

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on June 6, 2016 with a briefing at 10:38 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:02 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

\* Alternates

Michael Amonett Mike Birrer \*Sam Childers Mattia Flabiano Dustin Gadberry John Johnson Cris Jordan Joel Maten \*Evelyn Montgomery Katherine Seale, Chair
\*Diane Sherman
Daron Tapscott
Emily Williams
Sean Tate

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: Paul Ridley

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: No one

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: Clint Bowers and Amie Parsons

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: Clint Bowers and Amie Parsons

The following Position is vacant: District 4 and District 10

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean Mark Doty Jennifer Anderson Marsha Prior Eric Hill

Laura Morrison Trena Law Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

# **Briefings:**

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made approve Consent Items C1 through C14 following staff recommendation.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Tapscott

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

Motion was made approve Consent Item 15 following staff recommendation with the condition that the first 25 feet will be ribbon driveway.

Maker: Birrer

Second: Tapscott

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take D1, D2, D4 through D9, D11, D12, D15 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda.

Maker: Birrer

Second: Tapscott

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

# **CONSENT ITEMS:**

### 1. 5115 Victor St

Munger Place CE156-020(PT)

Pam Thompson

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on the added value of the land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$124,378 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval. Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility and approval of \$124,378 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Eligibility.

### 2. 300 N AKARD ST

Fidelity Union Life Complex

CA156-514(MD)

Mark Doty

Install illuminated signage on rooftop penthouse facade. Approve drawings dated 5/19/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for signs in the preservation criteria Sections 11.1 and 11.2, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# 3. 611 N GLASGOW DR

Junius Heights Historic District

CD156-013(MP)

Marsha Prior

Demolish main structure using the standard 'noncontributing structure because newer than period of significance.' Work completed without a Certificate for Demolition. Approve - The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structure is noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structure is newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay district; and demolition of the structure will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

#### **4. 5701 TREMONT ST**

Junius Heights Historic District CA156-521(MP)

Marsha Prior

Expand and add new landscaping beds in front and side yards, using flowering plants, native grasses, and adding rock border. Approve landscape plan dated 05/13/2016 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the proposed landscaping is compatible with the historic overlay district.

#### 5. 5506 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA156-528(MP)

Marsha Prior

Construct detached 2-car garage with wood siding. Approve plans and specifications dated 05/13/2016 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 9.2, 9.4, 9.5, and 9.6 for accessory structures and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

### 6. 5801 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA156-519(MP)

Marsha Prior

Install roof ladder with cage on interior courtyard elevation of main structure. Approve with conditions - Approve plans dated 05/13/2016 with the condition that the ladder is anchored as necessary for safety purposes, but with as little damage as possible to existing brick with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

### **7. 2626 PARK ROW AVE**

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District

CA156-527(MP)

Marsha Prior

- 1. Replace two metal framed windows with double hung wood windows on detached garage. Approve specifications dated 05/13/2016 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Replace rotted entry door on detached garage with wood paneled single lite door. Approve specifications dated 05/13/2016 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 3. Replace deteriorated garage door with steel-surfaced two lite, paneled garage door. Approve specifications dated 05/13/2016 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

## **8. 2707 HIBERNIA ST**

State Thomas Historic District

CA156-506(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

- 1. Install concrete driveway in rear of the main structure. Approve site plan dated 5-16-16 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-225.109(b)(8) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install 6' wood automatic gate in rear of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve site plan and photograph dated 5-16-16 with the finding that the

completed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-225.109(b)(2) meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### 9. 5643 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA156-503(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Install 4'10" metal electric gate. Approve site plan and specifications dated 5-16-16 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(2)(B) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### 10. 308 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA156-497(MD)

Mark Doty

- 1. Construct 9'-0" wood, board on board fence in interior and rear side yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with the finding of fact the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Install 8'-0" wood rolling gate along rear property line. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with the finding of fact the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(q)(6)(C)(ii).

