

July 5, 2022



CITY OF DALLAS

LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a Briefing/Public Hearing at 1:04 p.m. July 5, 2022 online with WebEx.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

Diane Sherman – Dist. 1 Evelyn Montgomery – Vice Chair – Dist. 2 Robert Swann – Dist. 4 Larry Offutt – Dist. 5 Rosemary Hinojosa, Dist. 6 Traswell Livingston, III – Dist. 7 Courtney Spellicy – Dist. 8 Mark Hajdu – Dist. 10	Reagan Rothenberger – Dist. 12 Mark Guest – Dist. 14 Elaine Velvin – Dist. 15 Jim Anderson – Alternate Jeff Cummings - Alternate Jay Taylor - Alternate
---	--

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **No one**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **No one**

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:
Louis Renaud
Katy Slade

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing:
Louis Renaud
Katy Slade

Landmark Commission Minutes
Tuesday, July 5, 2022

The following Positions are vacant: Districts 3 and 11		
The following Staff was present:		
Scott Bellen Rhonda Dunn Elaine Hill Murray Miller	Daniel Moore Laura Groves van Onna Carlos van Onna	
Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question-and-answer period followed each briefing.		
A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.		

Public Testimony:

No speakers

Approval of Minutes – June 6, 2022

Motion was made to approve Commissioner Sherman to serve as Chair and Commissioner Rothenberger to serve as Vice Chair.

Maker:	Cummings				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Motion was made to approve Consent items C1, C3 – C9 and C11 following Staff Recommendations.

Maker:	Rothenberger				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Motion was made to re-arrange the agenda and hear items C10, D4, D1, D3, D5, C2, D2 and D6.

Maker:	Rothenberger				
Second:	Livingston				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

CONSENT ITEMS

1. 100 S GLASGOW DR

Woodrow Wilson High School
CA212-398(LVO)
Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct batting cage be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 7/5/22 **with the following condition:** 1) The color of the roofing material will be Light Stone to be most compatible with the buildings on the Woodrow Wilson High School campus. The proposed work is consistent with Woodrow Wilson High School preservation criteria Sections 2.1 and 2.2 for site and site elements as well as 4 for new construction and additions to existing structures; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

2. 3535 GRAND AVE (Move to Discussion)

Fair Park Historic District
CA212-402(CVO)
Carlos van Onna

contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

5. 4936 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District
CA212-397(LVO)
Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install monument neighborhood markers in Munger Place Historic District be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 7/5/22. The proposed work is consistent with Munger Place preservation criteria Sections 51P-97.111(c)(1) for building, placement, form, and treatment and (2) for landscaping; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

6. 5115 REIGER AVE

Munger Place Historic District
CA212-396(LVO)
Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct one-story rear addition be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 7/5/22. The proposed work is consistent with Munger Place preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(B) for additions; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

7. 4713 WORTH ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA212-409(LVO)
Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new fencing as amended – initial work done without CA be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 7/5/22. The proposed work is consistent with Peak's Suburban Addition Preservation criteria Sections 2.9, 2.11, 2.13, 2.14, and 2.15 for site and site elements; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

8. 5305 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District
CA212-395(LVO)
Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace non-compliant fencing in kind be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 7/5/22 **with the following condition:** 1) The height of the proposed fencing will be equal in height to the brick wall that extends from the side (northeast) elevation. The proposed work is consistent with Swiss Avenue preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(2)(B)(ii), (iii), (iv)(ee), and (v) for fences; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

9. 2908 METROPOLITAN AVE

Phyllis Wheatley Elementary School,
Wheatley Place Historic District
CA212-401(CVO)

Carlos van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to temporarily place a portable structure at the location of a previously removed portable structure behind the Phillis Wheatley School be **approved** in accordance with the drawings and specifications dated 7/5/22 **with the following condition:** 1) The applicant will remove or reapply for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the portable structure after a period of three (3) years. The proposed work does not comply with the preservation criteria, however, it meets the criteria for landmark commission approval of work that does not strictly comply with the preservation criteria under City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(B), because the proposed work is temporary, facilitates restoration and continued operation of Phyllis Wheatley Elementary School, and will not permanently adversely affect the historic character of adjacent properties or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

10. 111 N CLINTON AVE (Moved to Discussion)

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA212-390(SB)

Scott Bellen

1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing windows, replace with wood siding, install new windows in different locations, and relocate existing door on accessory structure.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to paint accessory structure SW7008 "Alabaster" for siding, SW 6496 "Oceanside" for trim.
3. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace metal railing and gate and wood staircase with IPE wood railing, gate, and staircase, and install IPE wood decking on accessory structure.
4. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install limestone paver pool deck in rear yard.

