

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on December 3, 2018 with a briefing at 10:05 a.m. in room 5ES, the public hearing at 1:13 p.m. in the Council Chambers and an executive session at 6:20 p.m. in room 5ES of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Michael Amonett Krista De La Harpe Mattia James Flabiano, Vice Chair Rosemary Hinojosa Evelyn Montgomery Donald Payton Courtney Peach Leigh Richter Katherine Seale - Chair *Diane Sherman Courtney Spellicy Renee Strickland Robert Swann Emily Williams *Sam Childers

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: No one

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **No one**

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:

*John Allender

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing: No one

The following Positions are vacant: District 3, District 13

The following Staff was present:

Jennifer Anderson Liz Casso Neva Dean Mark Doty Elaine Hill Marsha Prior Melissa Parent Anna Lamberti Holmes Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to move Consent Items C12 and C13 to the Discussion agenda.

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Hinojosa | | | | |
| Results: | 15/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Peach, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | *Allender |
| | | Vacancies: | ı | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C1, through C11, C14 and C15 following staff recommendations.

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Childers | | | | |
| Results: | 15/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Peach, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | *Allender |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take D1, C12, C13, and the remaining items will be heard in their natural order.

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Amonett | | | | |
| Results: | 15/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Peach, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | *Allender |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

^{*}Commissioner Sherman recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.

CONSENT ITEMS

1. 909 1ST AVE

Fair Park Historic District CA189-093(MD) Mark Doty

Music Hall - Install accent, safety, and security lighting on structure and site – Approve - Approve drawings dated 11/14/18 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for lighting in the preservation criteria Section 3.7(d), and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5835 REIGER AVE

Junius Heights Historic District CD189-003(JKA) Jennifer Anderson

Demolish accessory structure using the standard "noncontributing structure because newer than period of significance" – Approve – Approve the proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structure is noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structure is newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay district; and demolition of the structure will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

3. 5617 TREMONT ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA189-090(JKA) Jennifer Anderson

Enclose rear porch – Approve – Approve drawings, images, and specifications dated 12/03/18 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.2 and 8.3 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4. 6019 WORTH ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA189-091(JKA) Jennifer Anderson

Construct gable on rear addition – Approve – Approve drawings dated 12/03/18 with the finding that the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.2 and 8.3 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5. 4617 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA189-087(MLP) Melissa Parent

Remove one mature tree from front parkway – Approve – Approve with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for site and site elements in the preservation criteria Section 2.8, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. 4837 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA189-086(MLP)
Melissa Parent

- 1. Construct new addition in rear of main structure. Approve Approve drawings and specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for new construction and additions in the preservation criteria Sections 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, and 4.7, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install new brick chimney on side facade of main structure Approve Approve drawings and specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for new construction and additions in the preservation criteria Section 4.5, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 3. Remove two doors on front facade and two doors on side facade. Infill with siding Approve Approve drawings dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 4. Install new front door and sidelights at front entrance Approve Approve specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fenestration and openings in the preservation criteria Section 3.10, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 5. Replace three windows on main structure with new wood window Approve Approve specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for fenestration and openings in the preservation criteria Section 3.10, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 6. Replace stucco bases of columns on front facade with brick bases Approve Approve drawings and brick specification dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for porches and balconies in the preservation criteria Section 3.20 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6110 BRYAN PKWY

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA189-083(MLP) Melissa Parent

Enclose rear porch on main structure – Approve – Approve drawings and specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

8. 4946 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA189-084(MLP) Melissa Parent

- 1. Construct pergola in rear yard. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Approve Approve with the finding the completed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory buildings in the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(A)(i) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(q)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Install new door on rear accessory structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Approve Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

