

July 5, 2016



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on July 5, 2016 with a briefing at 11:04 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:06 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Michael Amonett
Clint Bowers
*Sam Childers
Mattia Flabiano

Dustin Gadberry
John Johnson
Cris Jordan
*Evelyn Montgomery

*Diane Sherman
Daron Tapscott
Emily Williams
Sean Tate

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **No one**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **No one**

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **Mike Birrer, Joel Maten
Amie Parsons, Katherine Seale, Chair**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing: **Mike Birrer, Joel Maten
Amie Parsons, Katherine Seale, Chair**

The following Position is vacant: District 4 and District 10

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty

Jennifer Anderson
Marsha Prior
Eric Hill

Laura Morrison
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to move Consent Items C11, C12, C14 and C17 to the discussion agenda.

Maker: Tate
Second: Amonett
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C1, C3, C4, C5, C8, C9, C10, C15, and C16 following staff recommendation.

Maker: Tate
Second: Tapscott
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C2, C6 and C7 following staff recommendation with the amendments listed.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Jordan
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C13 following staff recommendation with the amendment listed.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Gadberry
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take C11, C12, C14, C17, CR1, D1, D2, D4, D6, D7, D8, D10 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda.

Maker: Tate
Second: Tapscott
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

CONSENT ITEMS:

1. 726 PARKMONT ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-593(MP)
Marsha Prior

Repair and replace left side fence with 9ft cedar board fence, and stain using, Brand: Behr. ST-112 'Barn Red.' Approve with conditions - Approve survey plat dated 6/2/2016 with the condition that the 4-foot high left side fence that extends beyond the front of the house is not repaired or replaced with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.6(a)(2) which states that Landmark Commission may allow a fence up to five feet behind the porch if additional screening is required and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. 630 BLAYLOCK DR (Voted On Separately)

Lake Cliff Historic District
CA156-569(MD)
Mark Doty

1. Install 8'-0" wood fence in interior side yard. Approve site plan and image dated 6/15/16 with the finding that although the proposed work does not comply with Section 3.11(b) that states fences in the front 50% of the interior side yard facing the street must be 70% open, it meets the criteria for landmark commission approval of work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the proposed work is historically accurate, it is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district, and the proposed work meets the criteria for building site and landscaping in the Preservation criteria Sections 3.12, 3.13, 3.14, and 3.15, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i). **The fence is to be 1 foot off corner of the house.**
2. Install 8'-0" wood fence in cornerside yard. Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with the condition that the fence is to be 1 foot off corner of the house, and with the finding the proposed work meets the criteria for building site and landscaping in the Preservation criteria Section 3.11(b) 3.12, 3.13, 3.14, and 3.15, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install landscaping in front yard. Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the criteria for building site and landscaping in the Preservation criteria Section 3.7, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. 300 E COLORADO BLVD

Lake Cliff Historic District
CA156-568(MD)
Mark Doty

Install Texas Historical Commission subject marker at Lake Cliff park pavilion. Approve site plan and images dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4. 5000 WORTH ST

Munger Place Historic District
CA156-579(EH)
Eric Hill

Remove tree from front yard of main structure. Approve proposed work with the finding that it meets the standards in City Code Section 51-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) since it will not have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure, the historic overlay district, or to the future preservation, maintenance and use of the structure or historic overlay district.

5. 4311 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-581(EH)
Eric Hill

Install composition shingles on roof of main structure Brand: Timberline. Color: "Pewter Grey." Approve specifications dated 6-13-16 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria 3.17 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. 4719 JUNIUS ST (Voted On Separately)

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA156-580(EH)
Eric Hill

Install 36" railings on front facade of main structure. Work partially completed without CA. Approve with Conditions - Approve specifications dated 6-13-16 with condition that the replacement railing is installed in the same locations as the existing railing **and handrail is limited to 26 inches tall**. The partially completed work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

7. 2431 PARK ROW AVE (Voted On Separately)

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District
CA156-597(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Replace or repair 34 wood, one-over-one single hung or fixed windows. Approve with conditions - Approve drawings, window survey, and specifications dated 6/10/2016 with the condition that **windows are to be repaired** with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3(b)(5)(A) and 3(b)(5)(B) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Add second story addition to rear of house. Approve with conditions - Approve drawings dated 6/10/2016 with the condition that Hardie board is not used for any part of the new construction with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3(b)(6)(A) and 3(b)(6)(B) for material and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Replace three existing voids on right-hand side of rear elevation with three windows and one door, and install shed roof and steps. Approve with conditions - Approve drawings dated 6/10/2016 with condition that door is wood with single panel or single light as indicated on drawing, that windows match windows on main structure in material, size, and style, and that the existing brick column is maintained with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3(b)(6)(A) for material and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install Craftsman style door on front elevation. Approve photo dated 6/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5. Install sconce lights on either side of front door. Approve photo dated 6/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