### 11. 302 S ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-500(MD)

Mark Doty

Paint main and accessory structures. Brand - Behr. Body - PPU18-3 'Antique Tin'. Trim - PPU18-14 'Cathedral Gray'. Accent - PPU3-02 'Marmalade Glaze'. Approve paint specifications dated 5/19/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# **12. 214 N WILLOMET AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-499(MD)

Mark Doty

Construct rear addition. Approve drawings dated 5/19/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for additions in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(2), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# **13. 411 S WILLOMET AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA156-515(MD)

Mark Doty

- 1. Install Craftsman style door in existing front door opening. Approve door specification dated 5/18/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for windows and doors in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(A) and (F), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Paint main and accessory structure. Brand Sherwin Williams. Body SW 6119 'Antique White'. Trim SW 2841 'Roycroft Suede'. Accent SW 2803 'Rookwood Terra Cotta'. Approve paint specifications dated 5/18/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for

color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# 14. 315 S WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA156-517(MD)
Mark Doty

Remove existing two concrete steps and install three concrete steps at front porch. Approve with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for front entrances and porches in Section 51P-87.111(a)(11)(E), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# 15. 410 N WINNETKA AVE (voted on separately)

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA156-498(MD) Mark Doty Construct 10'-0" x 84'-0" concrete driveway in side yard.

### Motion:

Construct 10'-0" x 84'-0" concrete driveway in side yard. Approve site plan dated 5/19/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) with the condition that the first 25 feet be ribbon driveway.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

### **DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

### 1. 1907 ELM ST

Harwood Historic District, Majestic Theatre CA156-525(MD)

Mark Doty

- 1. Install new storefront systems.
- 2. Install canopy and awnings along Elm Street.
- 3. Construct addition on north side of structure.
- Install exterior lighting.

Speakers: For: Patrick Hazard
Against: No one

<sup>\*</sup>Commissioner Johnson was excused and left the meeting.

### Motion:

- 1. Install new storefront systems. Approve drawings and storefront specifications dated 5/18/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install canopy and awnings along Elm Street. Deny without prejudice The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district. Also, the proposed work violates Secretary of the Interior Standard #3 with the finding of fact the applicant needs to provide more detail on the canopies attachment to historic building and more details on awning attachment to building.
- 3. Construct addition on north side of structure. Approve drawings dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for new construction and additions to existing structures in Tract A in Section 4.5, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 4. Install exterior lighting. Approve drawings and lighting specifications dated 5/18/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Flabiano Second: Amonett Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 3 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

## 2. 1900 PACIFIC AVE

Harwood Historic District CA156-524(MD)

Mark Doty

- 1. Construct vehicular entry and storefront entry on north facade.
- 2. Modify granite veneer panels for storefront access on north facade.
- 3. Create window openings on floors 4, 5, and 6 on east facade.
- 4. Construct rooftop additions and modify existing penthouse.
- 5. Install exterior lighting.
- 6. Construct new addition.

Speakers: For: Patrick Hazard
Against: No one

## Motion:

- 1. Construct vehicular entry and storefront entry on north facade. Approve drawings dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Modify granite veneer panels for storefront access on north facade. Approve drawings dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(q)(6)(C)(ii).

- 3. Create window openings on floors 4, 5, and 6 on east facade. Approve drawings dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 4. Construct rooftop additions and modify existing penthouse. Approve drawings dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 5. Install exterior lighting. Approve drawings and specifications dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 6. Construct new addition. Approve Approve drawings dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: \*Sherman Second: Tapscott Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 3 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

#### 3. 611 N GLASGOW DR

Junius Heights Historic District CA156-523(MP) Marsha Prior

1. Construct two-story, wood residential structure.

- 2. Install wood fence with sliding gate on west, east, and rear yards, and stain using Brand: Olympic. 'Maximum Cedar Naturaltone.'
- 3. Remove all existing concrete, construct concrete driveway on west side, construct concrete walkway on front (north) side, and fill in curb cut on north side of property. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one Against: No one

#### Motion:

- 1. Construct two-story, wood residential structure. Approve with conditions Approve plans and specifications dated 05/13/2016 with the condition that the front elevation include sidelights on each side of the front door and wood dentil moulding on the 1x4 wood trim on the second story. The proposed conditions make the structure more harmonious with the Craftsman style as required for new construction in Section 8.3(d). Because the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria for new construction, it is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Install wood fence with sliding gate on west, east, and rear yards, and stain using Brand: Olympic. 'Maximum Cedar Naturaltone.' Approve site plan and specifications dated 05/13/2016 with the finding the proposed fence is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