9. 401 N HOUSTON ST

West End Historic District CA189-092(LC) Liz Casso

- 1. Install painted sign with lighting on north elevation. Approve Approve drawings and specifications dated 12/3/18 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 for signs, Section 51A-7.1005(f) for painted applied signs on Type A facades and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install canopy sign on east elevation. Approve Approve drawings dated 12/3/18 for both canopy sign options 1 and 2 with the finding that although canopy sign option 1 does not comply with Section 51A-7.1005(b)(1)(B) which states that canopy signs may not project vertically above the surface of the canopy, it meets the criteria for Landmark Commission approval for work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the proposed work is historically accurate, is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and it will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district. Canopy sign option 2 is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 for signs, Section 51A-7.1005(b) canopy signs, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 3. Install flat attached signage in garage entry at east elevation. Approve Approve drawings dated 12/3/18 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 for signs, Section 51A-7.1005(c) for flat attached signs on Type A facades and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

10. 1718 N MARKET ST

West End Historic District CA189-080(LC) Liz Casso

- 1. Construct wood deck at north and west elevations. Approve Approve drawings and specifications dated 12/3/18 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- Remove non-historic canvas awnings from north and west elevations. Work partially completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. – Approve – Approve images dated 12/3/18 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 3. Install new windows and doors on north and west elevations. Approve Approve drawings and specifications dated 12/3/18 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.7 for façade appearance and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- Paint structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body SW7008 "Alabaster;" Trim SW7570 "Egret White." Approve Approve paint specifications and drawings dated 12/3/18 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.1 for color and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

11. 603 MUNGER AVE

West End Historic District CA189-077(LC) Liz Casso

Install painted sign with lighting on north elevation. – Approve – Approve drawings dated 11/7/18 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.6 for signs, Section 51A-7.1005(f) for painted applied signs on Type A facades and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

12. 1836 W DAVIS ST

Winnetka Heights Historic District (MOVED TO DISCUSSION) CA189-103(MP)

Marsha Prior

Paint main body and trim. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 6106 "Killim Beige;" Trim - SW 7026 "Griffin." Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers For: John LaRue

Against: Glen Jones

Motion

Paint main body and trim. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body - SW 6106 "Killim Beige;" Trim - SW 7026 "Griffin." Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve – Approve paint specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|-------|---|----|---|
| Second: | Amonett | | | | |
| Results: | 15/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Peach, Richter, |

| | | | Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
|------------|---|---|---|
| Against: | - | 0 | |
| Absent: | - | 0 | *Allender |
| Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

^{*}Commissioner Sherman recused herself and did not hear or vote on this matter.

13. 316 S WINNETKA AVE (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA189-101(MP)

Marsha Prior

- 1. Install wood shingles on front gable. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Install new glazed sash in front gable opening.
- 3. Install two Craftsman-style doors on front elevation
- 4. Replace existing retaining wall with lower stone wall.
- 5. Remove flagstone paving and repair concrete paving or install gravel to match driveway.

Speakers: For: Norm Alston

Against: No one

Motion #1

- Install wood shingles on front gable. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness –
 Approve with conditions Approve completed work with the condition that the original trim piece on
 the gable is re-installed and stained to match current shingles with the finding the work is consistent
 with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install new glazed sash in front gable opening Approve Approve plan dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 3. Install two Craftsman-style doors on front elevation Approve Approve specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 4. Replace existing retaining wall with lower stone wall Deny Deny without prejudice the landscape plan dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(8) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 5. Remove flagstone paving and repair concrete paving or install gravel to match driveway Deny Deny without prejudice the landscape plan dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|-------|---|---|---------------|
| Second: | Williams | | | | |
| Results: | 0/15 | | | | MOTION FAILED |
| | | Ayes: | - | 0 | |

| Against: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Peach, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
|------------|---|----|--|
| Absent: | - | 0 | *Allender |
| Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

Motion #2

- Install wood shingles on front gable. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness –
 Approve with conditions Approve completed work with the condition that the original trim piece on
 the gable is re-installed and stained to match current shingles with the finding the work is consistent
 with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install new glazed sash in front gable opening Approve Approve plan dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 3. Install two Craftsman-style doors on front elevation Approve Approve specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 4. Replace existing retaining wall with lower stone wall Approve Approve landscape plan dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(8) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 5. Remove flagstone paving and repair concrete paving or install gravel to match driveway Approve Approve landscape plan dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(q)(6)(C)(i).