8. 1801 N LAMAR ST

West End Historic District

CA156-586(MD)

Mark Doty

Install 5'-0" metal fence and gates on rear elevation. Approve drawings dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

9. 341 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-573(MD)

Mark Doty

Install 10' wide, solid concrete driveway. Approve with conditions - Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with condition that the existing ribbon driveway is maintained from the street to the existing gate with the finding the is consistent with the criteria for sidewalks, driveways, and curbing in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(iii), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

10. 301 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-575(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Paint main and accessory structure. Brand - Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 2250 'Fjord'. Trim - SW 6385 'Dover White'. Approve paint specifications dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Rebuild existing stone retaining walls and construct new stone retaining wall along Wentworth Street. Approve - Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for retaining walls in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(8), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 408 N ROSEMONT AVE (Moved to Discussion)

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-587(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Remove box window on front facade and install 36" x 80" multi-light casement window.
2. Install new front door in existing door opening.
3. Paint main structure. Behr. Body - BXC-28 'Bucolic Blue'. Trim - BXC-29 'Stately White'. Accent - N470 'Whale Gray'.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Remove box window on front facade and install 36" x 80" multi-light casement window. Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for windows and doors in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(ii) and (iii), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. Install new front door in existing door opening. Approve with the condition that the existing door be repaired.
3. Paint main structure. Behr. Body - BXC-28 'Bucolic Blue'. Trim - BXC-29 'Stately White'. Accent - N470 'Whale Gray'. Approve paint specifications dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Tapscott
Second: *Sherman
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

12. 406 S WILLOMET AVE (Moved to Discussion)

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-572(MD)
Mark Doty

1. Install two Craftsman style doors in existing door openings on front facade. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Paint concrete front steps. Brand - Sherwin Williams. SW 0050 'Classic Light Buff'. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install two Craftsman style doors in existing door openings on front facade. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve** with the finding the completed work is consistent with the criteria for windows and doors in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(A) and (F), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Paint concrete front steps. Brand - Sherwin Williams. SW 0050 'Classic Light Buff'. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice** with the finding of fact that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the structure.

Maker: Amonett
Second: Tate
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

13. 218 S WINDOMERE AVE (Voted on Separately)

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-596(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Paint main structure. Brand - Sherwin Williams - Body - SW 7669 'Summit Gray'. Trim - SW 7006 'Extra White'. Approve paint specifications dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for color in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install composition shingle roof. Color - Sierra Gray. Approve shingle specification dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for roof colors in the preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(8)(E) and 51P-87.111(a)(14)(B), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Construct accessory structure in rear yard. Approve drawings and specifications dated 6/15/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory buildings in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(1), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
4. **Install 8'-0" wood fence in interior side yard.** Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with the condition that eight foot tall vertical boards be used and with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fences in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(A),(B),(C)(ii) and (D), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install concrete driveway. Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for sidewalks, driveways, and curbing in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(iii), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

14. 201 N WINNETKA AVE (Moved to Discussion)

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-571(MD)

Mark Doty

Construct second story addition on existing accessory structure.

Speakers: For: Richard Fitzgerald

Against: No one

Motion:

Construct second story addition on existing accessory structure. **Approve** drawings and specifications dated 6/15/16 with the finding of fact the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory buildings in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(1), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Amonett

Second: Johnson

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
8

Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

15. 206 S WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-588(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Install Craftsman style door in existing front door opening. Approve image dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
2. Install 6'-0" wood fence and gate in interior side yard. Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
3. Remove existing ribbon driveway and install crushed rock with brick border driveway. Approve with conditions – Approve site plan dated 6/15/16 with condition that the existing ribbon driveway is maintained from the street to the proposed new gate with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

16. 206 S WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CD156-014(MD)

Mark Doty

Demolish accessory structure using standard 'imminent threat to public health and safety'. Approve - The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(C). The structure constitutes a documented major and imminent threat to public health and safety; the demolition or removal is required to alleviate the threat to public health and safety; and there is no reasonable way, other than demolition or removal, to eliminate the threat in a timely manner.

