

September 5, 2017



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on September 5, 2017 with a briefing at 11:06 a.m. in room 5ES and the public hearing at 1:13 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

*John Allender
Michael Amonett
Clint Bowers
Diane Bumpas
*Sam Childers

Mattia Flabiano
Cris Jordan
Adam McGill
Evelyn Montgomery

Katherine Seale, Chair
Daron Tapscott
Sean Tate
Emily Williams

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: No one

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **Paul Ridley**

The following Commissioners were absent for the Meeting: **Mike Birrer and Robert Swann**

The following Commissioners were absent for the briefing:

The following Position is vacant: District 3, and District 12

The following Staff was present:

Neva Dean
Mark Doty
Jennifer Anderson

Marsha Prior
Eric Hill
Liz Casso

Theresa Pham
Trena Law

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C1 through C4, C6 through C18 following staff recommendation.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion was made to approve C5 following staff recommendation.

***Commissioners McGill and Tapscott recused themselves and did not hear or vote on this matter.**

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Amonett
Results: 11/0

Ayes: - 11 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, Seale, Tate,
Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 4 Birrer, Swann, Tapscott, McGill
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take D14, CR1, D4, D6, D7, D8, D10, D11, D12, D13 and the remaining items in their natural order on the agenda.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

CONSENT ITEMS:

1. 1800 MAIN ST

Mercantile Bank Building
CA167-741(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Install a blade sign at the southwest corner of the structure. – Approve the drawings dated 8/9/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 10 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install a flat attached sign on south elevation. – Approve the drawings dated 8/9/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 10 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install a flat attached sign on west elevation. – Approve the drawings dated 8/9/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 10 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install a temporary window sign on south elevation.– Approve the drawings dated 8/9/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 10 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install a temporary window sign on west elevation.– Approve the drawings dated 8/9/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 10 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. 100 S GLASGOW DR

Woodrow Wilson High School
CA167-742(LC)
Liz Casso

Demolish the 1953 and 1977 rear additions to the school.– Approve drawings dated 8/9/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. 1620 1ST AVE

Fair Park Historic District
CA167-738(MD)

Mark Doty

1. Hall of Domestic Arts - Science Place II - Install fourteen wall-mounted security cameras. – Approve drawings and specifications dated 8/16/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Hall of Domestic Arts - Science Place II - Hall of Domestic Arts - Science Place II - Install three pairs of card readers and intercoms at building entrances. - Approve drawings and specifications dated 8/16/17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4. 727 LIPSCOMB AVE

Junius Heights Historic District
CA167-747(MP)

Marsha Prior

Replace and expand driveway, repair single slab of sidewalk, and repair side porch steps with brush finish concrete – Approve with conditions – Approve survey plat and photos dated 8/16/17 with the condition that the driveway is no more than 9'-0" in width and that the material used for driveway, steps, and sidewalk is brush finish concrete with the finding the work is compatible with the historic overlay district and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

5. 5606 TREMONT ST (Voted on Separately)

Junius Heights Historic District
CD167-020(MP)

Marsha Prior

Demolish accessory structure using the standard 'imminent threat to public health/safety'. Approve – The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(C). The structure constitutes a documented major and imminent threat to public health and safety; the demolition or removal is required to alleviate the threat to public health and safety; and there is no reasonable way, other than demolition or removal, to eliminate the threat in a timely manner.

6. 5204 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District
CA167-767(EH)

Eric Hill

Stain fence. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Color: SW3025 "Caribou" – Approve stain specifications dated 08-14-17 with the finding it is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(2)(B)(vii)(cc) and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

7. 4722 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-776(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Replace brick front porch columns and paint. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: HC-169 "Coventry Gray" – Approve with conditions - Approve drawings dated 08-14-17 with the condition that the columns are 20"x20" brick columns with brick dimensions to match existing with the finding that although the proposed work does not comply with Section 3.4 that states brick surfaces not previously painted may not be painted, the applicant established that the color and texture of the

proposed replacement brick cannot be matched with that of the existing brick surface as allowed under Section 3.4(a), and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. Extend balcony on main structure - Approve drawings dated 08-14-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Alter opening on rear elevation and install new window - Approve window specifications dated 08-14-17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