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Williams | | | | |
| Results: | 15/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Peach, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 0 | *Allender |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

14. 328 S ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CD189-004(MP) Marsha Prior

Demolish accessory structure using the standard 'noncontributing structure because newer than the period of significance.' Demolition completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve – The demolition

meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D). The structure was noncontributing to the historic overlay district; the structure was newer than the period of historic significance for the historic overlay district; and demolition of the structure will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

15. 328 S ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA189-100(MP)
Marsha Prior

- Replace iron columns on front elevation with wood tapered columns Approve Approve drawing dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A 4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Install wood railing on front porch Approve Approve drawing dated 12/3/18 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 3. Replace two doors on front elevation Approve Approve specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

DISCUSSION ITEMS

5835 REIGER AVE

Junius Heights Historic District CA189-089(JKA) Jennifer Anderson Construct accessory structure.

| S | peakers: | For: | Dale Coonroc |
|---|----------|------|--------------|
| | | | |

Against: No One

Motion

Construct accessory structure – Deny without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) and is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 9.4 stating that accessory structures may not exceed a footprint of 600 sq. ft. unless documentation shows that an original structure exceeding this size was previously on the building site.

| Maker: | Sherman | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Williams | | | | |
| Results: | 14/1 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 14 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Absent: | - | 0 | |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

2. 4523 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA189-088(MLP)

Melissa Parent

- 1. Replace all siding on main structure with Hardie Board siding. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Replace thirteen wood windows on main structure with vinyl windows. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 3. Replace wood columns on front porch of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 4. Install new front door. Completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Kelly Nyfeler

Against: No One

Motion

- 1. Replace all siding on main structure with Hardie Board siding. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Deny Deny Hardie siding on all facades and recommend replacing with wood siding. The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.2 that states the reconstruction, renovation or repair of opaque elements of the protected facades must employ materials similar to the original materials in texture, color, pattern, grain, and module size as much as practical.
- 2. Replace thirteen wood windows on main structure with vinyl windows. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Deny Deny replacement of wood windows with vinyl windows. The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.10 that states Where replacement of an original door or window is necessary, replacement doors and windows must express mullion size, light configuration, and material to match the original doors and windows.
- 3. Replace wood columns on front porch of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Deny Deny three middle columns at front porch. Reconstruct one column to be symmetrical with the left-most column on front gable. The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.20 that states all original columns, railings, and other trim and detailing that are part of the porch or balcony configuration must be preserved.
- 4. Install new front door. Completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Deny Deny front door and replace with wood door, either ½ or ¾ glass light. The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 3.10 that states Where replacement of an original door or window is necessary, replacement doors and windows must express mullion size, light configuration, and material to match the original doors and windows.

| Maker: | Sherman | | | | | | | | | |
|----------|---------|-------|---|----|---------|------------|----|----|--------|-----------|
| Second: | Amonett | | | | | | | | | |
| Results: | 15/0 | | | | | | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett | *Childers, | De | La | Harpe, | Flabiano, |

| | | | Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Peach, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
|---|--------------|---|---|
| A | gainst: - | 0 | |
| A | bsent: - | 0 | |
| V | 'acancies: - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

3. 4527 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA189-085(MLP)

Melissa Parent

Install new QuickCrete wall along foundation on front and side facades. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers: For: Steven L. Bourn A.I.A.