17. 318 N WINNETKA AVE (Moved to Discussion)

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-574(MD)

Mark Doty

Construct 6'-0" wood fence in interior side yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Eric Ko
Against: No one

Motion:

Construct 6'-0" wood fence in interior side yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve** with the finding of fact the completed work is consistent with the criteria for fences in the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(A),(B),(C)(ii) and (D), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Tapscott

Second: Williams

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
9

Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

COURTESY REVIEW ITEMS:

1. 509 MAIN ST 1st FL

CR156-007(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Courtesy Review - Dallas County Records Building Complex - Modify entrances at first floor of Records Building and Annex. Approve conceptually with the condition that final plans, elevations, and details are submitted for final Landmark Commission review.
2. Courtesy Review - Dallas County Records Building Complex - Remove exterior penthouses. Approve conceptually with the condition that final plans, elevations, and details are submitted for final Landmark Commission review.
3. Courtesy Review - Infill construction between Criminal Courts Building, Records Building and Annex. Approve conceptually with the condition that final plans, elevations, and details are submitted for final Landmark Commission review.
4. Courtesy Review - Dallas County Records Building Complex - Construct rooftop addition to Records Building. Approve conceptually with the condition that final plans, elevations, and details are submitted for final Landmark Commission review.

Speakers: For: Jonathon Bazan, Marcel Quimby, Robert Croysdale, Fernando Andrade,
Against: No one

***There was no formal motion made.**

***Commissioner Gadberry was excused and left the meeting.**

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 3601 MARTIN LUTHER KING BLVD

Fair Park Historic District

CA156-577(MD)

Mark Doty

Texas Discovery Gardens - Install fence and gate along Second Avenue.

Speakers: For: Sara Gardner
Against: No one

Motion:

Texas Discovery Gardens - Install fence and gate along Second Avenue. **Approve** drawings dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fencing in the preservation criteria Sections 3.11(b) and (h), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: *Sherman
Second: Johnson
Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Johnson,
Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman, Tapscott,
Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Birrer, Gadberry, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

2. 5832 REIGER AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA156-594(MP)
Marsha Prior

Replace front door and transom lights with Craftsman style wood door and transom lights, and paint, using Brand: Benjamin Moore. HC-8 'Dorset Gold.'

Speakers: For: Thomas Bruner
Against: No one

Motion:

Replace front door and transom lights with Craftsman style wood door and transom lights, and paint, using Brand: Benjamin Moore. HC-8 'Dorset Gold.' **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the criteria in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the Craftsman style door and transom lights are not appropriate for a Neoclassical style house, and thus, is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.2 which states that non-original doors be replaced with appropriate doors and windows.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Jordan
Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Johnson,
Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman, Tapscott,
Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 5 Birrer, Gadberry, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

3. 4720 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic

District

CA156-591(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Install wood 1:1 windows #13, 15, 16, 21, 22, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28.
2. Install cement skirting on main structure.
3. Replace door in rear of main structure.
4. Install two doors in rear of main structure.
5. Replace wood shake shingles on main structure.
6. Install wood railing on front porch of main structure.
7. Relocate three windows on side of main structure.
8. Install wood door on accessory structure.
9. Install wood 1:1 windows on accessory structure.
10. Install porch in rear of main structure.
11. Install stamped concrete patio and wood pergola in rear of main structure.
12. Install 7' cedar board-on-board fence.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install wood 1:1 windows #13, 15, 16, 21, 22, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28. **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans and specifications dated 6-13-16 with the conditions that all windows are 1/1, that all windows fit into the historic opening with no wood infill, and that the four windows on the second floor of the front facade are ganged per the photograph dated 6-13-16.
2. Install cement skirting on main structure. **Approve with conditions that the skirting will be limited to the bottom two rows of approximately 6 inch lap** - The proposed work does not comply with Section 3.6, but it meets the criteria for landmark commission approval of work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the proposed work is historically accurate, it is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.
3. Replace door in rear of main structure. **Approve** specifications dated 6-13-16 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install two doors in rear of main structure. **Approve** - The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Replace wood shake shingles on main structure. Approve with conditions that shakes not shingles only where presently installed and match existing location and patterns.
6. Install wood railing on front porch of main structure **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the requirements in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since a dimensioned, scaled elevation drawing showing the final design was not submitted **and with the finding of fact that it does not meet the current building codes.**
7. Relocate three windows on side of main structure. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the requirements in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10 stating that original windows and their openings must remain intact and be preserved.