8. 4523 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-775(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Install 1/1 wood window on front elevation of main structure – Approve with conditions - Approve window specifications dated 08-14-17 with the condition that the window fits the opening and that the opening is not enlarged or enclosed to fit the new window and that the window is painted to match the others on the main structure with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.10 and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Cut down two trees in side and rear yard. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve - completed work with the finding it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

9. 4604 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-771(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Install 20 foundation vents in skirting on main structure – Approve with conditions - Approve vent specifications dated 08-14-17 with the condition that they are painted to match the skirting on the structure with the finding it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install HV/AC penetrations on roof of main structure - Approve specifications dated 08-14-17 with the finding it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install 36"x36" concrete landings on rear patio and accessory structure – Approve with conditions - Approve proposed site plan dated 08-14-17 with the condition that the landings are brushed finish concrete with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

10. 4834 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-773(EH)
Eric Hill

Install 14'-0"x20'-

0" in-ground pool in rear yard - Approve site plan dated 08-14-17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 2606 PARK ROW AVE

South Blvd Park Row Historic District
CD167-021(MP)
Marsha Prior

Demolish accessory structure using the standard 'imminent threat to public health/safety' – The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(C). The structure

constitutes a documented major and imminent threat to public health and safety; the demolition or removal is required to alleviate the threat to public health and safety; and there is no reasonable way, other than demolition or removal, to eliminate the threat in a timely manner.

12. 2616 THOMAS AVE

State Thomas Historic District

CA167-777(EH)

Eric Hill

Install GAF Timberline composition shingle roof on main structure in "Weathered Wood" - Approve shingle specifications dated 08-14-17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-225.109(a)(14)(A) and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

13. 5518 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA167-765(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Construct covered porch on rear of main structure - Approve drawings dated 08-14-17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(B) and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Construct wood pergola on brick columns on rear of main structure - Approve plans dated 08-14-17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Replace overhead garage doors on accessory structure - Approve door specifications dated 08-14-17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
4. Install decorative trim on accessory structure to match main structure - Approve door specifications dated 08-14-17 with the finding the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

14. 5902 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA167-764(EH)

Eric Hill

1. Replace single door on rear of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve completed work with the finding that the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Alter opening on rear of main structure and new French paired doors. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve completed work with the finding it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Paint interior of perimeter fence. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Color SW7068 "Grizzle Gray" - Approve proposed paint specifications dated 08-14-17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(2)(B)(viii) and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

15. 214 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-759(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Install 6' fence in side and rear yard – Approve site plan and specifications dated 8-14-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(ii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

16. 223 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-758(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

1. Replace French doors in rear of the main structure – Approve specifications dated 8-17-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Paint main structure. Trim 1: Sherwin Williams SW0049 "Silver Gray;" Trim 2: Valspar 1009-5 "Moving Melody." Work partially completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve paint specifications dated 8-14-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Remove retaining wall in front yard and regrade the front lawn – Approve with Conditions – Approve the proposed work with the condition that the roll steps are not altered during the course of regrading the lawn with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install landscaping in front and rear yard – Approve site plan dated 8-17-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(3) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install 8" wood fence in rear yard and stain using Ready Seal in color 115 "Pecan" – Approve site plan and specifications dated 8-14-17 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C)(ii) and Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(G) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

17. 303 N WINDOMERE AVE (Voted on Separately due to speaker)

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-761(JKA)

Jennifer Anderson

Install landscaping in front yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve with conditions – Approve site plan dated 8-15-17 with the condition that no plants except for the crepe myrtles shown are allowed

to grow over 18 inches tall with the finding the completed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(1) and Section 51P-87.111(b)(3) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Speakers: For: Frederick Stolzenbach
Against: No one

Motion:

Install landscaping in front yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve with conditions – Approve with conditions – Approve site plan dated 8-15-17 with the condition that foundation plantings not exceed 24 inches above porch floor with the finding of fact that this is not considered a vegetable garden but natural landscape beds, which include edible plants.