3. Remove all existing concrete, construct concrete driveway on west side, construct concrete walkway on front (north) side, and fill in curb cut on north side of property. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve site plan dated 05/13/2016 with the finding the proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Flabiano Second: Williams Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 3 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

### 4. 719 GLENDALE ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA156-522(MP) Marsha Prior

1. Construct stone retaining wall. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- Install cedar wood fence on side yard up to sidewalk and stain, using Brand: Standard Paints Redwood. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 3. Install wood driveway gate at front of house.

Speakers: For: Trent Mays Against: No one

### **Motion:**

- 1. Construct stone retaining wall. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions that the retaining wall directly adjacent to driveway be allowed as installed, and the retaining wall to the left of the sidewalk as you face the house be removed and the rolled grass lawn be restored. The removal of the left side retaining wall is required due to the fact that the rolled lawn is a defining feature of the district and that the retaining wall would have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.
- 2. Install cedar wood fence on side yard up to sidewalk and stain, using Brand: Standard Paints Redwood. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with conditions that the two panels or to the third post of the fence be removed to maintain sight lines to the front yard with the finding of fact that specific conditions exist due to the multi-family property next door.
- Install wood driveway gate at front of house. Approve solid wood gate at least 5 feet from the front of the house due to the multi-family property next door

Maker: Flabiano Second: Tapscott Results: 11/2

Ayes: - 11 Amonett, Birrer, Flabiano, Jordan, Maten,

# Landmark Commission Minutes Monday, June 6, 2016

\*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 2 \*Childers, Gadberry

Absent: - 3 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

#### 5. 5415 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA156-520(MP) Marsha Prior

Replace two windows on northeast side elevation with double hung wood windows of same style.

Speakers: For: James Quigley

Against: No one

#### Motion:

Replace two windows on northeast side elevation with double hung wood windows of same style. Approve with conditions that the specifications of the Leeds Clark letter dated June 2016 be followed.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Gadberry
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 3 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

### **6. 4929 REIGER AVE**

Munger Place Historic District CA156-512(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

- 1. Replace 26 aluminum windows on main structure with new vinyl double-hung windows. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Replace shutters on main structure.
- 3. Replace lighting.
- 4. Install 6' metal fence.
- 5. Install two 6' metal gates.

Speakers: For: Stacey Davis

Against: John Gormley, Christopher Hart

#### Motion:

1. Replace 26 aluminum windows on main structure with new vinyl double-hung windows. Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve specifications dated 5-16-16

- with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Replace shutters on main structure. Deny without prejudice The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because it is not compatible with the historic overlay district since hurricane style shutters are not common in Munger Place.
- 3. Replace lighting. Deny without prejudice the fixture proposed is not compatible to the district.
- 4. Install 6' metal fence. Approve with conditions that it comply with submittal of 6-6-2016.
- 5. Install two 6' metal gates. Approve with conditions that it comply with submittal of 6-6-2016 and be flat top with a minimum of 50% open area.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Williams
Results: 12/1

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, Tapscott,

Tate, Williams

Against: - 1 \*Sherman

Absent: - 3 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

### **7. 4946 VICTOR ST**

Munger Place Historic District CA156-505(JKA) Jennifer Anderson

1. Install landscaping.

Install 8' board-on-board cedar fence.

Speakers: For: Craig Scruggs
Against: No one

#### Motion:

- 1. Install landscaping. Approve with conditions Approve site plan dated 5-16-16 with the condition that no crushed granite is installed. The proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Install 8' board-on-board cedar fence. Approve with condition that on the east side of the house the fence and return be constructed in the rear 50% of the east façade. On the west side of the house approve 8 foot wood fence up to the front façade, and 4 foot wood fence up to the multi-family existing fence with the finding of fact that the existing conditions make the proposed work compatible with the historic district. If applicant wants to continue 8 foot wood fence to neighbor's fence, they would need board of adjustment approval and then resubmit to Landmark Commission.

Maker: Flabiano Second: Tapscott Results: 14/0

<sup>\*</sup>Commissioner Johnson returned to the meeting.