8. Install wood door on accessory structure. **Approve** specifications dated 6-13-16 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 6.2 and meets the requirements in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
9. Install wood 1:1 windows on accessory structure. **Approve with conditions** - Approve proposed work with the condition that the installed window size matches the elevation drawings approved by Landmark Commission in CA156-120(JKA). The work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 6.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
10. Install porch in rear of main structure. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the requirements in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since specifications for the materials and a dimensioned, scaled site plan was not submitted. Not enough information was provided.
11. Install stamped concrete patio and wood pergola in rear of main structure. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the requirements in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since a dimensioned and scaled site plan was not submitted. Not enough information was provided.
12. Install 7' cedar board-on-board fence. **Approve with the condition that the front facing fence remains 70% open, and is either wood, picket, or iron.**

Maker: Gadberry

Second: *Montgomery

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

4. 912 MORELAND AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic

District

CA156-583(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Install wood enclosure on southeast side of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Install water heater on northwest side of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Molly O'Brien

Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install wood enclosure on southeast side of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice** - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) since it will have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure and violates the Secretary of Interior Standards stating that changes that create a

false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

2. Install water heater on northwest side of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve.**

Maker: Tapscott

Second: Bowers

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

5. 4525 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic

District

CA156-584(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Install porch railings and columns and stain. Brand: Thompsons Water Seal. Work Completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Replace window trim stained. Brand: Thompsons Water Seal. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Install composition shingles. Brand: Owens Corning.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install porch railings and columns and stain. Brand: Thompsons Water Seal. Work Completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because it is not compatible with the historic overlay district since the style of railing is not typical of the district and because all railings in the district are painted and not stained.
2. Replace window trim stained. Brand: Thompsons Water Seal. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because it is not compatible with the historic overlay district since all window trim in the district is painted and not stained.
3. Install composition shingles. Brand: Owens Corning. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the applicant did not meet the burden of proof required to justify the work since specifications were not submitted for the shingles. Not enough information provided.

Maker: *Sherman

Second: Johnson

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

6. 1208 E 10TH ST

Tenth Street Historic District

CA156-595(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Repair or replace wood siding and skirting on north, east, and west elevations up to rear addition.
2. Repair and restore front porch with wood columns, railing, overhead light, and mail slot.
3. Install steel paneled door and wood screen door on front elevation.
4. Repair wood single hung windows (W1, W2, W3, W4, W8, W9) and replace aluminum windows (W6 and W7) with smaller wood, double hung windows.
5. Remove window (W5) at rear of right side elevation.
6. Remove wood siding on rear addition and re clad with Hardie board.
7. Construct landing and stair on rear addition.
8. Install steel paneled door and wood screen door on rear elevation.
9. Remove shed roof on rear addition and replace with gabled roof.
10. Replace roof with Owens Corning shingles in 'Estate Gray.'
11. Install 6ft high wood fence in rear and side yards with 3ft 6in high swinging wood gate in side yard with driveway.
12. Install landscaping in front and left side yard.
13. Construct new walkway in front and new driveway on right side.
14. Install pad for condenser in rear left side yard.

Speakers: For: Elizabeth MacWillie

Against: No one

Motion:

1. Repair or replace wood siding and skirting on north, east, and west elevations up to rear addition. **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans dated 6/10/2016 with condition that salvaged wood or new wood is an exact match in profile and dimension and that the drip edge is maintained with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.6 for wood siding and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Repair and restore front porch with wood columns, railing, overhead light, and mail slot. **Approve** plans and specifications dated 6/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.21 for preserving porches and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install steel paneled door and wood screen door on front elevation. **Approve** plans dated 06/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11 for doors and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Repair wood single hung windows (W1, W2, W3, W4, W8, W9) and replace aluminum windows (W6 and W7) with smaller wood, double hung windows. **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans, window survey, and specifications dated 6/10/2016 with the condition that the replacement windows are one-over-one with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11 for windows and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5. Remove window (W5) at rear of right side elevation. **Approve** plans and window survey dated 6/10/2016 with the finding the window is not original and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Remove wood siding on rear addition and re clad with Hardie board. Approve for addition only with the finding of fact that while not in strict compliance with preservation criteria, it will not have an adverse effect on the district.
7. Construct landing and stair on rear addition. **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans and specifications dated 6/10/2016 with the condition that the landing and stairs are constructed of wood with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 for new porches and balconies and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
8. Install steel paneled door and wood screen door on rear elevation. **Approve** plans dated 06/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11 for doors and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
9. Remove shed roof on rear addition and replace with gabled roof. **Approve with conditions** - Approve plans dated 6/10/2016 with condition that replacement roof has Owens Corning shingles in 'Estate Gray' to match main roof with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
10. Replace roof with Owens Corning shingles in 'Estate Gray.' **Approve** specifications dated 6/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.19 for roofing materials and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
11. Install 6ft high wood fence in rear and side yards with 3ft 6in high swinging wood gate in side yard with driveway. **Approve** site plan and rendering dated 6/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 1.9, 1.11, 1.13, and 1.14 for fences, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
12. Install landscaping in front and left side yard. **Approve** site plan dated 6/10/16 with finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 1.6 for landscaping and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
13. Construct new walkway in front and new driveway on right side. **Approve** site plan dated 6/10/2016 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 1.3 for walkways and driveways and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
14. Install pad for condenser in rear left side yard. **Approve with conditions** – Approve site plan dated 6/10/2016 with condition that mechanical equipment is screened behind fence with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 1.7 for mechanical equipment and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Tapscott