Maker: Williams
Second: Bowers
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

18. 121 N WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-762(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Stain wood fence. Brand: Behr. Color: "Russet." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve specifications dated 8-14-17 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(G)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

COURTESY REVIEW ITEM:

1. 1312 S ERVAY ST

Ambassador Hotel
CR167-017(LC)
Liz Casso

Courtesy Review - Improvements to the main structure, construction of a pool deck and pool club structure, construction of a restaurant structure and removal of the block wall fence. – Approve conceptually with the condition that final plans, elevations, and details are submitted for final Landmark Commission review.

Speakers: For: Rick Evans
Against: No one

*There was no formal motion made on this case.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. 1933 MAIN ST

Harwood Historic District, Plaza Hotel
CA167-740(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Install a blade sign at the southeast corner of the structure.
2. Replace existing entry awning on east elevation with new awning with awning signage.

Speakers: For: Kristy Smith
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install a blade sign at the southeast corner of the structure. – Approve the drawings dated 8/23/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace existing entry awning on east elevation with new awning with awning signage. – Approve the drawings dated 8/23/17 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 8 for signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: McGill
Second: Flabiano
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

2. 5733 TREMONT ST

Junius Heights Historic District
CA167-744(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Remove chimney in rear portion of house.
2. Replace primary and secondary front doors and paint. Brand: Behr, PPU15 'Poppy Seed.'
3. Replace back door.
4. Remove window framing and plywood, and replace with #117 siding and paint. Brand: Behr, 57 "Frost."
5. Install motion lights on four corners of house.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Remove chimney in rear portion of house – **Approve with the finding of fact that it is not detrimental to the historic overlay district and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).**
2. Replace primary and secondary front doors and paint. Brand: Behr, PPU15 'Poppy Seed' – Approve with conditions – Approve photo and specifications dated 8/16/17 with the condition that the doors have multiple lites and that they fit within the existing voids with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Replace back door – Approve specifications dated 8/16/17 with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Remove window framing and plywood, and replace with #117 siding and paint. Brand: Behr, 57 "Frost" – Approve with conditions – Approve proposed work with condition that a vertical trim board is installed from top to bottom on the right side of the void where the drip edge ends with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5. Install motion lights on four corners of house – Approve specifications dated 8/16/17 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.5(a) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Jordan
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion was made to reconsider the Consent Agenda to allow speaker to speak on C17.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: McGill
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion was made to approve C1 through C4, C6 through C16 and C18 following staff recommendation.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: McGill
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

3. 5516 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District

CA167-746(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Install iron gate within front 50 percent of side yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Apply Hardie board siding to portions of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion:

1. Install iron gate within front 50 percent of side yard. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. - **Deny without prejudice** because ordinance stipulates that gate must be behind 50% mark. However, recommendation is to allow gate as placed because 50% mark is in the middle of a window with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Apply Hardie board siding to portions of main structure. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. - **Approve** - Apply Hardie board siding to the two lower portions of main structure with the finding the work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Tate

Second: Tapscott

Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas,*Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, McGill, Montgomery, Seale, Tapscott, Tate, Williams

Against: - 0

Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann

Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

4. 4903 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District

CA167-766(EH)

Eric Hill

Asphalt the remainder of both parking lots and stripe.

Speakers: For: Fiunevere Sacra

Against: John Gormley, Emily Stevenson, Will Thompson, Christopher Hart

Motion #1:

Asphalt the remainder of both parking lots and stripe – Approve with conditions - Approve site plan dated 08-14-17 with the condition that the striping is white and non-reflective with the finding that the proposed work is compatible with the historic overlay district, and it meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

*Commissioner Jordan recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.

Maker: Williams
Second: Flabiano
Results: 5/7

Ayes: - 5 *Childers, Flabiano, Montgomery, McGill,
Williams
Against: - 7 *Allender, Bowers, Amonett, Tapscott, Seale,
Tate, Bumpas
Absent: - 3 Birrer, Swann, Jordan
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Motion #2:

Asphalt the remainder of both parking lots and stripe – Deny without prejudice with the finding of fact that an asphalt parking lot is not compatible to the residential historic district.