Against: No One

Motion

Install new QuickCrete wall along foundation on front and side facades. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – Approve as the work will not have an adverse effect on the historic district if it is not noticeable with the condition that the adjacent areas be planted with water resistant, low growing evergreen plants such as liriope, holly fern, dwarf yaupon holly or spreading yew.

| Maker: | Williams | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Hinojosa | | | | |
| Results: | 14/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 14 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

^{*}Commissioner Peach did not vote on this case as she left the meeting

4. 2516 THOMAS ST

State Thomas Historic District CA189-082(MLP)

Melissa Parent

- 1. Replace front entry door and transom with new wood door. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Replace door on rear facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

| Speakers: | For: | Scott Siers |
|-----------|------|-------------|
| | | |

Daniel Hernandez

Against: No One

Motion

- 1. Replace front entry door and transom with new wood door. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Deny the completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria that requires all windows, doors, and lights on the front façade of a main building be typical of the style and period of the building, with the finding of fact that the State Thomas Historic District City of Dallas website clearly shows a transom above the front door, as the applicant testified, the photo is at least 30 years old. Preservation criteria Section 51P-225.109(a)(16)(F)(iii).
- 2. Replace door on rear facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness Approve with conditions Approve images dated 11/9/18 with the condition that more appropriate glass be used, because the completed work as submitted did not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) on the basis that it would be inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-225.109(a)(16)(B) that prohibits reflective, tinted, opaque, translucent, and mirrored glass and plastic.

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Swann | | | | |
| Results: | 14/1 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 14 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

5. 207 N CLIFF ST

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District CA189-097(MP) Marsha Prior Construct two-story duplex

Speakers: For: Jay Taylor

Against: Larry Johnson

Rosa Medrano Shaun Montgomery

Motion

Construct two-story duplex – Deny without prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the proposed design and materials are inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.2 and 3.3 state that new construction must be of appropriate massing, shape, materials, and detailing and that imitation materials are not acceptable cladding

materials for a main structure.

| Maker: | Hinojosa | | | | |
|----------|------------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Montgomery | | | | |
| Results: | 14/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 14 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

6. 214 N CLIFF ST

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District CA189-098(MP)
Marsha Prior
Construct two-story duplex.

Speakers: For: Jay Taylor

Against: Pat Cox

Larry Johnson Rosa Medrano

Motion

Construct two-story duplex – Deny without prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) because the proposed design and materials are inconsistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.2 and 3.3 that state that new construction must be of appropriate massing, shape, materials, and detailing and that imitation materials are not acceptable cladding materials for a main structure.

| Maker: | Hinojosa | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Amonett | | | | |
| Results: | 14/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 14 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

7. 218 N WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA189-099(MP)

Marsha Prior

- 1. Construct rear addition that includes attached garage.
- 2. Construct new porch columns, railing, and floor.
- 3. Replace existing asphalt shingles on front gable with wood siding.
- 4. Remove existing walkway and construct new front yard walkway.

Speakers: For: Woody O'Daniel

Against: No One

Motion #1

1. Construct rear addition that includes attached garage – Approve – Approve drawings and specifications dated 12/3/2018 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-111(a)(2) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

- 2. Construct new porch columns, railing, and floor Deny without prejudice The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it would have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure with the finding it is inconsistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation No. 3 that states changes that create a false sense of historical development shall not be undertaken.
- 3. Replace existing asphalt shingles on front gable with wood siding Approve Approve drawings dated 12/3/18 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(10)(A) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 4. Remove existing walkway and construct new front yard walkway Approve with conditions Approve site plan dated 12/3/2018 with the condition that the material is brush finish concrete with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(iii) and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Hinojosa | | | | |
| Results: | 2/12 | | | | MOTION FAILED |
| | | Ayes: | - | 2 | Flabiano, Hinojosa |
| | | Against: | - | 12 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

Motion #2

- 1. Construct rear addition that includes attached garage Deny without prejudice will have a detrimental effect on the district.
- 2. Construct new porch columns, railing, and floor Approve with the condition the porch is concrete.
- 3. Replace existing asphalt shingles on front gable with wood siding Approve drawings dated 12/3/18 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(10)(A) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(q)(6)(C)(i).