Speakers:	For:	Kristen Perkins
	Against:	No Speakers

Motion

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing aluminum windows, replace with wood siding, install new wood windows in different locations, and relocate existing door on noncontributing accessory structure be **approved** per specifications dated 07/05/2022 **with the condition** that new wood windows must not be clad with fiberglass because fiberglass is inconsistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.114(a)(2) for facade materials. The proposed work as conditioned above will therefore be consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iv) for windows and doors and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures.
2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint accessory structure SW7008 "Alabaster" for siding, SW 6496 "Oceanside" for trim be **approved** per specifications dated 07/05/2022. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8) for color and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures.
3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace metal railing and gate and wood staircase with unstained IPE wood railing, gate, and staircase, and install unstained IPE wood decking on accessory structure be **approved** per specifications dated 07/05/2022. The proposed

work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3) for architectural details and (16) for stairs and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures.

4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install limestone paver pool deck in rear yard be **approved** per specifications dated 07/05/2022. Although the proposed limestone pavers do not strictly comply with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9)(A)(3) for landscaping materials, the work will not adversely affect the historic character of the district, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures.

Maker:	Offutt				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Renaud, Sherman, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Commissioner Sherman did not hear or vote on this item.

11. 402 N WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-392(SB)
Scott Bellen

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint stucco gables and wood soffits, frieze boards and windows with Behr "Etched Glass" MQ3-27, "Chimney" PPU25-22 for trim, and "Laguna Blue" PPU14-18 for accent on doors. be **approved** per specifications dated 07/05/2022 **with the condition** that brick or any masonry is not to be painted. The proposed work is consistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3) for architectural detail and Section 51P-87.111(a)(8) for color, meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures, and is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. 625 N MARSALIS AVE

Lake Cliff Historic District
CA212-394(SB)
Scott Bellen

A Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior brick with Sherwin Williams "Chelsea Gray" SW 2850.

Speakers: For: Marie Coleman

Against: No Speakers

Motion #1

That a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior brick with Sherwin Williams "Chelsea Gray" SW 2850 be **approved with conditions**. Knowing that the structure was previously painted on the testimony of Task Force members that live in Lake Cliff (known as the purple house) that repainting it with the submitted colors is acceptable. Task Force recommends providing physical proof of the house being previously painted. Not recommended to paint the concrete.

Maker:	Hinojosa				
Second:	Livingston				
Results:	6/7				MOTION FAILED
		Ayes:	-	6	Hajdu, Livingston, Offutt, Rothenberger, Spellicy, Taylor
		Against:	-	8	Montgomery, Sherman, Swann, Hinojosa, Guest, Velvin, Anderson, Cummings
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Motion #2

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior brick with Sherwin Williams "Chelsea Gray" SW 2850 be **denied without prejudice**. The proposal is inconsistent with Lake Cliff preservation criteria Section 4.1(e), inconsistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards, and inconsistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

Maker:	Anderson				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	12/2				
		Ayes:	-	12	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	2	Offutt, Spellicy
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

2. 4828 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA212-400(LVO)
Laura Groves van Onna

1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to remove awnings and metal bars – work done without CA.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace second-story balcony on facade with extended – work done without CA.

Scott Bellen

A Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate and convert a gas station to a restaurant without drive-in service.

Speakers: For: Robert Meckfessel
 Chad Dolezal

Against: No Speakers

Motion #1

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate and convert a gas station to a restaurant without drive-in service be approved per plans and specifications dated 07/05/2022 with the following conditions:

- a. That artificial turf is prohibited because artificial turf is inconsistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards and does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures;
- b. That boulders or rocks are prohibited in the parkway because the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(5) permits only grass, trees, and flowers in the parkway;
- c. That the new proposed AVAdek entry canopy in bronze is prohibited because the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.114(a)(1) stipulates that awning must be made of fabric and complement the main building in style and color;
- d. That the 4-ft high wrought iron fence in the front yard – Allow for a higher fence height than current Winnetka Heights preservation criteria;
- e. That new wood windows must not be clad with fiberglass because fiberglass is inconsistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.114(a)(2) for facade materials;
- f. That repair of existing wood windows must be an exact match in profile, dimensions, and material of the original;
- g. That removal of paint from masonry must be undertaken according to guidance specified by the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation found at <https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation/rehab/masonry01.htm>; and
- h. That the repair, patching or repointing of any brick exterior must match the existing brick and be undertaken according to guidance specified by the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation found at <https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation/rehab/masonry01.htm>.