Second: Amonett

Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Johnson,
Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman, Tapscott,
Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 5 Birrer, Gadberry, Maten, Parsons, Seale

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

7. 603 MUNGER AVE

West End Historic District
CA156-578(MD)
Mark Doty

1. Restore metal windows on northeast facade.
2. Retrofit wood windows with true-divided insulated glazing.
3. Construct plaza improvements.
4. Install temporary banner on northeast corner of structure for a period of six months.

Speakers: For: Jay Firsching
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Restore metal windows on northeast facade. **Approve** drawings dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for construction and renovation in the preservation criteria Section 5.3, 5.4, 5.5, and 5.7, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Retrofit wood windows with true-divided insulated glazing. **Approve** drawings dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for construction and renovation in the preservation criteria Section 5.3, 5.4, 5.5, and 5.7, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Construct plaza improvements. **Approve** drawings dated 6/15/16 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install temporary banner on northeast corner of structure for a period of six months. Approved with the following conditions: temporary banner to be installed from date of Landmark Commission approval until March 2, 2017. Any fasteners installed on exterior of building will be located in mortar joints with the finding of fact that it is temporary and will not have an adverse effect on the historic district.

Maker: Gadberry
Second: Johnson
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

8. 326 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-576(MD)
Mark Doty
Install 16 foundation vents.

Speakers: For: Felly Blanchard
Against: No one

Motion:

Install 16 foundation vents. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the number, placement, and appearance of the proposed vents is not compatible with the historic overlay district.

Maker: Tapscott

Second: *Sherman

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

9. 418 N WILLOMET AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA156-590(MD)

Mark Doty

Install wood porch railings. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion:

Install wood porch railings. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Deny without prejudice** - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that state front porch or entry treatment must be typical of the style and period of the building. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(a)(11)(E). Secretary of the Interior Standard #3.

Maker: *Sherman

Second: Johnson

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Amonett, Bowers, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry,
Johnson, Jordan, *Montgomery, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 4 Birrer, Maten, Parsons, Seale

Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

10. 418 N WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA156-570(MD)
Mark Doty

1. Install 30" retaining wall along W. Seventh Street.
2. Construct 9'-0" wood, board-on-board fence in cornerside yard.

Speakers: For: Richard Fitzgerald
Against: No one

***Commissioner Gadberry returned to the meeting.**

Motion:

1. Install 30" retaining wall along W. Seventh Street. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that states retaining walls are not permitted in the front and side yards, except to preserve a natural or existing slope and must be constructed of unpainted natural stone, brick, stone, or smooth-finished concrete that is compatible in texture, color, and style with the main building. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(b)(8) with the finding of fact that the proposal will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district and future efforts for preservation and maintenance.
2. Construct 9'-0" wood, board-on-board fence in cornerside yard. **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that state corner side yard fences must not be directly in front of the corner side facade unless Landmark Commission allows. Preservation criteria 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(iii) **with the finding of fact that the proposal will have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district and future efforts for preservation and maintenance.**

Maker: Williams
Second: Tapscott
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan, Maten, *Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take D7 and D4 next on the agenda.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Amonett
Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan, Maten, *Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Landmark Commission Minutes
Monday, July 5, 2016

Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

Approval of Minutes from June 6, 2016.

Maker: *Sherman

Second: Tate

Results: 12/0

Ayes: - 12 Birrer, *Childers, Flabiano, Gadberry, Jordan,
Maten, *Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Bowers, Parsons, Johnson, Amonett
Vacancies: - 2 4 and 10

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at **3:41 P.M.**

Katherine Seale, Chair

Date