Street
One Main Place
Liz Casso

Hearing to consider an application for an historic overlay for 1201 Main Street, One Main Place, on the northeast side of Main Street and Griffin Street.

Speakers: For: Jay Firsching
Against: No one

Motion:

Hearing to consider an application for an historic overlay for 1201 Main Street, One Main Place, on the northeast side of Main Street and Griffin Street. **Approval, subject to preservation criteria.**

Maker: *Sherman
Second: McGill
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Birrer, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano,
Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Swann, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 1 Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at 4:15 P.M.

Katherine Seale, Chair

Date