*Commissioner Jordan recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Flabiano
Results: 12/1

Ayes: - 12 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate
Against: - 1 Williams
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann, Jordan
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

5. 617 N CARROLL AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-770(EH)

Eric Hill

Paint trim, columns, and window trim. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: OC-36 "Niveous".

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

Paint trim, columns, and window trim. Brand: Benjamin Moore. Color: OC-36 "Niveous" – **Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is not consistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.7 which states all structures must have a dominant color and no more than three trim colors including any accent colors.**

Maker: Bowers
Second: *Allender
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

6. 4632 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-774(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Remove tree from front yard.
2. Plant Weeping Willow tree in front yard.
3. Construct 8'-0" board-on-board wood fence and stain.

Speakers: For: Rudy Simental, Olive May
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Remove tree from front yard – **Approve removal of tree with the finding that while intentionally killed, the tree is unhealthy and its removal is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.8 and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).**
2. Plant Weeping Willow tree in front yard – **Deny** proposed plan and species with the finding that the proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because is not consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.6 which states landscaping must be appropriate and compatible, must enhance the structure and surroundings, and must not obscure significant views of or from the main building.
3. Construct 8'-0" board-on-board wood fence and stain – **Approve with conditions that interior side yard be no less than 70% open.**

Maker: Tapscott
Second: Williams
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

7. 4403 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-769(EH)
Eric Hill

1. Replace existing composition roof on main structure with aluminum shingle roof in "Buckskin".
2. Replace existing concrete walkway and steps in front yard with blue stone in running bond pattern.
3. Remove terraced front yard plantings and stone and replace with 8" blue stone retaining wall and re-slope front yard with grass.
4. Replace existing gravel driveway with Tejas Black crushed granite.
5. Install in-ground pool, landscaping and hardscaping in rear yard.

Speakers: For: Elizabeth Nelson
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace existing composition roof on main structure with aluminum shingle roof in "Buckskin" – **Approve with the finding of fact that the request does not have an adverse effect on the overlay district.**
2. Replace existing concrete walkway and steps in front yard with blue stone in running bond pattern – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the proposed stone is not appropriate to the structure or historic overlay district under preservation criteria Section 2.3.
3. Remove terraced front yard plantings and stone and replace with 8" blue stone retaining wall and re-slope front yard with grass – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the proposed material is not appropriate to the structure or historic overlay district and the applicant has not met the burden of proof that a retaining wall is required for the front yard.
4. Replace existing gravel driveway with Tejas Black crushed granite – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the proposed crushed granite is not appropriate to the structure or historic overlay district as under preservation criteria Section 2.3.
5. Install in-ground pool, landscaping and hardscaping in rear yard – **Approve site plan for rear yard dated 08-14-17 with the finding that the proposed work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).**

Maker: Flabiano
Second: McGill
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

8. 4609 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA167-772(EH)
Eric Hill
Plant four trees on vacant lot.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion:

Plant four trees on vacant lot - Approve with conditions - Approve site plan dated 08-14-17 with the condition that only two canopy trees are planted in the front yard with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the preservation criteria Section 2.6 and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker: Williams
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

9. 3706 DUNBAR ST

Wheatley Place Historic District
CA167-748(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Remove original wood siding, install tan siding, and paint. Brand: Behr, UL130-15 'Creamy Mushroom.' Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

2. Remove original ganged windows on front elevation and install two multi-light vinyl windows. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Replace remaining wood 1/1 windows with multi-light vinyl windows. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. Install new side door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
5. Install new porch columns. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
6. Install decorative vents in gables. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Shoroline McCoy
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Remove original wood siding, install tan siding, and paint. Brand: Behr, UL130-15 'Creamy Mushroom.' Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 4.1(b), 4.2, and 4.3 for protected and non-protected historic elevations.
2. Remove original ganged windows on front elevation and install two multi-light vinyl windows. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.1 and 5.3 which prohibits replacement of historic windows unless necessary due to damage or deterioration and stipulates that replacement windows express original profile, muntin and mullion size, light configuration, and material to match the historic.
3. Replace remaining wood 1/1 windows with multi-light vinyl windows. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.1 and 5.3 which prohibits replacement of historic windows unless necessary due to damage or deterioration and stipulates that replacement windows express original profile, muntin and mullion size, light configuration, and material to match the historic.
4. Install new side door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Approve** side door with the finding the work does not comply with preservation criteria Section 5.3 for replacement doors, but it meets the criteria for landmark commission approval of work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the proposed work is historically accurate, it is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria, and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district.
5. Install new porch columns. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 7.3 which protects historic columns.
6. Install decorative vents in gables. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – **Deny without prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with Secretary of the Interior's Standard #3 which states that changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features, shall not be undertaken.