The proposed work as conditioned above will therefore be consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria, consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards, and meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

Maker:	Hinojosa			
Second:	Livingston			
Results:	6/7			MOTION FAILED

Landmark Commission Minutes
Tuesday, July 5, 2022

		Ayes:	-	6	Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Offutt, Rothenberger, Taylor
		Against:	-	7	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Montgomery, Spellicy, Swann, Velvin
		Absent:	-	3	Renaud, Slade, Sherman
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Commissioner Sherman did not hear or vote on this item.

Motion #2

Deny with prejudice - Artificial turf;

Deny with prejudice - Boulders or rocks in the parkway;

Deny with prejudice - Berms;

Approval of bronze canopy;

Approval of 3-foot wrought iron fence;

Approval with conditions, new wood windows not clad with fiberglass;

Approval with conditions repaired windows must match in profile, dimensions and materials of the original;

Approval of removal of paint from brick must be according to the Secretary of Interior Standards;

Approval brick, if damaged, must be repaired, repointed according to Secretary of Interior Standards;

Denial without prejudice windows in the roof and front gable need to explore louvers or multi-light windows as opposed to single pane of glass;

Approval of new parking lot and closing vehicular access to the front triangle parking area;

Deny of pole sign;

Approval of signs painted on the brick;

Deny without prejudice Indian Hawthorn and wax myrtle. They are not winter hardy and grow to 5' to 6' tall;

Approval of roof;

Approval of paint;

Deny without prejudice pervious pavement and gravel; and

Denial without prejudice any items not included in this motion.

Maker:	Anderson				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	11/2				
		Ayes:	-	11	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Rothenberger, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	2	Offutt, Spellicy
		Absent:	-	3	Renaud, Slade, Sherman
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Commissioner Sherman did not hear or vote on this item.

4. 232 S WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-391(SB)
Scott Bellen

1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the unauthorized replacement of a 6' wood fence with a 7'10" wood fence.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the unauthorized replacement of a 1x3" or 1x4" wood slat front porch with a 1x6" wood slat front porch stained with Behr semi-transparent color "Sable".

Speakers:	For:	Stephanie Holin Dan Henry
	Against:	No Speakers

Motion

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the unauthorized replacement of a 6' wood fence with a 7'10" wood fence be **approved**. The proposal is consistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(b)(2) for fences and consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.
2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the unauthorized replacement of a 1x3" or 1x4" wood slat front porch with a 1x6" wood slat front porch stained with Behr semi-transparent color "Sable" be **denied without prejudice** and have applicant work with staff on a quick and satisfactory solution to help applicant locate acceptable front porch boards consistent with preservation criteria of Winnetka Heights, Secretary of Interior Standards and City Code. The proposed work is inconsistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3) for architectural detail and (11) for front entrances and porches, is inconsistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards 3 and 5 and is inconsistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

Maker:	Hinojosa				
Second:	Livingston				
Results:	13/1				
		Ayes:	-	13	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Rothenberger, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	1	Offutt
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

5. 102 S WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA212-389(MGM)
Murray G. Miller

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a two-story addition to rear of primary structure.

Speakers: For: Trey Taylor
 Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a two-story addition to rear of the primary structure be **approved with the condition** the dormer only face the interior of the lot with the remainder of the plans being in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/20/22, with the finding that the proposed work would be consistent with the Winnetka Heights Historic District preservation criteria SEC. 51P-87.111. (a)(2) regarding additions; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and Rehabilitation General Standard 9 of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

Maker:	Offutt				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	12/2				
		Ayes:	-	12	Anderson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	2	Cummings, Sherman
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

6. 419 N WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
 CA212-393(SB)
 Scott Bellen

A Certificate of Appropriateness to extend an existing eight-foot-stained wood fence into the corner side yard.

Speakers: For: No Speakers
 Against: No Speakers

Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to extend an existing 8-foot-stained wood fence into the corner side yard be **denied without prejudice**. The proposal is inconsistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(b)(2)(C) and (G)(iii) for fences and inconsistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	14/0				

Landmark Commission Minutes
Tuesday, July 5, 2022

		Ayes:	-	14	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-		
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS

REQUEST 2022/2023 LMC Calendars

The Office of Historic Preservation recommends that the Landmark Commission consider amending the LMC calendar(s) beginning in December 2022 and thereafter, to accommodate the December holiday period and the City Council summer recess.

Motion

To table this item, which means as it is just exactly like it is, it cannot come back. It could come back in a different form or fashion, but not precisely as it came forward.

Maker:	Offutt				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	12/2				
		Ayes:	-	12	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	2	Hinojosa, Rothenberger
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Motion

Approval of Minutes – June 6, 2022

Maker:	Hinojosa				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Anderson, Cummings, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Taylor, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Renaud, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing was adjourned at 4:50p.m.

Diane Sherman, Presiding Officer

Date