# Landmark Commission Minutes Monday, June 6, 2016

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

# 8. 549 E JEFFERSON BLVD

Oak Cliff United Methodist Church CA156-513(MD) Mark Doty

Remove stained glass window on rear facade and install colored plate glass in opening.

Speakers: For: Carla Boss, Butch Boss

Against: No one

## Motion:

Remove stained glass window on rear facade and install colored plate glass in opening. Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fenestration and openings in the preservation criteria Section 5.1, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Jordan
Second: Amonett
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

### 9. 4720 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic

District

CA156-510(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Remove metal finials and cresting from roof of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Wade Lair

Against: No one

#### Motion:

Remove metal finials and cresting from roof of the main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with the finding of fact that the applicant has documented that they were not original to the structure.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Birrer
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

### **10. 4722 GASTON AVE**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA156-531(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

- 1. Replace door on front facade of main structure.
- 2. Install metal roof on front porch of main structure.
- 3. Remove door on west side of the main structure.
- 4. Install patio above porte cochere on west side of the main structure.
- 5. Install metal supports on west side of main structure.
- 6. Replace two windows on east facade of main structure.
- 7. Replace three windows in rear of the main structure.
- 8. Install metal stairs in rear of the main structure.

Speakers: For: No one Against: No one

## Motion:

- 1. Replace door on front facade of main structure. Approve plans and specifications dated 5-23-16 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install metal roof on front porch of main structure. Deny without prejudice The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.17 since staff does not believe that a standing seam porch roof is an appropriate roofing material for the structure.
- 3. Remove door on west side of the main structure. Approve plans and specifications dated 5-23-16 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 4. Install patio above porte cochere on west side of the main structure. Approve plans and specifications dated 5-23-16 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1 and 4.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 5. Install metal supports on west side of main structure. Approve plans and specifications dated 5-23-16 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 6. Replace two windows on east facade of main structure. Deny without prejudice The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did

- not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since specifications for the windows were not submitted. Not enough information was provided.
- 7. Replace three windows in rear of the main structure. Deny without prejudice The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since specifications for the windows were not submitted. Not enough information was provided.
- 8. Install metal stairs in rear of the main structure. Approve site plans and specifications dated 5-16-16 with the finding that the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) since it will not have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure, the historic overlay district, or to the future preservation, maintenance and use of the structure or historic overlay district.

Maker: \*Sherman Second: Tapscott Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan,

Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

#### 11. 4819 SWISS AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Historic District CA156-529(JKA) Jennifer Anderson

Replace front doors on main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Barbara Paige, Shirley Campbell

Against: No one

#### Motion:

Replace front doors on main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve.

Maker: \*Montgomery

Second: Tapscott
Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

#### 12.4837 SWISS AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA156-507(JKA) Jennifer Anderson

Install door on front of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Michael Ledowsky

Against: No one

#### Motion:

Install door on front of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve photograph dated 5-16-16 with the finding that the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(c)(ii) with the finding of fact that the applicant has proven security issues which have been documented and that the proposed work is an ornamental iron door.

Maker: Flabiano Second: Johnson Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

## **13.4632 SYCAMORE ST**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA156-504(JKA) Jennifer Anderson Install 8' board-on-board fence.

Speakers: For: No one Against: No one

# **Motion:**

Install 8' board-on-board fence. Deny without prejudice - The proposed fence does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11 stating that interior side yard fences that face the street must be at least 70% open.

Maker: Birrer Second: Maten Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan,

# Landmark Commission Minutes Monday, June 6, 2016

Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

#### **14. 131 N CLINTON AVE**

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA156-501(MD) Mark Doty

Construct retaining wall in front yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one Against: No one

#### Motion:

Construct retaining wall in front yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deny - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that states retaining walls are not permitted in the front and side yards, except to preserve a natural or existing slope and must be constructed of unpainted natural stone, brick, stone, or smooth-finished concrete that is compatible in texture, color, and style with the main building. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(b)(8).