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

10. 416 S CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-760(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson
Install landscaping in the front yard.

Speakers: For: Jay Bishop
Against: No one

Motion:

Install landscaping in the front yard. – Approve with conditions that the Vitex trees on the right hand side be limited to two.

Maker: Amonett
Second: Williams
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

11. 213 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-756(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

1. Replace columns and brick piers on front porch to match existing.
2. Replace railing on front porch to match existing.

Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body: SW2834 "Birdseye Maple;" Trim: SW2838 "Polished Mahogany;" Accent: SW2839 "Roycroft Copper Red."

Speakers: For: Cynthia Webber
Against: No one

Motion:

1. Replace columns and brick piers on front porch to match existing – **Deny without Prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards of City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant has not met the burden of proof required to justify the work since the photographs provided did not show that 100% replacement was warranted and because scaled and dimensioned drawings were not submitted.
2. Replace railing on front porch to match existing – **Deny without Prejudice** – The proposed work does not meet the standards of City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the applicant has not met the burden of proof required to justify the work since the photographs provided did not show that 100% replacement was warranted and because scaled and dimensioned drawings were not submitted.
3. Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body: SW2834 "Birdseye Maple;" Trim: SW2838 "Polished Mahogany;" Accent: SW2839 "Roycroft Copper Red" – **Approve with Conditions** – Approve paint specifications dated 8-14-17 with the condition that the brick piers are not painted. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker: Jordan
Second: *Allender
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

12. 115 N WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA167-757(JKA)
Jennifer Anderson

Paint front door using Sherwin Williams SW2865 "Classical Yellow." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Elizabeth Ziegler
Against: No one

Motion:

Paint front door using Sherwin Williams SW2865 "Classical Yellow." Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. **Approve with the finding of fact that it will not have an adverse effect on the historic district.**

Maker: Amonett
Second: McGill
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

13. 319 Edgefield Ave.

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CE167-014(PT)
Pam Thompson

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$135,526 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval.

Speakers: For: Jim Anderson
Against: No one

Motion:

A Certificate of Eligibility (CE) for a tax exemption on 100 percent of land and improvements for a period of ten years and approval of \$135,526 in expenditures spent on rehabilitation within the three years prior to the CE approval. **Approval with the finding of fact that he property is now contributing and will be held to that standard in the future.**

Maker: Montgomery
Second: *Allender
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers,
Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale,
Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

14. 1711 McCoy Street

Hold a public hearing to consider initiation of historic designation process for 1711 McCoy Street (Green Acres Motor Hotel).

Speakers: For: David Preziosi
Against: No one

Motion:

Hold a public hearing to consider initiation of historic designation process for 1711 McCoy Street (Green Acres Motor Hotel). **Deny without prejudice with the finding of fact that demolition has already begun and progressed too far. A historic marker denoting the historic nature of the building and property would be appropriate at this time.**

Maker: Flabiano
Second: Tapscott
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

Approval of Minutes from August 7, 2017.

Maker: Amonett
Second: Williams
Results: 13/0

Ayes: - 13 *Allender, Amonett, Bowers, Bumpas, *Childers, Flabiano, Jordan, Montgomery, McGill, Seale, Tapscott, Tate, Williams
Against: - 0
Absent: - 2 Birrer, Swann
Vacancies: - 2 3, and 12

ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made to adjourn at 5:13 P.M.

Katherine Seale, Chair

Date