4. Remove existing walkway and construct new front yard walkway – Approve with conditions – Approve site plan dated 12/3/2018 with the condition that the material is brush finish concrete with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(iii) and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

| Maker: | Amonett | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Williams | | | | |
| Results: | 13/1 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 13 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 1 | Flabiano |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

8. 228 S CLIFF ST

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District

CD178-018(MP)

Marsha Prior

Demolish residential structure 3,000 square feet or less pursuant to a court order (51A-4.501(i) of the Dallas City Code).

Speaker: For: Myra Fain

Against: Pat Cox

Larry Johnson Rosa Medrano Shaun Montgomery

Motion #1

Demolish residential structure 3,000 square feet or less pursuant to a court order (51A-4.501(i) of the Dallas City Code) – Approve The proposed demolition with the condition the 60-day suspension has been exhausted and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(i)(7) because the court issued a final order requiring the demolition of the structure and the suspension of the certificate of demolition is not a feasible option to alleviate the nuisance in a timely manner.

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|----------|----------|---|---|--|
| Second: | Childers | | | | |
| Results: | 6/8 | | | | MOTION FAILED |
| | | Ayes: | - | 6 | * Childers, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Williams, Montgomery, Seale |
| | | Against: | - | 8 | Amonett, Payton, Del la Harpe, Richter, *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |

| Vacancies: - 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |
|----------------|-------------------|
|----------------|-------------------|

Motion #2

Demolish residential structure 3,000 square feet or less pursuant to a court order (51A-4.501(i) of the Dallas City Code) – Deny with the finding of the fact that it is an inherent conflict between the rules that the Commission is bound by and the request that is being considered.

| Maker: | Swann | | | | |
|----------|-------------|------------|---|---|--|
| Second: | De La Harpe | | | | |
| Results: | 6/8 | | | | MOTION FAILED |
| | | Ayes: | - | 6 | De La Harpe, Payton, Richter, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann |
| | | Against: | - | 8 | Amonett, Payton, Del la Harpe, Richter, *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

Motion #3

Demolish residential structure 3,000 square feet or less pursuant to a court order (51A-4.501(i) of the Dallas City Code) – Approve – The proposed demolition meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(i)(7) because the court issued a final order requiring the demolition of the structure and the suspension of the certificate of demolition is not a feasible option to alleviate the nuisance in a timely manner.

| Maker: | Childers | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|---|---|
| Second: | Williams | | | | |
| Results: | 6/8 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 8 | Amonett, *Childers, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Seale, *Sherman, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 6 | De La Harpe, Payton, Richter, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS

Motion

Approval of October Minutes.

| Maker: | Flabiano | | | | |
|----------|------------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Strickland | | | | |
| Results: | 14/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 14 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

9. Per Request of the Landmark Commission Chair Discuss and consider a proposal to reinvigorate the Dallas Historic Preservation Program.

Motion

Approval to authorize Katherine Seale to submit this letter to the City Manager on behalf of the Landmark commission.

| Maker: | Williams | | | | |
|----------|----------|------------|---|----|--|
| Second: | Swann | | | | |
| Results: | 14/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |
| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 |

Motion

Approval of the 2017-2018 Landmark Commission Annual Report.

| Maker: | Spellicy | | | | |
|----------|-------------|----------|---|----|--|
| Second: | De La Harpe | | | | |
| Results: | 14/0 | | | | |
| | | Ayes: | - | 15 | Amonett *Childers, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Payton, Richter, Seale *Sherman, Spellicy, Strickland, Swann, Williams |
| | | Against: | - | 0 | |
| | | Absent: | - | 1 | Peach |

| | | Vacancies: | - | 2 | Dist. 3, Dist. 13 | | |
|------------------------------------|--|------------|---|---|-------------------|--|--|
| <u>ADJOURNMENT</u> | | | | | | | |
| Hearing was adjourned at 7:11 P.M. | | | | | | | |
| Katherine Seale, Chair | | | | | Date | | |