Maker: Williams Second: Jordan Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan,

Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

#### 15. 127 N WILLOMET AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-502(MD)

Mark Doty

- 1. Remove window on front facade and install smaller window. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Install three ganged windows on north facade smaller than approved by Landmark Commission.
- 3. Remove concrete sidewalk in front yard and install brick paver walkway.
- 4. Install landscaping beds in front yard.
- 5. Add accent color to existing approved color scheme. Brand 7008 'Alabaster'.
- 6. Install wood railings on front porch. Paint SW 7008 'Alabaster'.

Speakers: For: Chris Chiles
Against: No one

#### Motion:

- Remove window on front facade and install smaller window. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve – Not detrimental to the overall district.
- 2. Install three ganged windows on north facade smaller than approved by Landmark Commission. Approve – Not detrimental to the overall district.
- 3. Remove concrete sidewalk in front yard and install brick paver walkway. Approve site plan dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for sidewalks, driveways, and curbing in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(iii), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 4. Install landscaping beds in front yard. Approve site plan dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for landscaping in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(1), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 5. Add accent color to existing approved color scheme. Brand 7008 Alabaster'. Approve paint specification dated 5/18/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 6. Install wood railings on front porch. Paint SW 7008 'Alabaster'. Approve drawings dated 5/18/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for front entrances and porches in Section 51P-87.111(a)(11)(A), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Tapscott Second: Johnson

Results: 8/6

Ayes: - 8 Amonett, Birrer, Flabiano, Johnson, Jordan,

Maten, Tapscott, Williams

Against: - 6 \*Sherman, \*Childers, Gadberry, Seale,

\*Montgomery, Tate

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

# Motion was made to take Discussion Item 17 next on the agenda.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Tapscott

Results: 14/0

Ayes: - 14 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Johnson, Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale,

\*Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Bowers, Parsons

# 16. 228 S WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA156-516(MD) Mark Doty

Install concrete cheek walls and concrete steps in location of existing front porch steps.

Speakers: For: No one Against: No one

#### Motion:

Install concrete cheek walls and concrete steps in location of existing front porch steps. Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that state front porch or entry treatment must be typical of the style and period of the building. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(a)(11)(E). The proposed work also violates Secretary of the Interior Standard #3.

Maker: \*Sherman Second: Jordan Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan,

Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott. Tate. Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

### 17. 206 S WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA156-526(MD)
Mark Doty

- 1. Replace four windows on front facade. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Paint main structure. Brand Sherwin Williams. Body SW 1452 'Jagged Granite' or SW 1442 'Raven Wing'.
- 3. Replace wood skirting with three laps of textured Hardi board.

Speakers: For: Ryan Baker Against: No one

# \*Commissioner Johnson was excused and left the meeting.

# Motion:

1. Replace four windows on front facade. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

- 2. Paint main structure. Brand Sherwin Williams. Body SW 1452 'Jagged Granite' or SW 1442 'Raven Wing'. Approve paint specifications dated 5/18/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 3. Replace wood skirting with three laps of textured Hardi board. Approve with the condition that the hardi board is smooth and can go up to three laps only for skirting with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii)

Maker: Flabiano Second: Tapscott Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 Amonett, Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,

Jordan, Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 3 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

# \*Commissioner Amonett was excused and left the meeting.

#### 18. 10 Nonesuch Road

Stanley Marcus House CE156-019(PT) Pam Thompson

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption under the Citywide Endangered Properties category on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$187,129 in eligible expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the application for CE approval.

Speakers: For: Mark Lovvorn
Against: No one

### Motion:

Approval of the Certificate of Eligibility for a tax exemption on the added value of the land and improvements under the Citywide Rehabilitation category and approval of \$187,129 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation prior to the application for the Certificate of Eligibility.

Maker: Birrer
Second: Tapscott
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, \*Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan,

Maten, \*Montgomery, Seale, \*Sherman,

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett

Approval o	of Minutes from	n June 6, 2016.		
Maker:	Flabiano			
Second:	Tapscott			
Results:	12/0			
		Ayes:	- 12	Birrer, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan, Maten, *Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
		Against: Absent: Vacancies:	- 0 - 4 - 2	Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett 4 and 10
ADJOURN	<u>IMENT</u>			
Motion was	s made to adjo	ourn at <b>4:58 P.M</b>	l <b>.</b>	
Katherine Seale, Chair				Date